Fulton, H. (1996). Punctuation as a Semiotic Code: The Case of the Medieval Welsh cywydd. *Parergon*, 13(2), 2-17.
<https://doi.org/10.1353/pgn.1996.0028>

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

Link to published version (if available):
[10.1353/pgn.1996.0028](https://doi.org/10.1353/pgn.1996.0028)

[Link to publication record in Explore Bristol Research](#)
PDF-document

This is the final published version of the article (version of record). It first appeared online via Australian and New Zealand Association for Medieval and Early Modern Studies at 10.1353/pgn.1996.0028. Please refer to any applicable terms of use of the publisher.

University of Bristol - Explore Bristol Research

General rights

This document is made available in accordance with publisher policies. Please cite only the published version using the reference above. Full terms of use are available:
<http://www.bristol.ac.uk/red/research-policy/pure/user-guides/ebr-terms/>

Punctuation as a semiotic code: the case of the medieval Welsh *cywydd*

Like other editorial choices, the selection and addition of punctuation marks in modern texts is a significant process, that is, one that constructs meaning. Since few Welsh manuscripts of the Renaissance and early modern periods (fifteenth to seventeenth centuries) contain detailed punctuation marks, modern editors supply them as part of the editorial process, and in doing so, make use of a semiotic code.¹ The code of punctuation, like other semiotic codes, not only constructs grammatical meaning—distinguishing between a statement and a question, for example—but also cultural meaning.

Choosing punctuation, or any other linguistic sign, is part of a social semiotic governed by cultural and ideological factors. In any linguistic act, punctuation is not simply an add-on extra with its own fixed, definable and 'natural' laws, it is part of a process which helps to construct the meaning of the whole text. In a recently published history of punctuation, M. B. Parkes says:

The role of punctuation as a feature of the pragmatics of the written medium in transmitting semantic intent is even greater in poetry than in prose ... A poetic text is a complex of structures, and punctuation is one of the elements in that complex, which offers guidance for [the] processes of interpretation.²

As a social semiotic, punctuation is subject to change over time, as are other semiotic codes. We can recognise fashions and conventions in punctuation at any given period arising out of the prevailing consensus as to what kind of punctuation might be needed, what each symbol may signify, and so on. Conservative users of English may rail against the decline of the apostrophe, but in the economics of desk-top publishing, where marks such as apostrophes and quotation marks count as additional characters, editors

¹ While the poems are always laid out in metrical lines, in some cases with a capital letter at the beginning of each line, there are generally no full stops, commas or other forms of punctuation in the Renaissance manuscripts of medieval Welsh poetry. Small unstressed particles are sometimes attached to lexical items, whereas they are printed as separate words in modern Welsh.

² M. B. Parkes, *Pause and Effect: An Introduction to the History of Punctuation in the West*, Berkeley, 1993, p. 114.

are likely to rate them as less important than formatting, that is, the layout of paragraphs and margins, which constructs a professional-looking text without necessarily incurring additional costs.

The function of punctuation as a social semiotic is evident when we compare different editions of the same medieval Welsh poems. I am talking here specifically about *cywyddau*, poems composed in the *cywydd* metre in the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries and preserved in manuscripts of the fifteenth to eighteenth centuries.³ Many of these poems are attributed in the manuscripts to the famous fourteenth-century poet, Dafydd ap Gwilym, or to one of his contemporaries,⁴ but authorship of a large number of them is doubtful and they can be assumed to be the product of a school of court poets addressing the medieval Welsh nobility.

In preparing modern texts of these medieval poems, editors have made punctuation choices which construct, and are constructed by, their particular views on issues such as the role of the editor (to present a single authoritative text), the purpose of an edited text (to offer a seamless version of an 'original' work), and the nature of professional and scholarly writing (a discourse which is partly defined by 'correct' and appropriate punctuation). More crucially, the punctuation choices construct a view of what medieval Welsh poetry is or should be, how it should be read, and how it should be understood as 'medieval' literature.⁵

Though there is considerable agreement on these issues among modern (that is, twentieth-century) editors of medieval Welsh poetry, it is also clear that editorial decisions are based on the editor's sense of what poetry itself might be, what is its nature and purpose. What we find, then, in the edited texts of the *cywyddau*, is a conventional concept or construct of the *cywydd* itself as a medieval (and therefore 'high') literary genre, interpreted through

³ On the *cywydd* tradition in medieval Welsh literature, see Gwyn Williams, *An Introduction to Welsh Literature*, Cardiff, 1992, pp. 20–25; Meic Stephens (ed.), *Oxford Companion to the Literature of Wales*, Oxford, 1986, p. 117; and Eury I. Rowlands (ed.), *Poems of the Cywyddwyr*, Dublin, 1976, pp. xi–xxvii.

