Larkin, T. M. (2020). 'White' Undesirables: Socio-cultural Hierarchies and Racial Anxiety in Early-twentieth-century Shanghai. *Cultural and Social History*, 17(2), 207-225.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/14780038.2020.1739993>

Peer reviewed version

Link to published version (if available):
[10.1080/14780038.2020.1739993](https://doi.org/10.1080/14780038.2020.1739993)

[Link to publication record in Explore Bristol Research](#)
PDF-document

This is the author accepted manuscript (AAM). The final published version (version of record) is available online via Taylor & Francis at <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/14780038.2020.1739993> . Please refer to any applicable terms of use of the publisher.

University of Bristol - Explore Bristol Research

General rights

This document is made available in accordance with publisher policies. Please cite only the published version using the reference above. Full terms of use are available:
<http://www.bristol.ac.uk/red/research-policy/pure/user-guides/ebr-terms/>

‘White’ Undesirables: Socio-cultural hierarchies and racial anxiety in early-twentieth-century Shanghai

Social status in early-twentieth-century Shanghai hinged on varied markers. Wealth, race, and public conduct each affected social and cultural mobility in complex ways. This paper considers how these themes helped entrench social hierarchies by focusing on non-elite foreigners who occupied racially and socially ambiguous positions in Shanghai. Using the media representation of a murder as a point of access, this paper explores who these non-elites were and what they meant to the society they lived in, arguing that liminality such as theirs induced deep-seated elite anxiety over the stability of Western privilege and white prestige in colonial and semi-colonial environments.

Keywords: race; gender; class; empire; Shanghai

Introduction

Peter Sydney Hyndman was unsettled when he reached his workplace at the Hotel Metropole in Shanghai’s International Settlement, 1 September 1906. Harry Smith had invited Hyndman’s fiancé Winifred Rose to tea that day, and Hyndman, suspecting Smith’s intentions, had made her promise she would not go. Still, he had his doubts, and so left work at midday to search for her. Finding Rose neither at home nor having tea with Smith at the Hôtel Des Colonies, Hyndman decided to visit Smith’s home at 15 Haining Road, in Shanghai’s International Settlement. Smith’s Chinese servant answered the door, telling Hyndman that his master was away, but Hyndman pushed past him into the home. Hyndman lingered in the kitchen, and as the servant left, Hyndman tailed him up the stairs to the private quarters where he discovered Smith together with Rose in a state of undress. Hyndman charged Smith and the two men toppled. During their struggle Hyndman pulled a revolver from his pocket and shot Smith through the head. Approaching his fiancé, Hyndman realizing he had inadvertently shot and wounded her as well, ran to get help

and turn himself in. Rose was treated immediately and so survived the ordeal, and Hyndman was taken into custody.

The Shanghai Mercury Ltd. later printed a stylised account of the legal proceedings that ensued in a special pamphlet entitled *The Haining Road Tragedy*. The lengthy narrative was sensationalist in tone, spinning the episode into a striking tale of love, infidelity, and murder. Judith Walkowitz describes how such pamphlets used “moral panics” and “stereotyped main characters” to capitalize on the public’s fascination with violent and macabre themes, or simply lower-class subjects.¹ Keeping with this practice, the publication cast Hyndman, Rose, and Smith through familiar tropes: the violent, jilted lover; the naïve and flighty young woman; and the predatory gentleman. Their story was then retold with as much emphasis on the “titillating” details as possible. As Paul French claims of press content in the treaty-ports, “‘if it bleeds it leads’ was a well, if not better, understood slogan in 1900 than it is even today.”² The scandal even found its way into the “Law Reports” of the more respectable *North China Herald*, which published a detailed, if less lurid account of the episode.³ Although the narrative was embellished for effect, when read with an understanding of the context in which the piece was published, the episode provides a rare opportunity to infiltrate the social and cultural world of Shanghai’s British non-elite.⁴ The details included in the publication, the language used by the legal practitioners and witnesses, and the leniency of Hyndman’s sentence all reflect aspects of the lives of Shanghai’s lower-class foreigners and how the treaty-port’s elite foreign society perceived them. A case such as *The Haining Road Tragedy* thus renders visible the usually opaque world of non-elite individuals such as Hyndman and Rose.

In the half-century following the First Opium War (1839-1842) thousands of foreigners like Hyndman, Smith, and Rose travelled to Shanghai seeking wealth and

opportunity. Although these foreigners lived near the Chinese and on Chinese land, they formed a mostly closed community. The Shanghai Municipal Council (SMC) exercised unofficial authority over Shanghai's International Settlement with "little direct input from' the metropole.'⁵ Shanghai's ratepayers, "qualified to vote by virtue of the ownership of property" or by paying sufficiently high rent, elected members to the SMC, which accordingly served the political and business interests of the port's (mostly British) merchant and administrative elite.⁶ The port's settled British community, known as "Shanghailanders," and the majority of the expatriate British workers filled out the middle and working classes, protected by, but with little say in the SMC. When measuring where Hyndman and Rose fit in, the term 'non-elite,' while general, is perhaps the most apposite. These individuals occupied a low social position within the broader category of Shanghaileander, but they were not exactly marginal, and certainly not part of the Western underclass (also represented in the port). They were likewise different from other groups from across the empire such as Baghdadi Jews, Eurasians, and Indians, who "were excluded in varying degrees" from British society.⁷ The term, in this case, denotes this inexact identity at the fringe of respectable foreign society; not quite comfortable, nor utterly destitute. Although some sojourners to China achieved the 'Shanghai dream' they felt their privileged status as imperial subjects guaranteed most were simply pulled by the tides of empire to this distant port on the coast of China. The lives they built were those of subsistence, survival, or muted success.

Critics in the metropole and the port alike had long felt Shanghai represented all the vice and excess of Western civilization. The port's British elite attributed Shanghai's reputation to non-elite whites, who they felt marred the Western façade of superiority. This derided community was bolstered by beachcombers and camp followers left over from the Western military intervention in the Boxer Rebellion (1900-1901) and the U.S.

takeover of the Philippines (1902). That the presence of non-elite or racially suspect ‘whites’ in colonial spaces formed the root of a wider imperial problem is apparent from Will Jackson’s research on Kenya and Cape Town and Harald Fischer-Tiné’s on British India.⁸ But the literature on Shanghai suggests that due to nature of the foreign community and their tenuous position relative to the Chinese, identities and status acquired heightened significance.⁹ The problems attending the influx of soldiers, sailors, and indigent undesirables tested the limits of Shanghai’s administrators, and undermined the status quo between Westerners and Chinese in the treaty-ports. As Chinese agitation over their relationship with the West grew, apparent through the 1905 anti-American and anti-British movements, it became imperative for the colonial elite to “jettison some of its most expendable countrymen” in a “preemptive move to preserve privilege.”¹⁰ Understanding why such anxieties were prominent in the minds of the British elite forms, in part, the basis of this article.

With colonial privilege at stake condemnations of non-elite British subjects such as Hyndman and Rose became sharper.¹¹ Throughout the trial the conduct of both Hyndman and Rose was called into question, and these criticisms were reproduced in the pages of *The Haining Road Tragedy* to make broader statements about morality and respectability in treaty-port society. Robert Bickers and Catherine Ladds have both produced excellent accounts of the International Settlement’s social composition, drawing attention to the experiences of British working-class and Eurasian inhabitants of the port.¹² Ladds work, in particular, problematizes the relationship between “Britishness” and “whiteness” to emphasize the instability of national identities in cosmopolitan treaty-port society.¹³ Building upon their work, this paper places the critiques published in *The Haining Road Tragedy* within a broader study of the episode’s key actors to understand what it was about their lives that the International Settlement’s

British elite found so problematic. In the contexts of treaty-port and imperial culture, the British non-elite represented a deviation from respectable norms and behaviors. Through such deviation they invited the derision of their elite countrymen and women. They had limited opportunities to engage with treaty port-culture as members of a lower social group, and so occupied a space between respectable Europeans and Americans, and the various groups deemed “other.” The markers of their liminality were varied, ranging from limited social and economic capital, to ambiguous racial and ethnic identities, and transgressions of respectable norms. The root of these issues, though, was that their presence threatened the tenuous socio-cultural hierarchies that the Western elite had espoused and built their privilege upon in China.

