Current and Future Applications of 3D Printing in Congenital Cardiology and Cardiac Surgery

Abstract

Three-dimensional (3D) printing technology in congenital cardiology and cardiac surgery has experienced a rapid development over the last decade. In presence of complex cardiac and extra-cardiac anatomies, the creation of a physical, patient-specific model is attractive to most clinicians. However, at the present time, there is still a lack of strong scientific evidence of the benefit of 3D models in clinical practice and only qualitative evaluation of the models has been used to investigate their clinical use. 3D models can be printed in rigid or flexible materials, and the original size can be augmented depending on the application the models are needed for. The most common applications of 3D models at present include procedural planning of complex surgical or interventional cases, in vitro simulation for research purposes, training and communication with patients and families. The aim of this pictorial review is to describe the basic principles of this technology and present its current and future applications.

Introduction

The possibility to create physical, patient-specific models by means of three-dimension (3D) printing is appealing when dealing with complex anatomies in paediatric and adult patients with congenital heart disease (CHD). Patients with CHD are regularly monitored with imaging, yet often a single imaging modality is not sufficient to fully appreciate the complexity of cardiac anatomy, physiology and extra-cardiac spatial relationships. Moreover, these patients frequently undergo multiple surgeries with implantation of devices, increasing their complexity and resulting in unique anatomical variations. For these reasons, 3D printing has proved useful in congenital cardiology and cardiac surgery\(^\text{[1,2]}\).
Experts in non-invasive cardiovascular imaging have a great ability to understand cardiac anatomy from traditional cross-sectional images even in the presence of complex CHD. However, holding a physical 3D reconstruction of a patient’s anatomy can augment the understanding of spatial relationships and of the real dimensions of both cardiac and extra-cardiac structures. Furthermore, 3D printing is likely to be even more helpful for physicians with less expertise in analysing and interpreting cardiovascular images, for instance cardiac surgeons and interventional cardiologists.

Generally, what can be imaged in 3D can be printed in 3D, so using 3D images from computed tomography (CT), magnetic resonance imaging (MRI) or 3D echocardiography as inputs, it is possible to produce 3D printed models of the entire heart or of a specific region of interest (Figure 1). Most commonly, CT images or 3D MRI images (whole-heart MRI or contrast-enhance MR angiography) are used to produce 3D models. Through an accurate post-processing analysis, or “segmentation” process, the images are transformed into 3D surface files (.stl) and sent to the printer (Figure 2). The final result will depend greatly on the quality of the input images and on the operator performing the segmentation, who needs to be able to fully understand the cardiac anatomy. This suggests either the need to train a 3D printing operator for specific cardiac applications or the importance of close liaison between bioengineers and clinicians when creating a model.

A variety of materials can be chosen for printing. Rubber-like material (e.g. TangoPlus and Agilus30) or silicone are likely preferable for surgical practice, enabling cutting into the model, but are typically more expensive (Figure 3). The cost of the model however depends also on its size, and small 3D models are cheaper because a smaller amount of material is used for printing (Figure 4). Rigid materials (e.g. SLA resins) can be used for educational or communication purposes. Indeed, 3D models have been used for different purposes in CHD, including procedural planning, research applications, training and doctor-patient communication (Figure 5).

**Procedural planning**

Patient-specific 3D printed models can be used to plan surgical and percutaneous interventions (Figure 6 and 7). Case reports and small case series have suggested that 3D printed models facilitate the decision-making process in complex cases\(^3\). However, only qualitative analysis of the models by means of satisfaction questionnaires has so far
been used to evaluate their benefit. A recent multicentre prospective study aimed to
evaluate the impact of 3D printing models in planning 40 complex CHD surgeries,
providing surgeons with a 3D printed model after a first multidisciplinary discussion
and registering a change in surgical strategy in 19/40 cases\(^4\). As for other smaller
series, the main limitation of the study is that measurable outcomes, e.g. cross-clamp
time, bypass time, days of hospital admission or mid- and long-term follow-up
information, were not included. 3D printing has also been used successfully for
percutaneous procedures, for instance adopting 3D printed models of right ventricular
outflow tract in patients with pulmonary valve regurgitation as a tool to aid clinicians in
selecting patients eligible for percutaneous pulmonary valve implantation\(^5\). Meaningful
clinical applications include:

a. Visualization of the size of the pathological structures in presence of rare
congenital abnormalities (Figure 8)

b. Three-dimensional visualization of intra-cardiac structures (Figure 9)

c. Understanding of the spatial relationship of the great vessels in cases of complex
CHD, particularly in post surgical anatomies (Figure 10)\(^6\)

**Research applications**

Patient-specific 3D models can be incorporated in the context of experimental set-ups
for research applications (Figure 11). Models also represent useful tools to validate
computational simulations, with several studies reporting good correlations between
patient-specific model simulations *in vitro* and *in silico* when assessing cardiovascular
hydrodynamics in CHD\(^7\), also accounting for the presence of devices, such as
percutaneous valves\(^8\).