⁴ For an introduction to the work of Dafydd ap Gwilym, see Rachel Bromwich, *Dafydd ap Gwilym*, Cardiff, 1974. See also Bromwich's article, 'The Earlier Cywyddwyr: Dafydd ap Gwilym's Contemporaries', in *Aspects of the Poetry of Dafydd ap Gwilym*, Cardiff, 1986, pp. 152–71.

⁵ The same point applies to other linguistic choices made by editors—choosing one reading rather than another and so on—but this article focusses specifically on the code of punctuation in the construction of meaning.

various modern concepts of poetry as 'high' cultural art. This results in a number of editorial styles and texts which conform to some extent to conventional and familiar modes of poetry, in particular 'Romantic', 'rhetorical', 'modernist' and 'narrative' styles. I would also like to suggest the possibility of a 'post-modernist' text of a *cywydd*, all of these constructed in part through the semiotic code of punctuation.

The tendency of modern editors and translators of *cywydd* poetry has been to punctuate the poems in couplets. Each sense-unit typically consists of one or two lines loosely connected by a comma, with each couplet marked off by a full stop, or sometimes a semi-colon, as in this example from *Yr Eira* ('The Snow'):

Mis Ionawr, blaenawr y blaid,
Mae Duw'n gwneuthur meudwyaid.
E dderyw Dduw 'r ddaear ddu
O gylchoedd ei gwyngalchu.
Ni bu is coed heb wisg wen,
Ni bu lwyn heb lywionen.⁶

(In January, first of the group, God creates hermits. God has whitewashed the black ground all around. There is no ground beneath trees without a white robe, there is no grove without a sheet.)

This convention has been prompted by a number of factors: the metre requires rhyming couplets (*blaid* rhymes with *meudwyaid*, and so on), the manuscripts sometimes indicate the couplets by spacing or numbering them,⁷ and the syntax itself often constructs a sense-unit corresponding to a couplet, as in the first two couplets of the example above.

These factors have encouraged scholars to think of the 'couplet style' as characteristic of the late medieval *cywydd*. There is even a tendency to rank the poems in terms of the proportion of couplet sense-units: the more there are, the more pedestrian the poem is thought to be. If a poet runs the sense-

⁶ Ifor Williams and Thomas Roberts, *Cywyddau Dafydd ap Gwilym a'i Gyfoeswyr*, Cardiff, 1935, XLI, ll. 13–18. This edition is henceforth abbreviated to *DGG*.

⁷ In medieval manuscripts generally, layout was more important than punctuation as a guide to reading and understanding the text. Parkes says (*Pause and Effect*, p. 100): Most medieval scribes employed the traditional layouts for copying verse texts derived from ancient precedents ... Such layouts drew the attention of the reader to the existence of rhythmical organisation in a text.

unit and syntactic unit over more than two lines, it is a sign of great originality, skill and sophistication.⁸

Because editors expect couplets, they tend to punctuate in couplets, therefore imposing particular meanings on the text. In many cases, there are few alternatives, but sometimes it is possible to punctuate differently and allow the sense-unit to extend over a number of lines. Comparing the four edited versions of the same poem in Appendix 1 below, *Caru dyn lygeitu lwyd*, we can see that ll. 5–8 in versions A, B and C are punctuated as two sentences in two couplets:

Ai gwir, y ferch a garaf,
Na fynny fedw hoywdw haf?
Ac na thewy ny tŷ tau,
Wythliw sêr, a'th laswrau? (ll. 5–8)⁹

(Is it true, girl whom I love, that you do not want summer birches of lively growth? And that you will not be silent, in that house of yours, with your rosary-prayers?)