Using *The Haining Road Tragedy* as a point of access, this paper explores why the presence of non-elite and indigent foreigners was so threatening to Shanghai’s Western elite. I first explore the urban geography of Shanghai, and how neighbourhoods such as Hongkou, where Hyndman and Rose lived, eroded divisions between Western, Chinese, and other foreign residents. I then use the examples of Hyndman, Rose, and Rose’s family to demonstrate how race and ethnicity affected social mobility. Finally, focusing on the published critiques of Rose, I argue that her gender became a conduit through which more serious social and cultural anxieties were registered. Although I build upon a well-developed literature to discuss race, gender, and imperial culture, this paper’s underlying purpose is to access the lives of a group of people most conspicuous in the archive through a sensationalist newspaper publication, and to measure their experiences against the contemporary depictions of them. As Ann Stoler notes, in the “brutal immediacy of a murder” or other such excitement, truth is “sometimes inverted.”¹⁴ There are parts of the narrative that will never be found, and research on such subjects often works, as Anjali Arondekar puts it, “against the guarantee of recovery.”¹⁵ Yet, By cross-

referencing the few archival records on Hyndman and Rose with those verifiable details in the publication, a sense of their lives emerges providing a broader understanding of how individuals of uncertain status navigated imperial spaces. Using a sensational case such as *The Haining Road Tragedy* within a wider context, this paper not only reveals who Hyndman and Rose were, but what they and those like them meant to the society and the imperial world in which they lived.

The house at 16 Dent Road: profiling Hongkou

Winifred Dorothy Rose was the daughter of Patrick Vincent Murphy, an Irishman who emigrated from England. Murphy and his wife had lived in Shanghai over eighteen years, where he worked as a municipal tax collector. The couple had two other daughters besides Rose, and two sons; the youngest three children being born in China. Both parents passed away in 1901, and shortly after their deaths Rose, the second oldest of the daughters, married a Shanghai Municipal Police officer.¹⁶ The new couple's married life was uncertain. Rose's husband struggled to maintain employment and moved his new family to India after losing his position with the Shanghai Municipal Police. In 1902 the Roses returned to Shanghai, where they remained until the husband's premature death on 28 March 1906. Peter Sydney Hyndman, a young Macanese man, had made the acquaintance of the Murphy family five years before the events in *The Haining Road Tragedy* transpired. Following Rose's husband's death, Hyndman wasted no time asking her hand in marriage, and she consented. Although she left the next day for Wuhu to meet her brother John (hereafter Murphy) who was employed there with the Chinese Customs Service, she promised to remain faithful to Hyndman.¹⁷ The needs of the family necessitated Rose's and Murphy's return two weeks later. Hyndman helped Murphy find accommodation in the Settlement, but high rents forced the family to settle in the house

at 16 Dent Road.¹⁸ Rose suggested Hyndman sublet the house's spare room to ease the burden of rent, as Murphy "was not earning a very big salary."¹⁹

The family's new neighbourhood was a far cry from the proud imperial facades and tree-lined avenues of the Settlement's British and French districts. Dent Road was located in the north eastern district of the International Settlement known as Hongkou. Formerly the American concession, the district had long been associated with those habits supposedly responsible for Shanghai's moral bankruptcy. Prostitution, alcohol, and opium could all be readily found in the surrounding neighbourhood. The Murphys lived amid undeveloped and industrial lots, behind scattered shipping wharves and warehouses fronting the river.²⁰ From his new home to his workplace at the hotel on Bubbling Well Road Hyndman had to traverse the entire length of the Settlement. He would first set out west on Broadway, crossing Hongkou Creek and skirting the southern edge of the informal Japanese settlement "Little Tokyo," isolated demographically and culturally, if not geographically, from the rest of Shanghai.²¹ Turning south, Hyndman would then cross the Garden Bridge over "Soochow Creek" towards the Settlement's centre.

"Little Tokyo" and the streets directly north of the Garden Bridge contained migrant groups which the SMC considered undesirable or intrinsically amoral.²² Baghdadi Jews arriving via British India mixed with impoverished Russian Jews stranded in the east following the Russo-Japanese War (1904-1905), and Japanese migrants from ports such as Yokohama.²³ The Russian community in Hongkou would be bolstered in the 1920s by the arrival of White Russian refugees fleeing the Bolsheviks.²⁴ The district contrasted the Settlement's core through its cross-section of migrant communities, and the conspicuous presence of Chinese who spilled from the surrounding suburbs into the Settlement to find ready employment in the Western-owned shipyards fronting the river.²⁵ Poor Westerners, transient sailors, and soldiers completed the profile. The latter groups,

generally worrisome for the SMC, were especially problematic during the peak trading months and in times of Sino-Western conflict. As the Boxer crisis and Philippine-American wars ended, idle military men waiting to return home became a serious issue for the foreign consuls of the city, exhibiting drunk and disorderly conduct and instigating violent crimes.²⁶

Businesses deemed disreputable, operated and frequented by this mixed lower-class community, contributed to the British elite's poor opinion of Hongkou. Taverns erected near Garden Bridge and along the district's main thoroughfares catered to transient and settled customers alike, while the region to the north was given over to opium shops. In the early twentieth century, Swatow (Chaozhou) merchants, in business with Baghdadi Jews such as David Sassoon, E. D. Sassoon, S. J. David, and Edward Ezra, sold opium widely in the settlement.²⁷ A petition by Wong Tseng-Chi to the SMC, complained that some twenty such establishments had opened around his home.²⁸ Ping Jinya 平襟亞 has argued that the drug business's rapid spread around Shanghai stemmed, at least indirectly, through the protection afforded by the International Settlement and corrupt officials.²⁹ In cases such as Wong's, the SMC declined to act, stating that "no law in any country" prevented "person's voluntarily taking harmful drugs," but from 1906 on the British and the Qing took steps to gradually prohibit opium's sale.³⁰

While the SMC response to opium was lethargic, concern about Hongkou's transient foreign population establishing a reputation of drunkenness prompted the council to regulate the sale of alcohol. A strict licence system enabled the council to curtail what they considered the spread of disreputable drinking establishments. Some applicants, usually British, met with favourable responses, but as early as 1877 the general policy had been to clamp down on the spread of such undesirable enterprises in Hongkou.³¹ The policy appears to have remained consistent into the early-twentieth

century, and the council tended to judge non-British licence applicants on harsher grounds. Inspector J. Bourke's 1911 report listed five Russian-Jewish business that he claimed tarnished Hongkou.³² Col. Bruce responded that while he had nothing personally against the applicants, taverns such as Mr. Gruzman's "The Land We Live In Hotel" were the cause of "free fights between large bodies of sailors."³³ The council did approve Gruzman's application, but were confident the license would not be renewed. They saw the tavern as simply one of many "undesirable" "undertakings of its kind in [Hongkou]."³⁴ Bourke's report typified the exchange between the council and prospective applicants. Foreigners considered unsuitable by elite society arrived at the port and established businesses catering to the non-elite community, whereby they elicited critiques that their enterprises contributed to the spread of amoral habits. These critiques became part of a repertoire of themes used to express anxiety about non-elite British conduct in Shanghai.