**Training**

Congenital heart disease patients are particularly challenging for trainees and fellows in
cardiac surgery, with limited opportunity to practice without endangering paediatric.
3D models printed with flexible materials have been proposed as a tool for practicing
surgical procedures (Figure 12). Models were found useful although the elasticity of the
material was reported as different from real myocardial tissue by the surgeons\(^9\).
Clinical staff can benefit from additional training with 3D models for increasing the
appreciation of CHD anatomy after cardiac surgery, e.g. during training courses for
cardiac nurses\(^10\). Furthermore, 3D models present advantages over specimens in terms
of their cost, ease of reproducibility and conservation/storage, or can be used in
conjunction with specimens providing a richer training experience when studying congenital cardiac morphology (Figure 13).

**From doctor-patient communication to public engagement**

CHD’s are chronic medical conditions that can affect the patient’s lifestyle from childhood to adult age. The doctor-patient working alliance is a crucial component of patient adherence and satisfaction (11). Communication between cardiologists, cardiac surgeon and patients (and their families) is particularly challenging given the complexity of the defects and medical terminology, the need for multiple surgeries, the dynamics of a communication triad when considering clinician-patient-parent, as well as the delicate process of transition that CHD patients go through as adolescents and young adults. A study involving parents of CHD patients showed that the use of 3D models during medical consultations was enthusiastically appreciated, despite no objective evidence of substantially improved knowledge of their child’s condition after viewing the models (12). Young people with CHD also responded positively when viewing their own 3D heart models during routine clinical consultations, reporting a better experience compared to previous visits (13) (Figure 14). The benefit of 3D models in this context may derive from subtle changes in communication dynamics and overall engagement of patients with their health status, rather than measurable changes in knowledge.

Beyond the clinic, 3D models have also been used to bring together art and medicine to foster patients and public involvement and engagement and explore novel stimulating ways of portraying the complexity of cardiovascular anatomy in the presence of CHD (Figure 15).

**Recommendations for use in clinical practice**

There are no current recommendations or guidelines for standardised use of 3D models in congenital cardiology and cardiac surgery. Current use in clinical practice includes ad hoc application for planning or practicing complex procedures. The use of 3D models is currently limited to very complex cases with unique cardiac anatomy, e.g. patients with double outlet right ventricle with non-committed VSD. The outcomes of on-going research focused on scientific evidences of 3D models’ usefulness will likely influence the development of clinical recommendations.

**Future perspectives**

The patient-specific approach that is very often necessary in the management of patients with CHD may also be applied also in challenging cases of patients with
acquired conditions. The use of the models may facilitate the development of new devices and new surgical techniques, also beyond CHD, whilst the combination of 3D models with tissue engineering could lead to bioprinting patient-specific grafts and heart valves\(^{(14,15)}\).

**Conclusion**

All imaging modalities (CT, MRI and echocardiography) have developed towards 3D reconstruction techniques, implicitly suggesting the clinical need of going beyond the traditional 2D evaluation of cardiac structures and better appreciating CHD anatomy. Despite its attractiveness, scientific evidence of the usefulness of 3D printing in CHD is still lacking, and several factors still prevent its becoming widely available or embedded in clinical centres. Firstly, initial costs related to equipment capital investments are high (although smaller, more affordable 3D printers are becoming increasingly refined). Secondly, a relatively long time is required to produce a model from start to finish, with the time of segmentation depending on image quality and printing time on the technology being used, but in certain cases taking >24 hours. And finally, the need for expertise in both cardiovascular imaging and engineering to create a model.

Up to now, 3D models have been proposed for complex cases where surgical planning is controversial, with subjective benefit of the use of the models. It may also be the case that practicing a surgery on a patient-specific model also in simple cases might also be beneficial, leading to reduced surgical time in the theatre. Further prospective studies quantifying the impact of 3D printing technology on peri-operative and long-term outcomes as well as a cost-benefit analysis are urgently needed to prove the real impact of this technology in the management of patients with CHD.
Figure legends

**Figure 1** All imaging modalities can be used input images for the creation of 3D models. a) Non-gated cardiac CT of a patient with double outlet right ventricle and apical muscular VSD; b) Balance SSFP with ECG gating and respiratory navigation can be used to acquire 3D images of the heart in cardiac MRI. c) 3D echocardiography provides excellent visualization of the atrio-ventricular valves. Panels d), e) and f) are examples of the segmentation process with a commercially available software (ScanIP, Synopsis, US) using tresholding and manual editing from multiplanar non-gated CT images of a patient with DORV. This step allows the operator to identify and separate the different cardiac and extracardiac structures: the blood pool usually present a higher signal intensity comparing to the myocardiaum and vascular walls and this automated software identifies the endocardial contours creating a colour mask that need to be carefully checked for accuracy by the operator.