Syntactically, however, there are two clauses dependent on the same main clause, *ai gwir* ('is it true?'), so that the sense-unit runs over the whole four lines, as indicated by the punctuation in version D, which is my own edition of the poem.¹⁰ Keeping to the 'couplet style' not only conforms to editorial (and reader) expectations about the 'normal' pattern of a *cywydd*, it also maintains an even pace throughout the poem which helps to construct it as a seamless piece of lyrical poetry. So to some extent, critical assumptions about the typical *cywydd* form and accomplishment are based on a style constructed by editorial choices of punctuation.

⁸ Thomas Parry, for example, uses the 'couplet style' as one of his criteria for deciding which poems are by Dafydd ap Gwilym and which belong to the fifteenth century. According to Parry (*Gwaith Dafydd ap Gwilym*, Cardiff, 1952, pp. xci–xciii), the 'couplet style' predominates in the fifteenth century, while Dafydd ap Gwilym and his contemporaries in the fourteenth century used more varied syntactic patterns.

⁹ Appendix 1, versions A, B and C (text of A). For Appendix 1, see below, pp. 32–34.

¹⁰ See below, p. 34. This poem is one of a large corpus of fourteenth- and fifteenth-century *cywyddau* which I am in the process of editing. My interest in scribal texts as physical artefacts, and the way in which they become, through editorial intervention, meaningful in various ways, has developed as a result of this project.

Occasionally, editors actually choose readings from among the manuscript variants which conform to the couplet style with single-line sense-units, as in this example, again from *Yr Eira* ('The Snow'):

Ni'm twyllir o'm tŷ allan
 Ar air merch i'r eira mân.
 Pla yw'r gwaith, plu ar y gŵn
 A drig fal chware dragwn. (*DGG*, XLI, ll. 5–8)

(I will not be beguiled from my house outside by a girl's word into the fine snow. A plague is the deed, feathers settle on the gown like a dragon-costume.)¹¹

The early manuscripts read *O'm twyllir* ('if I am beguiled'), using a dependent clause leading to the main clause, *pla yw'r gwaith* ('a plague is the deed'), with the sense running over the four lines instead of being separated into two sentences. It would also be possible to end the first sense-unit in the middle of l. 7: *pla yw'r gwaith!* ('a plague is the deed!'), followed by a second sentence beginning mid-line, a relatively unusual punctuation strategy in modern editions of *cywyddau*. The editorially preferred reading in this example has imposed a form of punctuation which conforms to the expected couplet unit, and which therefore constructs a particular meaning for the lines.

This preference for the couplet style, marked by a fairly even distribution of commas and full stops, with the occasional semi-colon, helps to construct a *cywydd* style which suggests the 'Romantic' mode of English poetry, characterised by rhythmical and evenly-flowing lines of intense introspective thought. Version A of the poem in Appendix 1 is positively Wordsworthian in its even pacing of couplets in which commas and full stops regularly alternate and there are no paragraph breaks. It is a practice of this particular edition that no paragraph breaks are made (there are none in the manuscripts), which partly encodes the ideology of the 'real' or 'original' text reproduced exactly as it was written down, but which also suggests the Romantic style of long lyrical segments of unbroken thought.

Similarly, the titles chosen by these particular editors (there are generally no titles in the earliest manuscripts) conform to the Romantic convention of addressing specific people or objects. Many of the *cywyddau*

¹¹ This is assumed to be a rare reference in Welsh to folk plays or miracle plays in which an actor plays a dragon, wearing a costume made of feathers to represent scales.

are given titles such as *I'r Lleian* ('To the Nun') or *Yr Eira* ('The Snow'), recalling Keats' 'Ode to a Grecian Urn' and Wordsworth's 'To a Butterfly', where the simplicity of the titles foregrounds the complexity of the æsthetic or natural object and the poet's responses to it.

Other editorial choices in *DGG* contribute to the Romantic style constructed for the poems. In *Y Niwl* ('The Mist'), the editors have punctuated one couplet as a question rather than as a statement:

Nos im fydd dydd diferglwyd,
 Dydd yn nos, pand diddawn wyd?
(*DGG*, XXXIX, ll. 31–32)

(Night for me is a day of dripping wattle, day like night, why are you useless?)