Prostitution, too, was associated with Hongkou, especially with regard to its Japanese inhabitants. The Liusan Pavilion (Liusan Ting 六三亭), for instance, was a landmark in "Little Tokyo" where prostitution was believed to take place on a large scale. Japanese courtesans painted in "thick colours" and wearing kimonos served alcohol, danced, and sang to Western and Chinese patrons and spectators alike. But the Japanese were not alone, and Hongkou's Russian community likely added to the neighbourhood's unsavoury reputation. Lu Hanchao notes that among the poor Russians who arrived in Shanghai were a "sizeable number of prostitutes and beggars."³⁵ Although the most infamous of the Russian brothels, known colloquially as 'foreign salt-beef shops' (waiguo xianrou zhuang 外國咸肉庄) or 'ham shops' (huotui dian 火腿點), were located south of Hongkou on the French concession's border, the notoriety of white prostitutes undoubtedly tainted public opinions of the general population.³⁶ In the metropole such public sexuality had become a site for other social struggles and divisions, particularly

“class, gender, and race.”³⁷ In Shanghai, these divisions were even starker. Beyond the metropole race was “critically tied to sex,” and so prostitution, especially when practiced by the foreign populations, was considered particularly reprehensible.³⁸

The presence of these prostitutes was especially problematic in the political climate of early-twentieth century Shanghai. Paul Cohen’s research on Chinese antiforeign rumours during the Boxer Rebellion suggests that “the weird social and sexual practices of foreigners” such as “improper mixing,” “incest,” and “serial copulation with young girls” informed popular Chinese opinions of Westerners.³⁹ From 1890 the Qing authorities, likewise critical of “vice among foreigners,” increasingly challenged foreign privilege.⁴⁰ Such congruity between the Boxers and the Qing court formed the roots of a “modern [Chinese] nationalism” and anti-foreignism that would remain prominent in the memories of Shanghai’s British population well into the twentieth century.⁴¹ While unclear the extent to which vice-based antiforeignism worried the British, Kerrie MacPherson’s research on Shanghai’s lock hospital confirms that issues of vice and sexual disease were a hotly-debated embarrassment of the Shanghai International Settlement’s administrators.⁴² To British and Chinese alike, foreign, and in particular white prostitution represented a dire threat to the moral authority of the settlement’s elite.

Through its implicit connections to drinking, crime, and prostitution, poverty began to take on “clearly pejorative connotations” amongst Shanghai’s foreign society.⁴³ Janet Chen discusses how Chinese poverty cemented divisions between Western and Chinese populations, but the same wealth-based prejudices were applied to all in the port.⁴⁴ Lu states that long-standing residents could fastidiously point out the differences between “a person from the so-called ‘higher corner’” and those of lower standing.⁴⁵ And while the shantytowns filled with indigent Chinese bordering the Settlement were themselves an “outrage,” the Settlement’s own poor Westerners threatened to undermine

the very “prestige” of the white race.⁴⁶ Living within Hongkou among impoverished foreign and Chinese families, opium shops, lower-class taverns, and prostitution, Hyndman and the Murphy family were enmeshed in this derided community. Their lesser means and status within society were conspicuous through their residence in what was becoming an increasingly disreputable locale.

Crossing south over Suzhou Creek from Hongkou, Hyndman would arrive on the Bund, the prestigious financial and administrative centre of the International Settlement. Running parallel to the Huangpu River, the bund was an imposing promenade that unabashedly displayed the wealth and power of Shanghai’s European and American elite.⁴⁷ Leaving the Bund behind, Hyndman would follow Nanking Road west until it became Bubbling Well Road. He would arrive at his workplace, the city’s first “skyscraper,” rising opposite the race course and cricket grounds and set among regal colonial-style homes.⁴⁸ This journey took Hyndman daily from the Settlement’s margins through diverse foreign enclaves and into the heart of elite Shanghai, reaffirming the marked disparities between elite and non-elite society and culture.

At night, Hyndman returned along streets dimly lit by “native oil lamps scattered here and there” to his home just south of Li Hongkou.⁴⁹ Through police reports and investigations, Li Hongkou, bordering Hongkou proper, acquired a reputation as a haven for disreputable figures. The neighbourhood’s position at the “very border of the Settlement” encouraged numerous “thefts, assaults, and burglaries.” The same month Hyndman shot Smith, ten accounts of larceny, one wounding, two assaults, gambling, a burglary, and a separate murder all occurred within Li Hongkou’s vicinity. The police described the inhabitants settled between Broadway and Yangshupu Road, just east of Dent Road, as the sort of “foreign undesirables” who moved “from port to port” engaging in various small businesses. To the upper-class, Western “transients” such as those who

settled in Hongkou and its northern neighbour represented “unpleasant specimens of white civilization.”⁵⁰ The police had no doubt that the chief source of the inhabitants’ livelihoods was crime. In reality the district represented a true cross-section of treaty-port life. Migrants from varied ethnic and cultural backgrounds intermingled and built their lives in this northern enclave of the foreign concessions. Necessity brought many of this district’s inhabitants to Shanghai, where they were simply trying to get by within the liminal spaces of empire.

Performing the dominant culture: racial ambiguities and social status

As the trial’s most notorious figure, details about Hyndman’s life in Hongkou and his personal history became matters of legal concern in determining the court’s final verdict. The judge ultimately decided, though, that Rose’s infidelity had caused Hyndman sufficient stress to provoke manslaughter, and so issued a mitigated sentence. Hyndman was imprisoned for eighteen months with hard labour but permitted to remain in Shanghai following his release.⁵¹ But what do the concerns raised in the trial about his history, and supplementary details about his life in China further indicate about non-elite British experiences in China? What affected Hyndman’s status in society, and to what extent was he representative of broader social patterns?

While the trial proceedings offer a limited outline of Hyndman, his scattered archival presence reveals additional details which help explain the periodical’s presentation of him. Peter Hyndman, born Pedro Hyndman in Hong Kong, c.1876, was the child of Macanese parents Henrique Hyndman and Élia Pulquéria Calado.⁵² Having moved to Shanghai sometime before 1900, Hyndman took a job at the New Grand Hotel, before becoming bookkeeper at the Hotel Metropole in 1906 where he drew \$150 a month.⁵³ His general manager, Chas A. Biddle, praised Hyndman’s work as “always correct” although demurred when asked to describe his character. Despite a modest

income, Hyndman found ways to participate in the ‘hearty communal life’ of the self-christened British “Shanghaianders.”⁵⁴ He enlisted in the Shanghai Volunteer Corps (SVC) during the Boxer Uprising, for which he was awarded a medal in 1903. Being Macanese, he likely served in B company, alongside Italian, Jewish, Filipino, Russian, and Chinese units.⁵⁵ He also participated in group sports, playing cricket and competing in the high jump.⁵⁶ Although Hyndman competed on white teams, these group sports were not open to all. Parsi and Baghdadi Jewish communities, for example, may have adopted British dress, names, and speech, but in games such as cricket were still forced to form their own separate teams.⁵⁷ Performing the dominant culture did not always secure one’s place within it, and markers such as race and ethnicity proved difficult to overcome.

