



Hook, D., & Hook, D. (Ed.) (2017). An accidental Americanist: Sir Thomas Phillipps and Juan de Tovar's 'Historia de los indios mexicanos' (Bibliotheca Phillipica, MS 8187). In *The Hispanic, Portuguese, and Latin American manuscripts of Sir Thomas Phillipps* (Vol. I). (Publications of the Magdalen Iberian Medieval Studies Seminar; Vol. 5). Unpublished MSS from the Phillipps-Robinson paper.

Peer reviewed version

[Link to publication record on the Bristol Research Portal](#)  
PDF-document

## University of Bristol – Bristol Research Portal

### General rights

This document is made available in accordance with publisher policies. Please cite only the published version using the reference above. Full terms of use are available:  
<http://www.bristol.ac.uk/red/research-policy/pure/user-guides/brp-terms/>

An Accidental Americanist:  
Sir Thomas Phillipps and Juan de Tovar's  
*Historia de los indios mexicanos*  
(Bibliotheca Phillippica, MS 8187)

David Hook  
*University of Bristol*

Sir Thomas Phillipps (1792-1872), antiquarian, landowner, unsuccessful parliamentary candidate, virulent anti-Papist campaigner, and much else besides, is principally remembered as a bibliophile and collector of manuscripts, of which by his death he had amassed over 38,628 (and probably in fact around sixty thousand, depending on the definition and criteria adopted for counting them).<sup>1</sup> He is not usually thought of as an Americanist or a Hispanist, and I do not, in general, dissent from that judgement. It is, however, the case that his collections and connections led him perhaps by accident rather than by design into the field of Latin American studies. As a discipline, Hispanic Studies as such did not yet exist, and Phillipps should in any case be seen rather as a facilitator than an investigator in this area: the principal significance of his contribution lay in rescuing and preserving primary source material on a grand scale, and in giving access to others to study manuscripts in his collection. The extensive Latin American manuscript material in the Bibliotheca Phillippica included acquisitions ranging from early colonial documents and texts to nineteenth-century political, economic, and geographical papers; it is with just one manuscript, that of the sixteenth-century Jesuit Juan de Tovar's account of indigenous society, that this study is concerned, although reference will be made to others in passing.

The earliest scholarly use of Hispanic material from the Bibliotheca Phillippica, in any sense, seems to have been that by Phillipps' friend Lord Kingsborough, author of the famously massive, nine-volume *Antiquities of Mexico*. In his printed catalogue entry for MS 14136, Bartolome de las Casas' *Historia generalis de Inventione Novae Orbis per Columbum, & de Actis Hispanorum in Nova Hispania, & Mexico ac Insulis Americanis*, Phillipps refers to another MS copy of Las Casas formerly in the possession of Kingsborough. The reference leads him into an unusually emotional tribute to his deceased friend and fellow-enthusiast.<sup>2</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> This is a revised version of a paper entitled 'An Accidental Americanist: Mesoamericanists and the Middle Hill Connections from Bandinel to Bandelier' delivered on 17 October 2007 at the Research Seminar of the Department of Hispanic, Portuguese, and Latin American Studies, University of Bristol; it is adapted from part of my *The Hispanic, Portuguese, and Latin American Manuscripts of Sir Thomas Phillipps*, of which the first three volumes are in press. For permission to quote from the unpublished manuscript letters of Sir Thomas Phillipps, I am indebted to the Bodleian Library, University of Oxford, and to Dr Chris Fletcher, Head of Western Manuscripts, for his kind assistance in this matter. The relevant manuscripts in the Phillipps-Robinson Papers in the Bodleian Library are identified throughout this study by the abbreviation 'MS P-R' and the item number and folio.

<sup>2</sup> Partially quoted by Munby, *Phillipps Studies*, 5 vols (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1951-60), IV, 12, from an auction catalogue; and by Ian Graham, 'Lord Kingsborough, Sir Thomas Phillipps and Obadiah Rich: Some Bibliographical Notes', in *Social Process in Maya Prehistory. Studies in Honour of Sir Eric Thompson*, edited by Norman Hammond (London: Academic Press, 1977), pp. 45-53, at pp. 45-46. (Munby's *Phillipps Studies* is hereafter referred to as *PS*.)