Other manuscripts read *y dydd â'n nos diddawn wyd*, which can be punctuated as: *Y dydd â'n nos—diddawn wyd!* ('The day will become night—you are useless!'). This constructs quite a different tenor. Whereas the 'Romantic' version enquires of the mist what its purpose might be, constructing a nineteenth-century poetic interest in natural phenomena and their relation to human life, the alternative reading constructs a worldview (modern? philistine?) in which the mist is simply a nuisance, rather than a manifestation of elemental mystique.

Altogether, the editorial style of *DGG* in terms of punctuation and layout constructs 'Romantic' readings of the poems, characterised by 'a repeated concern to achieve various types of harmonies, systems and reconciliations'.¹² The subject-matter of many of the poems, describing rustic scenes or images of natural beauty, together with the even punctuation and long non-stanzaic structures, suggests a mode similar to Wordsworth's *Lyrical Ballads*, describing scenes from 'low and rustic life' in which 'the passions of men are incorporated with the beautiful and permanent forms of Nature'.¹³

¹² Jerome J. McGann, *The Romantic Ideology: A Critical Investigation*, Chicago, 1983, p. 40.

¹³ Letter from Wordsworth to Charles James Fox, quoted by Jonathon Wordsworth in *William Wordsworth and the Age of English Romanticism*, New Brunswick and London, 1987, pp. 38–39.

Turning to version B in Appendix 1,¹⁴ the punctuation hardly differs from version A except in the use of paragraph breaks. These breaks, put in by the editor, Thomas Parry, construct a slightly different style, which is more rhetorical than the Romantic style of version A. The poem now is not so much an introspective musing on the status of the nun as a direct address to the nun using a more peremptory tenor. The second paragraph begins with a rhetorical question, *ai gwir?* ('is it true?'), the third paragraph with a command, *a chadw i'th gof* ('and keep in mind'), and the last paragraph with another question. This progression of demands is made more forceful by the slightly different line-order adopted in this version, where the couplet beginning *a chadw i'th gof* is placed at the beginning of a series of imperatives—compare the order of ll. 21–26 in versions A and C. Tenor does not therefore reside inherently in the poem but is constructed by editorial choices, and different choices construct different tenors.

The break between the second and third paragraphs occurs mid-diatribes, as if the poet were drawing breath for yet another onslaught, while the last paragraph, addressing the audience rather than the girl, assertively demands our sympathy for the poet's position by setting a moral and religious dilemma:

Ai gwaeth i ddyn gwiw ei thaid
Yn y llwyn ennill enaid
Na gwneuthur fal y gwnaetham
Yn Rhufain ac yn Sain Siâm?

(OBWV, 60, ll. 31–34)

(Is it worse for a girl, worthy her grandfather, to win a soul in the grove than to do as we did in Rome and in Santiago?)

In other words, is it worse for the nun to 'convert' a soul in the grove than to go on pilgrimages to Rome and Santiago? Whereas version A supplies a comma after *enaid* ('soul'), constructing the couplet style, the unbroken syntax in version B breaks the rhythm of the couplets and creates a closing climax in which the poet's central proposition is laid directly before the audience.

The effect of these paragraphing and punctuation choices is to construct the rhetorical tenor of the pulpit, a style very reminiscent of Welsh chapel preaching. The poet is almost delivering a sermon to the nun, ironically

¹⁴ From Thomas Parry (ed.), *Oxford Book of Welsh Verse*, Oxford, 1962 (hereafter, OBWV).

urging her to adopt a more secular way of life, and ending with a rhetorical question which highlights the moral difficulty but clearly expects an answer in favour of the nun in the grove. In setting an editorial style for his Oxford edition, Parry regularly draws on a local Welsh tradition of oral performance for his sense of what the *cywydd* style was, locating it solidly within the important native context of learned oral rhetoric, while the editors of *DGG* have drawn on a classic English genre of highly literate poetry, asking us to consider the *cywydd* as part of a 'high culture' tradition similar to that of the English Romantics. In both cases, the medieval *cywydd* is identified with prestige forms of literary art.