Radhika Mohanram has asked if the constructed meaning of “whiteness” remains constant when “dislocated from its own autochthonous space when encountering racially different indigenous groups,” and questions its “shape-shifting nature” in relation to “race and class.”⁵⁸ She also asks how “the whiteness that was incorporated into Britishness in the nineteenth century connected to and [was] constructed by the presence of empire.” The instability of “whiteness” that Mohanram flags through these questions continued into the twentieth century and was especially visible in cities with a high degree of interracial and interethnic contact, such as Shanghai. Like Hyndman, many in the port straddled the dividing line between “white” society and a more diverse community comprised of “others.” These divisions were muddy, however, as while “whiteness” could often be visibly determined, ethnicity was much easier to mask. Hyndman anglicized his name and participated in the Settlement’s Western public life, but “racism and a sense of cultural superiority” were always present in Shanghai’s International Settlement.⁵⁹ As Ladds suggests, in such a space where “multiple nationalities jostled for position,” society became highly conscious of one’s “national or regional affiliation.”⁶⁰

In organisations such as the SVC, Hyndman participated as an “othered” community member, and despite efforts to pass as part of “respectable” society and participate in Western culture his Macanese heritage, modest income, and life in the ethnically diverse neighbourhood of Hongkou all marked his marginal status.

As with other foreigners, an evolving concept of racial divisions and what it meant to be white affected Hyndman’s and the Murphys’ social status. To pass as white was to gain access to respectable society, but imperial anxieties and transnational discourse on who could and could not claim such status was becoming increasingly particular. Being Macanese, Hyndman represented a community that had occupied a middling position since the days of the Old China Trade at Canton where Macanese men had been employed predominantly as clerks in the major British and American shipping firms. Yet while racial classification meant Westerners had always regarded the lower-class Chinese as subservient, Catherine Chan has demonstrated that the Macanese could not effectively be identified as Eurasian, native, or European.⁶¹ Descriptions of them reflected this ambiguity, ranging from indifferent comments that they formed a closed community to acerbic statements that they were “fit for nothing, either as masters or servants.”⁶² This ambiguity characterized Hyndman’s experiences of Shanghai’s foreign society. He could occasionally pass for white and participate in the dominant culture of the International Settlement, but there remained ever-present signs that he was “other.”

The Murphys, born to an Irish father and an unidentified mother, were likewise difficult to categorize, and their acceptance into the white community hinged on both wider race relations and Sino-foreign tensions in China.⁶³ While anti-Irish prejudices prevalent in spaces such as North America likened the Irish to Black and Chinese communities, current literature shows that Irish nationalists in the metropole rejected comparisons to “Britain’s non-European subjects.”⁶⁴ Even in Britain, with its long history

of racialised and stereotyped “anti-Irish discourse,” it was difficult, if not impossible, for the British to relegate the Irish completely to the realm of the ‘other.’⁶⁵ Still, within imperial spaces one’s sense of “Irishness” in contradistinction to the English “was heightened.”⁶⁶ The Irish were thus problematic in the heterogenous spaces of empire, and the debate over their racial status underscored British elites anxieties over the supposed purity and prestige of the white race.⁶⁷

The matter of the Murphys’ background was further complicated following Patrick Murphy’s death. He had neither made provision, nor appointed a guardian for his children. The SMC, honouring Patrick’s service, took responsibility over seeking care for the now orphaned British children. Their solution reflected their uncertainty over how to classify and manage the impoverished children. Considering the elder siblings unfit or too young to care for the younger ones, they placed the youngest child, Katie, in the care of a French subject who enrolled her in a French Catholic convent for her education. Katie was placed, though, on the “poor side” of the convent, where she “had to mix with Chinese and Eurasians.” The family objected and Rose’s husband at the time offered to pay for Katie to be kept on the European side, but the school’s authorities resisted the pleas.⁶⁸

In treaty-port society especially, regular contact with or proximity to the Chinese was to be avoided if possible. Only certain forms of contact, taking place within the correct hierarchical forms and in white spaces were deemed acceptable. Westerners ritually tolerated contact with the Chinese community’s elites, for whom wealth conferred a modicum of status and served as a lubricant for social intercourse.⁶⁹ Interacting with the lower class, however, was to be avoided at all costs, and various efforts were made to eject impoverished Chinese from the city centre.⁷⁰ Shanghai’s elite whites required Chinese employees and servants for day-to-day operations and to maintain their general

quality of life, but the Chinese in these positions received low wages and had little mobility.⁷¹ On the Settlement's fringe, though, contact inevitably occurred and the resulting familiarity with quotidian Chinese life was believed to negatively affect the Western community. For example, raised Macanese in Hong Kong, Hyndman could speak Cantonese. Such knowledge betrayed his social and cultural proximity to the Chinese community. Proximity such as Hyndman's was especially concerning to Western elites, who fretted over the amoral influence the Chinese and Chinese culture might have on their peers and children.⁷² Elite society's anxieties about the stability of white prestige were therefore reified through members of the poor British community who threatened constructed boundaries through their ability to straddle the divisions between white and "othered" communities.⁷³ Elites and administrators felt that through their conspicuous poverty and their proximity to Chinese communities, individuals such as Hyndman and Rose posed the risk of visually undermining the crafted 'exceptionalism' of the white race and Western civilization.

The Shanghai Mercury Ltd. could thus seize upon Hyndman and Rose, as key actors in a scandal of adultery and murder, to capitalise on social stigma towards non-elite communities. Through the publication, their case was presented to a readership of "consular officials and compatriots anxious to preserve their mantle of racial superiority," and the matter of how to handle their case was therefore reconfigured as a social problem.⁷⁴ Following crimes such as Hyndman's, public or municipal funds were sometimes levied to repatriate dangerous or impoverished individuals, and there was a general opinion that such persons "spent a great part of their existence being deported."⁷⁵ But in Hyndman's case his Macanese background complicated matters. As a Hong Kong-born British subject, there was nowhere particularly to deport Hyndman to. The judge decided, rather, to make a moral example of the episode. The onus of the crime was

shifted to Rose, whose infidelity became the focus of the case and subsequent publication. Hyndman's commuted sentence was rather intended to discourage the carrying of firearms in the Settlement, than to make a statement about manslaughter.⁷⁶

The Judge's verdict is remarkable considering the frequency with which Hyndman continued to appear in front of the court. Less than two years after Hyndman shot Smith, the police brought him in on battery charges, it being the third occasion on record that he had assaulted Rose (by now his wife). According to a witness, Hyndman was drunk at the time, and threatened Rose not to press charges, stating "he had shot one man and was not afraid of anyone."⁷⁷ Rose brought the complaint to the British Consulate, who gave Hyndman the option of a fine or four days' imprisonment, and a six-month probation. The court threatened that should the behaviour persist, "an order for deportation" would be issued. Police arrested Hyndman the following year for causing another disturbance while drunk, and the court again reminded him of past behaviour. He was not, despite their previous warning, deported. Nothing further came of these disturbances and Hyndman lived the rest of his days married to Rose in Shanghai, dying in 1936 at the age of sixty.⁷⁸

Winifred Dorothy Rose: poverty, morality, and Western women in Shanghai

While *The Haining Road Tragedy* hinted at the relative poverty of the Murphys and discussed Hyndman's questionable background, the most significant thread running through the episode was the judge's attack on Rose's moral character. This critique was the direct product of imperial notions about the role and expected conduct of women in colonial and semi-colonial spaces. Levine and Tim Allender have demonstrated that throughout the British empire, women were relegated to the domestic sphere.⁷⁹ Their organization of the domestic sphere was required to be, as Susmita Roye and Rajeshwar Mittapalli have termed it "a microcosm of empire building."⁸⁰ In spaces such as Shanghai,

women were therefore given the abstract task of upholding the imperial image by cultivating a respectable home and behaving within prescribed norms of respectability. Current research shows that by 1905, the number of British women in Shanghai had increased to 1,102; 875 more than in 1880 and representing a more balanced portion of the British community.⁸¹ Late-nineteenth century advances in transportation brought metropolitan women into increasing contact with a colonial world where ideas about “whiteness” were “critically tied to sex.”⁸² As their numbers grew in Shanghai, their conduct and success at homemaking and cultivating the domestic sphere became analogous to the respectability and civilisation of the empire.