**Figure 2** The 3D images resulting from the segmentation process usually present a dyshomogenous surface due to the presence of multiple trabeculations, mostly inside the right ventricle. This file is modified though a smoothing tool using a commercial available software (ScanIP, Synopsis, US) and converted to a surface mesh file called .stl. The surface can be cut exposing the region of interest for the surgeon. In our case, the right and left ventricle free walls have been removed to allow the visualization of the multiple apical VSD. Finally a 1.2 mm thickness is added to the surface to make it suitable for printing.

**Figure 3** Depending on the application of the model, different materials can be used. In this figure, the same heart of a 1 year old patient with double outlet right ventricle was printed in a) Nylon; b) VeroClear c) TangoPlus and d) TangoBlackPlus

**Figure 4** Foetal ultrasound images were used as input to create a 1:1 3D model of a foetal heart. Foetal heart models can be printed also in bigger scale to better appreciate small cardiac structures.

**Figure 5** Application of 3D models in congenital cardiology and cardiac surgery. Biomedical engineers use the physical model to create experimental set ups and test hydrodynamic conditions in patient specific settings; these setups are used also to validate computation models. Physical models are used for clinical purposes in surgical planning and decision-making of complex procedures, as well as to test new application of devices to patient specific anatomy. Medical students and trainee can benefit from the use of three-dimensional models during cardiac morphology courses as well as cardiac surgeon from practicing complex procedures. Comparing to medical images, physical models are much easier to understand for patients and parents.

**Figure 6** Patient specific model was used to test a range of devices potentially suitable for the patient case, checking geometrical anchoring and suitability to patient anatomy.

**Figure 7** 3D model from MRI images of a 16-year-old patient with congenitally corrected transposition of the great arteries, ventricular septal defect and pulmonary stenosis who underwent multiple surgeries with interposition of a conduit between the right sided left ventricle and the main pulmonary artery. The 3D model was used to plan further intervention on the conduit.

**Figure 8** 14-year-old female patient who was referred for cardiac CT after echocardiography showing prominent coronary artery flow, suggesting presence of fistula or anomalous artery connection. CT images confirmed the diagnosis of anomalous origin of the circumflex coronary artery from right pulmonary artery (a and b). 3D model was manufactured for better understanding of coronary anatomy and dimensions.

**Figure 9** Complex congenital case: double outlet right ventricle with transposition of the great arteries and non committed VSD, repaired with LV to aorta baffle presenting with symptoms of
left ventricular outflow tract (LVOT) obstruction. Model manufactured on clinical request for assessment of LVOT anatomy.

**Figure 10** Complex congenital case: 11-year-old patient truncus arteriosus presenting with conduit and pulmonary stenosis. The model was used to assess the relationship between the aorta and the pulmonary arteries in order to plan the surgery.

**Figure 11** Patient-specific model of right ventricular outflow tract is connected to a hydrodynamic circuit to simulate realistic flow and pressure conditions to be assessed with MRI acquisitions. These in vitro setups are used to simulate hydrodynamic conditions and study the complex physiology of patients with CHD, typically performing parametric studies. Mock circulatory systems incorporating patient-specific models can also be designed to be MRI compatible and thus allow for the acquisition of detailed visual information, such as 4D MRI flow sequences.

**Figure 12** In this example, a cardiac surgery fellow is practicing on the creation of an intracardiac baffle from the VSD to the aorta in a patient with DORV using a 3D model printed in TangoPlus.

**Figure 13** The use of 3D model is particularly valuable for education in congenital cardiology and cardiac surgery. Patient anatomies are often unique and it is difficult to capture the wide range of anatomical variations that occur in the context of the same cardiac malformation. In this example, four patient specific virtual 3D models of double outlet right ventricle are imaged. (From 3D library at http://www.ucl.ac.uk/cardiac-engineering/research/library-of-3d-anatomies).

**Figure 14** Example of a 3D model of an adult patient with transposition of the great arteries who underwent Mustard procedure. The model was printed with a off-white plaster powder on a Projet 660 printer, and was then used during a workshop with the patient.

**Figure 15** *Making the Invisible Visible II*, Sofie Layton, 2018 (detail). Installation including 3D printed hearts of paediatric and adult patients with congenital heart disease, and with soundscape by Jules Maxwell. As part of “The Heart of the Matter” exhibition (www.insidetheheart.org)
References