The punctuation of version C in Appendix 1¹⁵ differs noticeably from that in versions A and B. There is one paragraph break (as opposed to none or two), and the couplet style is varied by the use of semi-colons (ll. 12 and 14), a colon (l. 18) and the continuation of the sense-unit within couplets (ll. 13–14, 19–20). These choices have the effect of linking the two imperatives, *paid* ('cease'), in ll. 11 and 13, as part of the same utterance running over four lines; of emphasising the word-play on *lleian* and *lleianaeth* in ll. 15–16; and of constructing a semantic opposition between ll. 17–18 and 19–20, where the nun's faith is shown (by the colon) to be incompatible with marriage. The colon functions here in a manner described by Partridge as 'antithetic and oppositional', which is one of the fourteen functions he defines for this particular mark.¹⁶ The number of couplets without any punctuation mark after the first line creates a prose-like rhythm in opposition to the regular syllabic metre of the *cywydd*.

The paragraph break, supported by the line-order chosen in this edition (which is the same as version A), creates a visible gap which emphasises the semantic gap between the nun's life in the convent (described in paragraph 1 of this version) and the poet's hypothetical depiction of their life together in the woodland (described in paragraph 2). The final question is included as part of this hypothetical desire, and not separated into a coda (as in version B), so avoiding a point of closure for the poem and leaving us with the dilemma of the poet's position.

¹⁵ D. J. Bowen (ed.), *Barddoniaeth yr Uchelwyr*, Cardiff, 1959 (abbreviated in Appendix 1 to *BU*).

¹⁶ Eric Partridge, *You Have a Point There: A Guide to Punctuation and its Allies*, 2nd edn, London, 1977, p. 57.

These punctuation choices, which construct a specific semantic range for the poem, offer a 'modernist' reading of the text which emphasises its formal structure of balanced and oppositional themes, and suggests the possibility of prose rhythms within a strict metre.¹⁷ The greater variety of punctuation challenges the conventional alternation of commas and full stops, and draws attention to the form of the poem, representing a 'questioning of the processes of representation'¹⁸ and an 'aesthetic self-consciousness and reflexivity'¹⁹ which are characteristic of modernist poetry. The colon (in l. 18) itself signifies the modernist period, as according to Partridge it re-appeared as a flexible punctuation mark during this period:

In English the colon long predominated over the semicolon, but throughout the nineteenth century and indeed until the middle 1920s, except in such writing as the Landors, it fell into disuse for structural purposes and seldom occurred for any purpose other than the annunciatory. Since 1926, when H. W. Fowler's admirable book, *A Dictionary of Modern English Usage*, appeared, the colon has been returning to favour and a much more various employment.²⁰

My own punctuation choices, represented by version D in Appendix 1, construct a narrative reading of the poem in which there is a progressive movement from beginning to end, with stages in the narrative development marked by the paragraph breaks. Because of the manuscript readings I have chosen (mainly from a single source), supported by punctuation which alternates long and short sentences, the focus of the poem is a story rather than a moral point: in the first paragraph, the poet describes his state of

¹⁷ Metrical experimentation was one of the hallmarks of modernist poetry. T. S. Eliot described two kinds of *vers libre*:

verse which takes a traditional verse form, like the iambic pentameter, and continually withdraws from it, though never altogether severing contact with it; and verse which begins with no verse form at all but continually approaches or approximates to one.

(Paraphrased by P. N. Furbank and Arnold Kettle, *Modernism and its Origins*, Milton Keynes, 1975, p. 33.) Clearly an explicit departure from the *cywydd* metre is not possible, but this version pulls at the edges of its conventional rhythms.

¹⁸ Raymond Williams, 'Modernism and the Metropolis', in Dennis Walder (ed.), *Literature in the Modern World*, Oxford, 1990, pp. 164–70 (p. 168). This remark and the one following are applied by their authors to modernist texts in general.

¹⁹ Madan Sarup, *An Introductory Guide to Post-Structuralism and Postmodernism*, London, 1993, p. 131.

²⁰ Partridge, *You Have a Point There*, p. 52.

mind, in the second (supported by a variety of punctuation choices which speed up the pace of the narrative) he urges a change of lifestyle on the nun, and in the last he suggests a union in the woodland. Unlike the other versions, this reading offers a closure in which true love appears to triumph over adversity, a common device of modern romance narratives. I have therefore aligned the *cywydd* (not entirely consciously) with modern popular genres rather than with any forms of 'high culture'.