Environments like Shanghai were complicated, though, in that a highly social culture that encouraged visiting, hosting, and being seen punctuated the space between public and domestic spheres. In such a society, the question of women’s morality and conduct spilled into everyday life. Western women were thus expected to uphold all the most civil aspects of their culture in public, as well as in private. But in colonial and semi-colonial environments the imperial elite considered public space to be sexually dangerous. Colonial men viewed natives in these spaces as sexual predators with unbounded physical desires.⁸³ Their fears of native sexual attacks on white women became “part of the justification of colonial rule.”⁸⁴ The strict dichotomy between the sexually aggressive native and innocent Western woman left little room for transgressive behaviour, and white sex-workers, or even morally suspect women invited critiques based on “topics of moral and racial prestige.”⁸⁵ Women thus became part of a racially charged discourse where their conduct and agency within society was contrasted with and contested by local “othered populations.”⁸⁶ Commentaries such as those reproduced in *The Haining Road Tragedy* seized upon the “improper” activities of white prostitutes and destitute or widowed women as threats to the cultivated image of Western respectability.

The targeted moral critiques levied against Rose in *The Haining Road Tragedy* reflected elite society's concerns of women's sexual transgressions. Rose's account of the episode was buried in a series of moral statements directed at a wider public. Described by a contemporary as the most influential paper "in the field of domestic politics in Shanghai," "with a wide circulation and considerable influence," articles published in *The Shanghai Mercury* could be guaranteed to reach a large audience.⁸⁷ The judge's commentary on Rose's behaviour therefore took the form of general moral instruction when reproduced in the paper, and adopted a rhetoric Walkowitz has found standard in media scandals and "anti-vice campaigns" in the press.⁸⁸ Although herself a victim of Hyndman's violent actions, Rose's liaison with Smith was condemned as "immoral." Upon reviewing her behaviour, the court decided she was "not a woman of character," rather "foolish," "flattered by the attention of an old man," "flighty," and a woman "of whom one could not speak of with very great respect."⁸⁹ Hyndman himself declared he would have rather seen her "shot dead than be made a whore."⁹⁰ Hyndman may have committed the crime, but a substantial portion of the narrative in *The Shanghai Mercury* was given over to questioning Rose's character and alleged promiscuity.

Although little discussion was given over to Rose's social circumstances, or her agency as an unmarried woman in the port, the court's critiques were likely founded upon Rose's tenuous social status. Prior to the murder her situation had been exactly one of those which caused problems for the SMC. Without the support of her brother, and later Hyndman, and with no inheritance to fall back on, the widowed Rose would possibly have ended up in a public institution such as the "Women's Home." This charity, established for the refuge of "destitute, distressed, and fallen women of all classes and nationalities," suffered chronic underfunding, lacking support from the SMC.⁹¹ The home accepted a wide range of cases, aiding Americans, English, Canadians, Australians,

Dutch, Russian, Portuguese, Eurasian, and Chinese women. While it worked to provide the means for these women to re-establish themselves in the Settlement, the desired goal when possible was repatriation. The home described the women it aided as victims of alcoholism, “utter destitution,” and “distressed circumstances.” Homes such as these were an ineffective stopgap that aimed to remove distressed women from the port, rather than address their problems directly.⁹² The reluctance of the authorities to provide funding and the practice of repatriation underscored a Settlement policy that desired such unfortunate cases be hidden from the public eye.

The SMC was not entirely unsympathetic to the plight of distressed women. In some cases, the Council made efforts to sustain or at least assist those who had fallen on hard times. Mrs. S. Reynall, for instance was a widow who ran a boarding house in the Settlement. On remarrying, her husband requested she conclude her business and become his dependent, as was considered socially proper. He disappeared, however, in February 1900, leaving Reynall destitute, with \$1,000.00 in debt, and now lacking means to support herself and her child. Reviewing the case, the Council agreed to provide aid, but Reynall’s case stands out as irregular in a system that skirted the issue of female poverty.⁹³ The conventions of treaty-port society, which encouraged wives to adopt a domestic role and frowned upon widowed women, converged to deprive Reynall of self-sufficiency, and she only procured aid upon the submission of an emotional petition.

Like Reynall and those at the Women’s Home, Rose represented a demographic whose presence in Shanghai undermined the desired image of civility that the Settlement’s elite British women were required to project. But, as with these other women, poverty and family circumstances alone fail to explain the court’s reaction to Rose’s conduct. Indeed, the primary cause of administrative anxieties over the conduct of women stemmed from a much more threatening phenomenon: public sexuality, visible

in the spread of prostitution, particularly white prostitutes, within the International Settlement.⁹⁴ Like “European vagrants and paupers,” white prostitutes were viewed as a “threat to the legitimizing myths of Western superiority.”⁹⁵ European prostitution in colonial/semi-colonial spaces was a “fault line” that raised questions about the European “credential for rule.”⁹⁶ The SMC accordingly kept tabs on the number of the Settlement’s foreign prostitutes. Censuses were bound to be inaccurate, as women engaged in the trade could shift consular registration and operate unlicensed businesses in private homes and behind legitimate enterprises. Still, Council efforts to document these women demonstrated a very real concern about their activities and the class of clientele they attracted.⁹⁷ In discussing how to handle prostitution, the council entertained proposals for license fees, limiting the practice to specific streets, and setting quotas on the number of prostitutes permitted in the port. The central district was, of course, strictly off limits.⁹⁸

The police kept a watchful eye on those brothels that did crop up, and these could operate with a relative degree of freedom provided they upheld a certain standard of conduct. The increase in “lower class” sex-workers, though, effected a simultaneous rise in what contemporaries considered “justifiable public criticism.” Russian migrants from Port Arthur (Vladivostok), by-products of European and Russian military campaigns in the early 1900s, were considered the most debased of these women. The public conduct of white prostitutes offended the more established inhabitants of the Settlement. They were said to have used offensive language, solicited passers-by, carried on “till the morning hours” and exhibited “disgusting” behaviour in the street.⁹⁹ But like other non-elite foreigners operating in liminal spaces in the port, prostitutes were able to shield themselves in a murky system of consular authority. When the matron Malicia Koffler came to the Council’s attention, they referred her case to the Austrian Consulate. The Consulate in turn claimed that the complaints were against her employees in general, and

as not all of them were Austro-Hungarian, the Austrian Consulate likewise deferred action. It did, however, in true Settlement fashion, commit to repatriating all those of Austro-Hungarian status, should the SMP populate a list.¹⁰⁰

As Eileen Scully has demonstrated, the public visibility of white prostitutes in the International Settlement spurred critiques of what constituted acceptable behaviour for Western women. Although relating to prostitutes, Scully's findings are applicable to the wider population of women in Shanghai. The case study of Rose reveals that the varied racial and moral anxieties that developed over Western women's bodies in the nineteenth century were adapted into general critiques of women's conduct, regardless of class or creed. Rose was not a sex worker, and while widowed she was not entirely destitute, nor without the prospects of a "respectable" family life. Still her reputed conduct was such that it invited a moral lecture on how a woman of her station should or should not behave. As the position of Westerners in China became more tenuous, what began as a critique of a single profession was repurposed into commentaries on the expected behaviours of women in general. Rose, like other women in the settlement, therefore simultaneously represented both the potential civilisation and potential degradation of the entire Western community.