It varies in some unimportant words from the Copy (which is also in my Library) made for my friend, the late lamented Lord Kingsborough, who, I feel it an honour to say, may be deemed to have undertaken his grand Work of Mexican Antiquities in this House of Middle Hill. (For, when he was here, he consulted me about the work, in which I strongly encouraged him, & I gave him his first letter of introduction to Dr. Bandinel of the Bodleian Library, in order to see the Mexican Manuscripts there.) But although the words are unimportant, they suffice to show that there are copies with variations. Where his Lordship obtained his Copy, I am not aware, nor am I likely to learn. For his correspondence seems to have perished in the course of that atrocious Action, which consigned him to a prison, & broke his heart, – the heart of one, who, if ever man merited an honorary Column, deserved to have the loftiest erected to his praise, instead of being subject to the persecutions which he suffered. But, happily, Men who perform great actions, cannot have their glory destroyed by the petty rancour, & malignity, of those living around them, & the name of Edward, Lord Kingsborough will be lauded by the world, when the names of his persecutors are utterly forgotten.)

The principal authority on Phillipps and his library, A.N.L. Munby, does not pursue in any detail the relationship between Phillipps and Edward King, Viscount Kingsborough (1795-1837), except in so far as it is relevant to the former's attempts to purchase items from the latter's library.<sup>3</sup> It is, however, of importance in the context of the Hispanic content of the *Bibliotheca Phillippica*, as may readily be appreciated from the study by Ian Graham, in which there are published transcripts of correspondence between the two men, covering the years 1826-1837, concerning manuscripts needed by Kingsborough for his work on Mexican antiquities. These provide evidence of a firm friendship, probably forged at Oxford, and of Kingsborough's use of material from the *Bibliotheca Phillippica*, apparently as early as 1826, which was hampered only by the refusal of Sir Thomas to allow his manuscripts to leave the mainland when his friend requested that he be allowed to use one at home in Ireland. After Kingsborough's death, Phillipps' anxiety to acquire the copies of Spanish historical manuscript material from his library when it was sold in Dublin in 1842 came to nothing, as Munby points out, and he was obliged to purchase the material subsequently from the book-dealer Obadiah Rich. Phillipps came to suspect that Rich had caused some of the material to be recopied, thereby reducing its value, and this led to a dispute over the price which terminated in Phillipps being sued, successfully, by Rich. Whilst Munby tends to believe that Rich was innocent of dubious practice, the fuller study by Graham suggests that there may have been reasonable grounds for the suspicions entertained by Sir Thomas.<sup>4</sup>

The most influential outcome of Kingsborough's use of material from Middle Hill was probably that which arose from his quotation from the work of Juan de Tovar, from the manuscript owned, and later published in part, by Phillipps, with which this paper is mainly concerned. This is described as follows in his printed catalogue of manuscripts:<sup>5</sup>

8187 765 Juan de Tovar Historia de la Benida de los Indios apobar a Mexico de las partes remotas de Occidente, Idolos y Templos, Ritos Ceremonios Sacrificios

---

<sup>3</sup> Munby, *PS*, IV, 11-14.

<sup>4</sup> The material concerned constituted Phillipps MSS 16171, 16187, 16188, 16214, 16215, 16219, 24321, and the unnumbered MS in Lot 3951 of the sale at Sotheby, *Bibliotheca Phillippica*, New Series, XVI (1976).

<sup>5</sup> Orthography is that of the original; the emendations 'a poblar', 'Ceremonias', 'Bayles' and 'Archivos' may easily be made. The text is quoted from my *The Hispanic, Portuguese, and Latin American Manuscripts of Sir Thomas Phillipps*, vol. II.

Sacerdotes Fiestas Hayles Meses Calendarios, y los Reyes, con otras cosas curiosas Sacadas de los Archives y Tradiciones antiguas dellos.  
*Autograph, with drawings of Idols, &c. In red Mor. 4to.*

For some reason, the manuscript does not appear in the handwritten catalogue of Spanish manuscripts finalised by Thomas Fitzroy Fenwick, the grandson of Sir Thomas, in 1924, although it was still in his possession at that date; it was not sold until 1947, after the Bibliotheca Phillipica had been acquired by the London bookdealers William H. Robinson.

That Phillipps retained an interest in Spanish-American matters generally, and Mexican history in particular, long after Lord Kingsborough's death, is evident from his later purchases of relevant material, his publication of Tovar, and his correspondence with individuals such as the American Mesoamericanist Ephraim George Squier, and Robert Curzon (later Lord Zouche), owner of the Zouche Codex, another Mesoamerican manuscript, all of which are discussed below.