Finally, with the emergence of computer software programs designed to perform the task of editing several manuscript copies of the same text, it is possible to produce a 'post-modern' edition of a medieval Welsh poem. The post-modern aesthetic separates discourses from their conventional contexts (using images from popular culture to create formal art-works, for example), juxtaposes different styles and discourses within a single text (the 'pastiche' style), and fragments conventional forms to foreground the absence of cohesion and single meanings within a text.

A computer program like *Collate 2* achieves all these effects when used to produce an edited version of a text.²¹ Appendix 2 shows an example of the first few lines of a medieval *cywydd* edited by the *Collate 2* program, with the manuscripts listed in the left-hand column.²² Most obviously, the primary aim of other editions (such as those referred to in this article, including my own), namely to produce a seamless, coherent and single version of a poem from a variety of manuscripts, is deconstructed by *Collate 2*, which lists all the variant readings of each line, showing the words or phrases which differ from the first manuscript version listed for each line. The layout therefore does not signify the genre 'poem', and there is virtually no punctuation to construct a readable text. The result is that all readers are invited to make their own choices of text and punctuation for each line: they must literally construct their own text and therefore their own meanings. In effect, the 'post-modern' text foregrounds the polysemous nature of all texts, and the potential for every text to have as many readings (and meanings) as it has readers.

²¹ Peter Robinson, *Collate 2* (Computer program distributed by the Oxford University Centre for Humanities Computing, Oxford, 1994). I am experimenting with using this program to edit the poems I am working on, as one of my aims is to list all the manuscript variants for each poem.

²² For Appendix 2, see below, p. 35. Other layouts are possible with this program, but the basic idea of listing all the variants is the same.

Punctuation and layout, then, form a significant semiotic code which, with other linguistic codes, helps to construct meanings in edited texts. Punctuation choices, while often conforming to expected conventions, express the editor's attitude to the text and the editor's concept of what poetry is. In the case of the medieval *cywydd*, editors have shaped the poems according to their own expectations of the style and appearance of Welsh poetry. But some have also been influenced by the primary modes of English poetry during the last two centuries, and in constructing Welsh poems according to these models, they are implicitly identifying medieval Welsh poetry with the 'high culture' tradition of 'Romantic' and 'modernist' English poetry. On the other hand, the 'narrative' and 'post-modern' styles of punctuation which I have described work to minimise the medieval character of the poems as a signifier of high status, and to identify the poems more with contemporary popular culture than with an ideological construct of 'great literature'. It is not necessary to try to rank these editorial approaches; what is interesting is the significance of punctuation in the editorial process and the different meanings which can be constructed by this semiotic code.

Helen Fulton
Department of English
University of Sydney

APPENDICES

1. *Caru dyn lygeitu lwyd*

Abbreviations

- BU D. J. Bowen (ed.), *Barddoniaeth yr Uchelwyr*, Cardiff, 1959.
 DGG Ifor Williams and Thomas Roberts (eds), *Cywyddau Dafydd ap Gwilym a'i Gyfoeswyr*, Cardiff, 1935.
 HF Helen Fulton (ed.), *Selections from the Dafydd ap Gwilym Apocrypha* (forthcoming).
 OBW Thomas Parry (ed.), *Oxford Book of Welsh Verse*, Oxford, 1962.