Conclusion

The very presence of non-elite British such as Hyndman and Rose, whose alleged misconduct was made conspicuous through a sensationalist publication, threatened the tenuous socio-cultural hierarchies that Shanghai's Western elite had espoused and built their privilege upon. *The Haining Road Tragedy* employed a range of moral critiques and personal details to capitalize on broader social anxieties about the activities of the port's British non-elite. The episode, when understood within the broader socio-cultural context of turn-of-the-twentieth-century Shanghai, renders visible the fault lines that were

beginning to appear in the port. As Chinese anger over a century of humiliation at the hands of foreigners mounted, and as the non-elite British community became increasingly difficult to manage, British elite anxiety about the integrity of their supposed prestige and privilege grew. *The Haining Road Tragedy* thus serves two purposes. It provides a point of access into the lives of the British non-elite typically absent from imperial narratives, while simultaneously revealing how a wider community of elite Westerners viewed their supposed transgressions of the respectable norm.

Focusing on social geography, race, and women's conduct, the case study of Hyndman, Rose, and the Murphys offers an uncommon perspective on Shanghai's foreign society and culture that resonates with wider socio-cultural anxieties across the British empire. Life in disreputable Hongkou, contrasting the ordered Settlement centre, visibly marked the non-elite status Hyndman and the Murphy family. The presence of prostitution, opium shops, taverns, and denigrated communities such as the Chinese, poor Jewish, and Russian refugees, invariably affected the British elite's perception of those residing in the neighbourhood. But Hyndman's and the Murphys' narratives also demonstrate the fluidity and ambiguity of racial classifications and social divisions in the imperial world, and how non-white or "undesirable" foreigners navigated the inexact socio-cultural divisions of Shanghai's International Settlement. Those that passed as white found a modicum of acceptance, enlisting in clubs, playing team sports, and partaking in "respectable" society. Still, they were occasionally reminded of their status, and small slights, deliberate or otherwise, show that constructed racial divisions remained entrenched. These divisions are most apparent with regard to Western women, for whom anxieties over interracial contact and the integrity of the white race inspired moral critiques of the entire gender. Women's experiences became the topic of fitful debates over the very integrity of Western civilisation in China. A Western woman falling on hard

times or acting out of line invited harsh responses and keen attacks on her moral bankruptcy. It mattered not the reality of her situation; the Western woman in Shanghai represented, for better or worse, a symbol of Western civilisation.

That Western nations constructed a myth of superiority with which to legitimate the spread of empire and the privilege of their subjects in foreign nations is well documented. Less understood, though, is how fragile their mindset was, and what its fragility reveals of Western and non-Western contact. By continuing to interrogate the nuances of colonial societies, questioning the ways communities constructed and espoused hierarchies, it is possible to gain new insight into how systems of racism and privilege developed, and what their nuances meant. Publications such as *The Haining Road Tragedy* provide such opportunities. The themes highlighted in the narrative indicate the insecurities that plagued the elite Western community in Shanghai. When read within the wider context, they also reveal a facet of Sino-foreign relations that stemmed from said insecurities about the Western position in China. A more thorough understanding of the lives of the colonial and semi-colonial non-elite, and the rationale behind which elite Western society determined status, helps demonstrate the importance that was placed on racial, social, and gendered distinctions in both twentieth-century Shanghai and in the broader imperial world.

¹ Judith Walkowitz, *City of Dreadful Delight: Narratives of Sexual Danger in Late-Victorian London* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1992), 120; Seth Koven, *Slumming: Sexual and Social Politics in Victorian London* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2004), 3-5. Koven suggests that the voyeurism in publications such as *The Haining Road Tragedy* reinforced notions of “social and sexual propriety and respectability.”

² Paul French, *Through the Looking Glass: China’s Foreign Journalists from Opium Wars to Mao* (Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press, 2009), 67.

³ “Law Reports: H.M. Supreme Court,” *The North China Herald and Supreme Court & Consular Gazette Hereafter NCH*, September 28, 1906.

⁴ Robert Adams, “The Sense of Verification: Pragmatic Commonplaces about Literary Criticism,” in *Myth, Symbol, and Culture*, ed. Clifford Geertz (New York: W.W. Norton & Company, 1971), 207; Mary Jo Maynes, Jennifer L. Pierce, Barbara Laslett, Telling

Stories: The Use of Personal Narratives in the Social Sciences and History (New York: Cornell University Press, 2008), 129.

- ⁵ Isabella Jackson, *Shaping Modern Shanghai: Colonialism in China's Global City*, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2017), 10.
- ⁶ Isabella Jackson, "Who ran the treaty ports? A study of the Shanghai Municipal Council," in *Treaty Ports in Modern China: Law, land and power*, eds. Robert Bickers, Isabella Jackson, (London & New York: Routledge, 2016), 44.
- ⁷ Robert Bickers, *Britain in China*, (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1999), 70-71.
- ⁸ Harald Fischer-Tiné, *Low and Licentious Europeans: Race, Class, and "White Subalternity" in Colonial India*, (New Delhi: Orient Blackswan Private Ltd., 2009); Will Jackson, "An unmistakable trace of colour: Racializing children in segregation-era Cape Town, 1908-1933," *Past and Present*, 238, No. 1 (2018), 165-195; Will Jackson, "Dangers to the Colony: Loose women and the "poor white" problem in Kenya," *Journal of Colonialism and Colonial History*, 14, No. 2 (2013); See also: Elizabeth Buettner, "Problematic spaces, problematic races: defining 'Europeans' in late colonial India," *Women's History Review*, 9, No. 2, (2000), 277-298; Dane Kennedy, *Islands of White: Settler Society and Culture in Kenya and Southern Rhodesia, 1890-1939*, (Durham: Duke University Press, 1987); Robert Morell, "The poor whites of Middleburg, Transvaal, 1900-1930: resistance, accommodation and class struggle," in *White but Poor: Essays of the History of Poor Whites in Southern Africa, 1880-1940*, ed. Robert Morrell, (Pretoria: University of South Africa, 1992), 1-28.
- ⁹ Chiara Betta, "Marginal Westerners in Shanghai: the Baghdadi Jewish community, 1845-1931," in *New Frontiers: Imperialism's new communities in East Asia, 1842-1953*, eds. Robert Bickers, Christian Henriot, (Manchester & New York: Manchester University Press, 2000), 38-54; Robert Bickers, "Who were the Shanghai Municipal Police, and why were they there? The British recruits of 1919," in *New Frontiers: Imperialism's new communities in East Asia, 1842-1953*, eds. Robert Bickers, Christian Henriot, (Manchester & New York: Manchester University Press, 2000), 170-191; Nicolas R. Clifford, *Spoilt Children of Empire: Westerners in Shanghai and the Chinese Revolution of the 1920s*, (Hanover & London: Middlebury College Press, 1991); Catherine Ladds, "Eurasians in treaty-port China: Journeys across racial and imperial frontiers," in *Migrant Cross-Cultural Encounters in Asia and the Pacific*, eds. Jacqueline Leckie, Angela McCarthy, Angela Wanhalla, (Abingdon & New York: Routledge, 2017); Catherine Ladds, *Empire Careers: Working for the Chinese Customs Service, 1854-1949*, (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2013).
- ¹⁰ Eileen P. Scully, *Bargaining with the State from Afar: American Citizenship in Treaty Port China, 1844-1937* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2001), 94, 97.
- ¹¹ While Bickers, "Who were the Shanghai Municipal Police," explains that only certain subjects of the empire could claim the "British" identity, I use "British" in a broader sense in this article to encompass individuals like Hyndman who were born in British territory and attempted to 'pass' as British in public. I am guided here by Catherine Chan, "'Empire' Drifters: The Macanese in British Hong Kong, 1841-1941," (PhD Diss. University of Bristol, 2019), 191, which argues certain Hong Kong born Macanese became Anglicised in their efforts to secure rights and equitable treatment.
- ¹² Robert Bickers, "Shanghailanders: The Formation and Identity of the British Settler Community in Shanghai, 1843-1937," *Past & Present*, 159, 1998, 161-211;
- ¹³ Ladds, "Eurasians in treaty-port China," 2.
- ¹⁴ Ann Laura Stoler, *Along the Archival Grain: Epistemic Anxieties and Colonial Common Sense* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2009), 37.
- ¹⁵ Anjali Arondekar, *For the Record: On Sexuality and the Colonial Archive in India* (Durham; London: Duke University Press, 2009), 4.
- ¹⁶ "Readings for the Week," May 15, 1901; 'Law Report: H.B.M.'s Supreme Court,' NCH, Jan. 27, 1903. The siblings were: Mary Alice Murphy, 21; Winifred Rose, 19; John Vincent Murphy, 18; Mark Edward Murphy, 12; Katie Murphy, 10.
- ¹⁷ *The Haining Road Tragedy* (Shanghai: Shanghai Mercury Ltd., 1906), 25.