Kingsborough excepted, it seems that it was not until the 1840s that Hispanic scholars, in any of the possible senses of those words, came into contact with the Bibliotheca Phillipica. Writing from Boston on 1 January 1841, William H. Prescott requested from Phillipps information on MS 4148, a manuscript version of the Sixth Relation of Hernán Cortés for use in his *History of the Conquest of Mexico* and that of Peru, citing his fellow American Jared Sparks as his source for knowledge of the existence of this copy.<sup>6</sup> Sparks, although not first and foremost a Hispanic scholar, had learned Spanish in 1824-25 and had worked on the history of Spanish America, and was therefore well qualified to appreciate the potential importance to Prescott of material that he encountered at Middle Hill during his visit in November 1840 in pursuit of Americana for his own historical research. His journal entry for Monday 9 November 1840 records the earliest documented use made of the Bibliotheca Phillipica in relation to Hispanic studies by anyone outside the Phillipps household, other than Kingsborough, and is also the earliest scholarly reference to the Tovar manuscript.<sup>7</sup>

Examining Spanish manuscripts respecting the conquest of Mexico, particularly a letter from Cortes to the king of Spain, consisting of more than two hundred pages, written in

---

<sup>6</sup> Bodleian Library, MS Phillipps-Robinson (hereafter, 'P-R'), b.142, ff. 209-210. For Prescott's first letter to Phillipps, see Munby, *PS*, IV, 41-42, where it is quoted at length; a partial quotation is in *The Correspondence of William Hickling Prescott 1833-1847*, transcribed and edited by Roger Wolcott (Boston: Massachusetts Historical Society, 1925), p. 188 n.1. Wolcott's edition of the letters regrettably omits sections of text, which are sometimes indicated by ellipses and sometimes are not indicated at all. He has also translated Gayangos' Spanish texts into English; in order to verify the precise content of the correspondence, I have consulted photocopies of the originals in the library of the Massachusetts Historical Society. I am grateful to Ms Carrie Supple for her invaluable assistance in this matter. Nor does Wolcott's edition reflect the frequent corrections and changes made in Prescott's own texts; a new edition should take full account of this aspect. Sparks had written to Prescott from London on 3 December 1840, describing his own visit to Middle Hill, and including details of Spanish and Mexican manuscripts of potential interest to him: see Wolcott, *Correspondence of William Hickling Prescott 1833-1847*, pp. 182-185; and, for Prescott's reply of 1 January 1841, thanking Sparks and enclosing his letter to Phillipps of the same date for Sparks to forward to Sir Thomas, pp. 188-91.

<sup>7</sup> See Munby, *PS*, IV, 29-32, for Sparks' visit to Middle Hill in November 1840, with a long extract from his diary, and his description of Cortes's letter and a Mexican manuscript (p. 31). On Sparks, see Herbert B. Adams, *The Life and Writings of Jared Sparks Comprising Selections from his Journals and Correspondence*, 2 vols (Boston: Houghton, Mifflin & Co., 1893); for his visit to Middle Hill (6-12 November), see II, 386-388; for his acquisition of Spanish language skills, see I, 297.

Mexico; and also a curious manuscript, of great antiquity, probably before any of the printed histories of Mexico, concerning the manners and customs of the Mexicans, with nearly fifty beautiful drawings, evidently copied from Mexican originals, among which is a full-length portrait of Montezuma; also a paper purporting to be a grant of land and privileges to the daughter of Montezuma by Cortes, written in Mexico. I have taken the titles of these papers, and some account of their contents, for the purpose of sending them to Mr Prescott, as they will undoubtedly be useful to him in preparing his work on the conquest of Mexico. Sir Thomas Phillipps' eldest daughter, Henrietta, has copied the portrait of Montezuma, which I shall likewise send to him.<sup>8</sup>

Sparks did precisely that, as noted above, in a letter written to Prescott on 3 December, of which the relevant passage merits quotation in full because of its status as a source of detail, from the pen of a perceptive, Spanish-speaking historian, about several of the Hispanic manuscripts in the library of Sir Thomas.<sup>9</sup>

As Sir Thomas is one of the most courteous and generous men in the world, he aided me in making researches, and we found two or three manuscripts relating to your subject as follows.

'Patent of Doña Isabel Montezuma, daughter of the Great Montezuma, last Indian King of the Great Kingdom and City of Mexico, who having been baptized a Christian married Alonso Grado, a native of the City of Alcántara, Hidalgo and a servant of his Majesty, whom he had served and serves in many offices in that Kingdom. Granted by Don Hernando Cortés, Conqueror of the said Kingdom, in the name of his Majesty as his Captain General and Governor of New Spain.' Dated at the end, June 27th 1526 six folio pages closely written, signed by Cortés. A curious paper, conferring certain grants and privileges upon the daughter of Montezuma in consequence of her birth and marriage. Numbered in Sir Thomas's catalogue, 4137. The manuscript is itself a copy, and not the original.