VERSION A

I'r Lleian

- Caru dyn lygeitu lwyd
 2 Yn ddyfal a'm gwnai'n ddifwyd.
 Os mi a'i câr i arall,
 4 Myn Duw gwyn, mi nid wy' gall.
 Ai gwir, y ferch a garaf,
 6 Na fynny fedw hoywdw haf?
 Ac na thewy ny tŷ tau,
 8 Wythliw sêr, a'th laswyrâu?
 Crefyddes o santes wyd,
 10 Caredig i'r côr ydwyd.
 Er Duw, paid a'r bara a'r dŵr,
 12 A bwrw ar gasau'r berwr.
 Paid, er Mair, a'r pader main,
 14 A chrefydd menyh Rhufain.
 Na fydd leian y gwanwyn.
 16 Gwaeth yw lleianaeth na llwyn.
 Dy grefydd, deg oreuferch,
 18 Y sydd wrthwyneb i serch.
 Gwarant modrwy, a mantell,
 20 A gwyrdd wisg a urddai well.
 Dyred i'r fedw gadeiriog,
 22 I grefydd y gwŷdd a'r gog,—
 Ac yno ni'n gogenir,—
 24 I ynnill nef ny llwyn ir.
 A chadw i'th gof lyfr Ofydd,
 26 A phaid a gormodd o ffydd.
 Ninnau a gawn ny gwinwŷdd
 28 Yn neutu'r allt enaid rhydd.
 Duw a fyn, difai annerch,
 30 A saint roi pardwn i serch.
 Ai gwaeth i ddyn gwiw ei thaid
 32 Yn y llwyn ennill enaid,
 Na gwneuthur fal y gwnaetham
 34 Yn Rhufain ac yn Sain Siâm?

(DGG, III)

VERSION B

I'r Lleian

- Caru dyn lygeitu lwyd
 2 Yn ddyfal a'm gwnâi'n ddifwyd.
 Os mi a'i câr i arall,
 4 Myn Duw gwyn, mi nid wy' gall.
 Ai gwir, y ferch a garaf,
 6 Na fynny fedw hundy haf?
 Ac na thewy ny tŷ tau,
 8 Wythliw sêr, â'th laswyrâu?
 Crefyddes o santes wyd,
 10 Caredig i'r côr ydwyd.
 Er Duw, paid â'r bara a'r dŵr,
 12 A bwrw ar gasau'r berwr.
 Paid, er Mair, â'r pader main,
 14 A chrefydd menyh Rhufain.
 Na fydd leian y gwanwyn.
 16 Gwaeth yw lleianaeth na llwyn.
 Dy grefydd, deg oreuferch,
 18 Y sydd wrthwyneb i serch.
 Gwarant modrwy, a mantell,
 20 A gwyrdd wisg a urddai well.
 A chadw i'th gof lyfr Ofydd,
 22 A phaid â gormodd o ffydd.
 Dyred i'r fedw gadeiriog,
 24 I grefydd y gwŷdd a'r gog—
 Ac yno ni'n gogenir—
 26 I ennill nef ny llwyn ir.
 Ninnau gawn yn y gwinwydd
 28 Yn neutu'r allt enaid rhydd.
 Duw a fyn, difai annerch,
 30 A'r saint roi pardwn i serch.
 Ai gwaeth i ddyn gwiw ei thaid
 32 Yn y llwyn ennill enaid
 Na gwneuthur fal y gwnaetham
 34 Yn Rhufain ac yn Sain Siâm?

(OBWV, 60)

VERSION C

Y Lleian

- Caru dyn lygeitu lwyd
 2 Yn ddyfal a'm gwnâi'n ddifwyd.
 Os mi a'i câr i arall,
 4 Myn Duw gwyn, mi nid wy' gall.
 Ai gwir, y ferch a garaf,
 6 Na fynny fedw hoywdw haf?
 Ac na thewy'n y tŷ tau,
 8 Wythliw sêr, â'th laswyrâu?
 Crefyddes o santes wyd,
 10 Caredig i'r côr ydwyd.
 Er Duw, paid â'r bara a'r dŵr,
 12 A bwrw ar gasáu'r berwr;
 Paid, er Mair, â'r pader main
 14 A chrefydd menyh Rhufain.
 Na fydd leian y gwanwyn;
 16 Gwaeth yw lleianaeth no llwyn.
 Dy grefydd, deg oreuferch,
 18 Y sydd wrthwyneb i serch:
 Gwarant modrwy a mantell
 20 A gwyrd wisg a urddai well.

- Dyred i'r fedw gadeiriog
 22 I grefydd y gwydd a'r gog—
 Ac yno ni'n gogenir—
 24 I ennill nef ny llwyn ir.
 A chadw i'th gof lyfr Ofydd,
 26 A phaid â gormodd o ffydd.
 Minnau a gawn ny gwinwydd
 28 Yn neutu'r allt enaid rhydd.
 Duw a fyn, difai annerch,
 30 A saint, roi pardwn i serch.
 Ai gwaeth i ddyn gwiw ei thaid
 32 Yn y llwyn ennill enaid
 No gwneuthur fal y gwnaetham
 34 Yn Rhufain ac yn Sain Siâm?