-
- ¹⁸ The Haining Road Tragedy, 18.
- ¹⁹ The Haining Road Tragedy, 20.
- ²⁰ Lu Hanchao. *Beyond the Neon Lights: Everyday Shanghai in the Early Twentieth Century* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2004), 44.
- ²¹ Christian Henriot, "'Little Japan' in Shanghai: an insulated community, 1875-1945," in *New Frontiers: Imperialism's new Communities in East Asia, 1842-1953*, eds. Robert Bickers, Christian Henriot, (Manchester & New York: Manchester University Press, 2000), 152.
- ²² Chiara Betta, "From Orientals to Imagined Britons: Baghdadi Jews in Shanghai," *Modern Asia Studies* 37, No. 4, (2003) 1011, 1021. Joshua Fogel, "'Shanghai-Japan': The Japanese Residents' Association of Shanghai," *The Journal of Asian Studies* 59, No. 4 (2000), 928, 945.
- ²³ Marcia Reynders Ristaino, *Port of Last Resort: The Diaspora Communities of Shanghai*, (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2001), 32-35.
- ²⁴ Betta, "From Orientals to Imagined Britons," 1002; Bickers, *Britain in China*, 72; Sarah Abrevaya Stein, "'Protected Persons?' The Baghdadi Jewish Diaspora, the British State, and the Persistence of Empire," *American Historical Review* 116, No. 1 (2011), 98; Chen Zu'en 陳祖恩, *Jindai Shanghai de Riben Juliumin 近代上海的日本居留民* (Shanghai: Shanghai Academy of Social Sciences, 2006). Chen provides a thorough overview of the early Japanese community at Shanghai.
- ²⁵ Lu, *Beyond the Neon Lights*, 44.
- ²⁶ Military Police Commissioner, Report, Sept. 29, 1901, Shanghai Municipal Council (Hereafter SMC), U1-2-238, Shanghai Municipal Archives (Hereafter SMA); von Witzleben to Major Southey, Nov. 19, 1901, SMC, U1-2-238, SMA; Yin to the SMC, Petition, 1900, SMC, U1-2-230, SMA. The reports, and Yin Tangshi's 殷湯氏 petition describe acts of violence committed by idle Western soldiers against foreign and Chinese civilians in Shanghai.
- ²⁷ Frederick Wakeman Jr., *Policing Shanghai, 1927-1937*, (Berkeley, Los Angeles, London: University of California Press), 1995, 35.
- ²⁸ Wong to the SMC, Apr. 24, 1908, U1-2-335, SMA.
- ²⁹ Ping Jinya 平襟亞, "Jiu Shanghai de Yan Du 旧上海的煙毒," in *Jiu Shanghai de Yan Du Chang 旧上海的煙賭娼* (Shanghai: Baijia Publishing, 1988), 7. See also: Huang Wei 黃偉, Dai Angang 戴鞍鋼, "Yapian Maoyi yu Yapian Liudu Zai Shanghai 鴉片貿易與鴉片流毒在上海," in *Jiu Shanghai de Yan Du Chang 旧上海的煙賭娼* (Shanghai: Baijia Publishing, 1988), 13-23.
- ³⁰ Municipal Council Health Officers, Report, Oct. 25, 1906, SMC, U1-2-303, SMA.
- ³¹ Mr. Symons to the SMC Secretary, Mar. 19, 1877, SMC, U1-2-67, SMA; Mr. Ford to the SMC Secretary, Mar. 21, 1877, SMC, U1-2-67, SMA.
- ³² J. Bourke to the Captain Superintendent of Police, Dec. 11, 1911, SMC, U1-2-395, SMA. These taverns were: The Hague Hotel, Naval Club, Travellers Hotel, and Bristol Hotel; See also, Col. Bruce to E. W. Godfrey Esq., Jan. 31, 1912, SMC, U1-2-395, SMA. in which Bruce repeats Bourke's comments about the ownership the establishments.
- ³³ Bruce, to E. W. Godfrey Esq., 1912. Typical of SMC correspondence, no first names are recorded.
- ³⁴ W. E. Leveson, to H. Gruzman, Dec. 23, 1911, SMC, U1-2-395 SMA.
- ³⁵ Lu, *Beyond the Neon Lights*, 39.
- ³⁶ Ping Jinya 平襟亞, "Jiu Shanghai de Changji 旧上海的娼妓," in *Jiu Shanghai de Yan Du Chang 旧上海的煙賭娼* (Shanghai: Baijia Publishing, 1988), 165.
- ³⁷ Walkowitz, *City of Dreadful Delights*, 8.
- ³⁸ Philippa Levine, *Prostitution, Race, and Politics: Policing Venereal Disease in the British Empire* (New York: Routledge, 2003), 6.
- ³⁹ Paul A. Cohen, *History in Three Keys: The Boxers as Event, Experience, and Myth*, (New York: Columbia University Press, 1997), 162.
- ⁴⁰ Eileen P. Scully, "Prostitution as Privilege: The 'American Girl' of Treaty-Port Shanghai, 1860-1937," *The International History Review* 20, No. 4 (1998), 868.