Again; 'Historia de la Venida de los Indios apblar<sup>10</sup> México, &c.' – containing an account of Idols, temples, rights, ceremonies, and of the Mexican calendar, and of the government and laws of the Mexican Kings; – 'Por el Padre Juan de Tovar' (or Tobar) de la Compañía de Jesus.' A small quarto volume of 165 pages closely written. There are also nearly 50 original drawings, colored, and beautifully executed. Among them are several of the Mexican Kings, including Montezuma, 'el último Rey de los Mexicanos,' full length, standing, with a Mexican robe, cap, and ornamented boots. All these drawings are evidently copied from Mexican originals. I compared them with those in Ld. Kingsborough's book, in which there is nothing that surpasses them in beauty. The picture of Montezuma would make an exceedingly appropriate ornament in your book. I have examined the portrait of Montezuma in the quarto edition of Clavigero, in a sitting posture. It is by no means so handsome or characteristic as the one here mentioned. The robe is evidently Spanish. The size of the picture in Tovar's manuscript would exactly suit an octavo page. If you wish to have it engraved in London, you must give me instructions, and I will attend to it. Sir Thomas's daughter furnished me with a tolerable copy, and I have no doubt that Sir Thomas would himself bring the original to London for the use of the artist. As to the manuscript itself, it is very ancient, but I believe it relates wholly to Mexican affairs anterior to the Conquest.

Again; 'Follows the sixth *Relación* that the said Captain General Hernando Cortés wrote to his Majesty, &c.' –

---

<sup>8</sup> Adams, *Life and Writings of Jared Sparks*, II, 387-88; quoted also in Munby, *PS*, IV, 31, with trivial differences of orthography and punctuation.

<sup>9</sup> Wolcott, *Correspondence of William Hickling Prescott 1833-1847*, pp. 182-84.

<sup>10</sup> *Sic* Wolcott, *Correspondence of William Hickling Prescott 1833-1847*, p. 183; Phillipps' printed catalogue entry (MS 8187) reads 'apobar', for 'a poblar'. This is, of course, the Juan de Tovar manuscript.

This is Cortés's sixth letter to the King, dated at Temixtitan, 3d Sept. 1526, divided into 74 sections, and extending to 208 folio pages; a most important work for your purpose, but I have no doubt that you have obtained a copy from Spain. (No. 4148.)

Copies of any of these papers may be had, but it would be attended with some expense, as a copyist must be sent down from London. [...]

I have also kept my eye upon Philip II. The following are titles of two volumes of manuscripts in Sir Thos. Phillipps's collection.

'Laws and Decrees passed by the Cortes which were held in Cordova in the year 1570, in the reign of King Philip II; and those that were passed in Madrid in the year 1586, under the same King Don Philip II.' – A folio volume of 4 or 500 pages. – No. 4057.

'Decrees and Laws of the Cortes held in Madrid in the year 1552, by command of King Philip II, and also those passed by order of the same King in the town of Valladolid (now a city) between 1555 and 1558.' – About 500 pages. – No. 4056.

It is evident that in this account of the five manuscripts that he reported to Prescott Sparks did not merely copy their descriptions from Phillipps' printed catalogue, for in all five cases he gives details concerning the contents that are not found in that source, but must be based upon his own first-hand examination of the volumes.

Independently, the eldest daughter of Sir Thomas, Henrietta, recorded in her diary the visit of Sparks to Middle Hill and her own production of the copy of the portrait of Montezuma. The period of the visit is unfortunately not among the sections of the diary selected for publication in the only modern edition of this important source, but in her original manuscript Henrietta recorded that Sparks arrived on Friday 6 November 1840 and was occupied with manuscripts that same day. On Monday 9 November she wrote of copying the portrait from the manuscript for Sparks, and on Tuesday 10 November recorded that it was completed. Interestingly, the next day Henrietta wrote that she had copied the portrait afresh on her own behalf.<sup>11</sup> Sparks was still occupied in writing, she noted on Thursday 12 November, the day on which he departed, taking the London coach after dining at Middle Hill.