(BU, 30)

VERSION D

Caru Lleian

- Caru dyn lygeitu lwyd
 2 A'm gwnâi i yn ddifwyd.
 Os myfi a'th gân i arall,
 4 Myn Duw gwyn, mi nid wy' gall!
 Dy garu yn faith a wneuthum,
 6 Dy gasáu nid agos im';
 Os dy golli, gwae fi Fair,
 8 Ni bu golled heb gellwair.
 Ai gwir, y ferch a garaf,
 10 Na fynny fedw hoywdw haf
 Ac na thewy'n y tŷ tau,
 12 Wythliw sêr, â'th laswyrâu?
 Crefyddes o santes wyd,
 14 Caredig i'r côr ydwyd;
 Er Duw, paid â'r bara a'r dŵr
 16 A bwrw ar gasáu'r berwr.
 Er Mair, paid â'r paderau main
 18 A chrefydd mynaich eryfain.
 Na fydd lân yn y gwanwyn,
 20 Gwaeth yw lleianaeth na llwyn:
 Gwarant modrwy a mantell
 22 A gwerdd wisg a urddai well.

- Dyred i'r fedw gadeiriog,
 24 I grefydd y gwŷdd a'r gog—
 Ac yno y'm gogenir—
 26 I ennill Nef yn y llwyn ir.
 Minnau a gawn yn y gwinwydd
 28 Yn neutu'r allt enaid rydd.
 Duw a fyn, difai annerch,
 30 A saint roi pardwn i serch.

(HF)

TRANSLATION OF VERSION D

'Loving a Nun'

Loving a pale dark-eyed girl
has made me unable to eat.
If it is I who loves you on behalf of another,
by holy God, I am not sane!
I have loved you for a long time,
I'm not close to hating you;
if I lose you, woe to me Mary,
there was never a loss without derision.

Is it true, girl whom I love,
that you do not want summer birches of lively growth
and that you will not desist, in that house of yours,
eight colours of the stars,
from counting your beads?
A saint of a nun are you,
a beloved of the choir are you:
for God's sake give up the bread and water
and strive to hate cress.
For Mary's sake, dispense with stone beads
and the religion of carousing monks.
Do not be chaste in the spring-time,
a nun's life is worse than the grove:
the guarantee of a ring and a mantle
and green gown would confer better orders.

Come to the spreading birch trees,
to the religion of the trees and the cuckoo—
and I will be slandered there—
to win Heaven in the fresh grove.
Among the vines
on both sides of the hill, I would have my soul shriven.
God and the saints will want, perfect greeting,
to give a pardon to love.

2. Collate text

<L1>	
DaG1a	Caru dyn ivanc hirwen
DaG1b(i)	
DaG1b(ii)	
DaG1b(ii)/	
DaG1c(i)	
DaG1c(ii)	irwen
<L2>	
DaG1a	Erioed heb unoed i ben
DaG1b(i)	
DaG1b(ii)	
DaG1b(ii)/	
DaG1c(i)	
DaG1c(ii)	
<L3>	
DaG1a	A phan oeddwn gwn gyny
DaG1b(i)	A phan oedd
DaG1b(ii)	
DaG1b(ii)/	
DaG1c(i)	
DaG1c(ii)	
<L4>	
DaG1a	Mewn gobaith oi hafiaith hi
DaG1b(i)	
DaG1b(ii)	
DaG1b(ii)/	
DaG1c(i)	
DaG1c(ii)	
<L5>	
DaG1a	Syganau'r verch anerchais
DaG1b(i)	
DaG1b(ii)	anherchais
DaG1b(ii)/	anherchais
DaG1c(i)	anherchais
DaG1c(ii)	anherchais
<L6>	
DaG1a	Wrthy er llysy vy llais
DaG1b(i)	Wrthyf
DaG1b(ii)	Wrthyf
DaG1b(ii)/	Wrthyf
DaG1c(i)	
DaG1c(ii)	
<L7>	
DaG1a	Ni charaf ddyn dremyn dro
DaG1b(i)	
DaG1b(ii)	