-
- ⁴¹ Clifford, *Spoilt Children of Empire*, 12, 15; Nicholas R. Clifford, *Shanghai, 1925: Urban Nationalism and the Defense of Foreign Privilege*, (Ann Arbor: Centre for Chinese Studies, 1979), xi.
- ⁴² Kerrie L. MacPherson, *A Wilderness of Marshes: The Origins of Public Health in Shanghai, 1842-1893*, Lanham: Lexington Books, 2002.
- ⁴³ Janet Y. Chen, *Guilty of Indigence: The Urban Poor in China, 1900-1953* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2012), 85.
- ⁴⁴ Bickers, "Who were the Shanghai Municipal Police"; and Bickers, "Shanghaianders," demonstrate the various ways the British hierarchically ordered society according to social practices, taboos, and assumptions.
- ⁴⁵ Lu, *Beyond the Neon Lights*, 15.
- ⁴⁶ J. Chen, *Guilty of Indigence*, 81; Betta, "From Orientals to Imagined Britons," 1020.
- ⁴⁷ Robert Bickers, *Empire Made Me: An Englishman Adrift in Shanghai* (London: Allen Lane, 2003), 39.
- ⁴⁸ Catherine Vance Yeh, "The Life-Style of Four Wenren in Late Qing Shanghai," *Harvard Journal of Asiatic Studies* 57, No. 2 (1997), 424.
- ⁴⁹ Captain Superintendent of the Shanghai Municipal Police, Report, Nov. 13, 1906, SMC, U1-2-303, SMA.
- ⁵⁰ SMC, Annual Report for the Year Ended 31st December 1908 and Budget for the Year Ending 31st December 1909, SMC, U1-1-921, SMA, 20; William Gascoyne-Cecil, *Changing China* (New York: D. Appleton and Company, 1912). Transient appears in quotations here to emphasize the term's imprecise application. To commentators, the white underclass were transients, but as Bickers shows, Shanghaianders such as the Murphys were multigenerational inhabitants of the port.
- ⁵¹ *The Haining Road Tragedy*, 48.
- ⁵² Jorge Forjaz, *Familias Macaenses*, Vol. II (Macao: Fundação Oriente: Instituto Cultural de Macau, 1996), 235.
- ⁵³ *The Haining Road Tragedy*, 3, 24.
- ⁵⁴ Bickers, *Empire Made Me*, 52.
- ⁵⁵ Jackson, "Who Ran the Treaty Ports?" 54.
- ⁵⁶ "Sport," NCH, Aug. 12, 1910, "High Jump (Open Handicap)," NCH, May. 10, 1913
- ⁵⁷ Betta, 'From Orientals to Imagined Britons,' 1014-1016.
- ⁵⁸ Radhika Mohanram, *Imperial White: Race, Diaspora, and the British Empire* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2007), xx, xxii.
- ⁵⁹ Clifford, *Spoilt Children of Empire*, 5.
- ⁶⁰ Ladds, *Empire Careers*, 5.
- ⁶¹ Chan, "'Empire' Drifters," 1.
- ⁶² Ellen Randolph Coolidge to Sarah Forbes, Jan. 22, 1840. Coolidge-Lowell Family Papers, Ms. N-2404, Massachusetts Historical Society; Augustine Heard Jr., *The Poisoning in Hong Kong – An Episode of Life in China Forty Years Ago*, 1894, Heard Family Business Records GQ-2-1, Baker Library, Harvard Business School. 3. Heard recalls how his Macanese clerk Lanca "naturally" employed "his own countrymen" to supply the house when possible.
- ⁶³ The mother, or possibly mothers, of the children are absent from the records, and it is impossible to make a definitive statement as to their ancestry.
- ⁶⁴ Stephen Howe, *Ireland and Empire: Colonial Legacies in Irish History and Culture*, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002), 45.
- ⁶⁵ Julia M. Wright, *Ireland, India and Nationalism in Nineteenth-Century Literature*, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007), 13-16.
- ⁶⁶ John M. MacKenzie, "Irish, Scottish, Welsh and English World? A Four-Nation Approach to the History of the British Empire," *History Compass*, 6, No. 5, (2008), 12.
- ⁶⁷ Noel Ignatiev, *How the Irish Became White* (New York: Routledge, 1995), 41.
- ⁶⁸ "Law Reports," NCH, Shanghai, Jan. 27, 1903.

-
- ⁶⁹ Robert Bickers, "Ordering Shanghai: Policing a Treaty-Port, 1854-1900," in *British Imperial Maritime Trade in the Nineteenth Century*, eds. David Killingray, Margarete Lincoln, Nigel Rigby (Boydell and Brewer, Boydell Press, 2005), 179.
- ⁷⁰ Gail Hershatter, *Dangerous Pleasures: Prostitution and Modernity in Twentieth Century Shanghai* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1999), 81.
- ⁷¹ SMC Tax Office, Payroll, Dec. 4, 1911, SMC, U1-2-396, SMA.
- ⁷² Gascoyne-Cecil, *Changing China*, 38-39.
- ⁷³ Emily Whewell, "British Extraterritoriality in China: The Legal System, Functions of Criminal Jurisdiction, and its Challenges, 1833-1942," (PhD Diss. University of Leicester, 2015), 141.
- ⁷⁴ Hershatter, *Dangerous Pleasures*, 78.
- ⁷⁵ 'Report of Watch Committee for June 1874,' *North China Daily News*, July 1, 1874; Gascoyne-Cecil, *Changing China*, 76.
- ⁷⁶ *The Haining Road Tragedy*, 48.
- ⁷⁷ 'HM Police Court,' *NCH*, June 6, 1908.
- ⁷⁸ 'Peter S. Hyndman Funeral Rites Held,' *The China Press*, Apr. 19, 1936.
- ⁷⁹ Philippa Levine, "Introduction: Why Gender and Empire?" in *Gender and Empire*, ed. Philippa Levine (Oxford; New York: Oxford University Press, 2004), 6; Tim Allender, *Learning Femininity in Colonial India, 1820-1932* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2016), 22.
- ⁸⁰ Rajeshwar Mittapali, Susmita Roye, *The Male Empire under the Female Gaze: The British Raj and the Memsahib* (Amherst: Cambria, 2013), 7.
- ⁸¹ Bickers, "Shanghaianders," 176-177.
- ⁸² Philippa Levine, *Prostitution, Race and Politics: Policing Venereal Disease in the British Empire*, (New York: Routledge, 2003), 6; Scully, "Prostitution as Privilege," 858.
- ⁸³ Levine, "Introduction: Why Gender and Empire?" 8.
- ⁸⁴ Sarah Mills, *Gender and Colonial Space* (Manchester: Manchester Scholarship Online, 2012), 35.
- ⁸⁵ Harald Fischer-Tiné, "'White women degrading themselves to the lowest depths': European networks of prostitution and colonial anxieties in British India and Ceylon ca. 1880-1914" *The Indian Economic and Social History Review* 40, No. 2 (2003), 166.
- ⁸⁶ Ann Laura Stoler, "Making Empire Respectable: The Politics of Race and Sexual Morality in 20th-Century Colonial Cultures," *American Ethnologist* 16, No. 4 (1989), 634.
- ⁸⁷ William H. Donald, "The Press," in *Twentieth Century Impressions of Hongkong, Shanghai, and other Treaty Ports of China: Their History, People, Commerce, Industries, and Resources*, ed. Arnold Wright, H.A. Cartwright (London: Lloyd's Greater Britain Publishing Company, Ltd., 1908), 357-358.
- ⁸⁸ Walkowitz, *City of Dreadful Delights*, 6.
- ⁸⁹ *The Haining Road Tragedy*, 3, 36, 38.
- ⁹⁰ *The Haining Road Tragedy*, 26.
- ⁹¹ Davenport, Walker to the SMC Chairman, Petition, Dec. 14, 1911, SMC, U1-2-395, SMA.
- ⁹² Bickers, "Who were the Shanghai Municipal Police," 173, discusses how the appellation of "distressed British subjects" was bestowed by the SMC upon those who might receive aid from the council or from charity committees.
- ⁹³ Hickman to F. Anderson, Feb. 20, 1900, SMC, U1-2-224, SMA.
- ⁹⁴ Christian Henriot, *Prostitution in Shanghai: A Social History, 1849-1949* (Cambridge, UK; New York: Cambridge University Press, 2001); Scully, *Bargaining with the State from Afar*, 100-101.
- ⁹⁵ Scully, "Prostitution as Privilege," 856. See also: David Arnold, "European Orphans and Vagrants in India in the Nineteenth Century," *Journal of Imperial and Commonwealth History* vii (1979); Ann Laura Stoler, "Rethinking Colonial Categories: European Communities and the Boundaries of Rule," *Comparative Studies in Society and History* xiii (1989).
- ⁹⁶ Levine, *Prostitution, Race and Politics*, 232.

⁹⁷ Leveson to G. Denby, May 14, 1908, SMC, U1-2-330, SMA.

⁹⁸ Edward Little, Brunner, Mond & Co., Ltd. Report on Prostitution, SMC, 14 June 1905, U1-2-295, SMA.

⁹⁹ T. N. Hergall, to the SMC, June 13, 1906, SMC, U1-2-299, SMA.

¹⁰⁰ Austro-Hungarian Consulate, to W. E. Leveson, June 17, 1906, SMC, U1-2-299, SMA.