In writing to Phillipps to follow up the important information sent by Sparks, Prescott included in his letter a transcription of two passages of a manuscript of Cortés in his own library, and requested that Phillipps compare this with the Middle Hill copy and, if the texts differed, that he permit a copy to be made through the agency of Sparks. Although no record of his reply to Prescott survives in the Bodleian correspondence, Phillipps obviously complied, for on 15 October 1843 Prescott wrote again to thank Sir Thomas for permitting Pascual de Gayangos to copy the texts involved, as will be seen below, and to inform him that a copy of the *History of the Conquest of Mexico* would be forwarded to him as soon as the London edition was published, which he expected to be in November.<sup>12</sup> In the preface to this work, Prescott gives an appreciation of the riches of the Bibliotheca Phillippica only slightly less fulsome than that which had prefaced his request for a copy of the relevant

---

<sup>11</sup> The only modern (partial) edition of the diary is the selection from it by Marvin Spevack, *A Victorian Chronicle. The Diary of Henrietta Halliwell-Phillipps* (Hildesheim: Georg Olms, 1999). The original MS is now Edinburgh University Library, Special Collections, H-P Coll. 327-330, f. 65 (6-12 November 1840). I have not traced Henrietta's private copy of the portrait of Montezuma; it may, of course, have been lost, given the disruption to her papers and possessions on the occasion of her marriage in 1842.

<sup>12</sup> Original: MS P-R, c.483, ff. 164-65. Gayangos did not make any use of the Middle Hill manuscript of Cortés in his own later edition of *Cartas y relaciones de Hernan Cortés al Emperador Carlos V* (Paris: Imprenta Central de los Ferro-Carriles, A. Chaix y Ca., 1866).

manuscript.<sup>13</sup> A warm mutual respect between Sir Thomas and the great American historian evidently ensued, of which evidence emerges from the correspondence preserved in the Phillipps-Robinson papers in the Bodleian Library and in the Massachusetts Historical Society's library in Boston, in the course of which, for example, Phillipps would later invite Prescott, on 8 July 1850, to come and view some Mexican manuscripts which he had brought to London during the American's first, and indeed only, visit to Europe (the itinerary of which did not include any time in Spain).<sup>14</sup> Prescott replied on 10 July, apologising that his busy schedule prevented him from coming to see the manuscripts, but promising to call at the Athenaeum.<sup>15</sup> On 13 July, however, Phillipps wrote to Prescott regretting that he would not have the pleasure of seeing him, since he had been called home.<sup>16</sup> The subject of transcriptions made on Prescott's behalf will reappear below in the discussion of Phillipps' relations with Gayangos, which were much more developed and enduring than Munby appears to have realised with his single offhand reference to the Spaniard as 'Prescott's copyist'.<sup>17</sup> Prescott's work on the reign of Philip II also clearly benefited from access to (or rather copies of) material in the possession of Phillipps, as the author makes clear in the preface to its first volume in 1855.<sup>18</sup> The publication of this led to further mutually respectful exchanges between the American historian and the English collector, with Phillipps writing from Middle Hill on 29 November that year to offer not only his admiration for the first two volumes, which Prescott had sent to him, but also to promise the use of his manuscripts, including the papers of Gondomar and other unpublished material, should the author still have any work to complete for his third volume on the reign.<sup>19</sup> Prescott's reply of 22 December that year emphasized the sincerity of his appreciation for Phillipps' liberality with his manuscripts, and their great value to his work.<sup>20</sup> He also promised to consult Gayangos on whether any further material might be required for the next volume; and it seems entirely fitting that the need of one great nineteenth-century historian to obtain transcriptions of material in the Phillipps library should have been the cause of the first visit to Middle Hill of this other eminent Hispanic scholar who was also to make good use in his own work of information provided by Sir Thomas from his collections.

Information provided by Gayangos was also a contributory factor in the gradual process of the identification and study of the work of Juan de Tovar among nineteenth-century Mesoamericanists. A letter from him to the Mexican bibliographer

---

<sup>13</sup> I cite this from the 6<sup>th</sup> edition, *History of the Conquest of Mexico*, 2 vols (London: Richard Bentley, 1850), I, vii.

<sup>14</sup> Retained file copy in the Bodleian Library, MS P-R, c.509, fols. 199-201; the original is in the W.H. Prescott Papers at the Massachusetts Historical Society. Letters later than 1847 are not edited by Wolcott; they of course fall outside the chronological limits of his work. For Prescott's visit to Europe, see C. Harvey Gardiner, 'Prescott's Most Indispensable Aide: Pascual de Gayangos', *HAHR*, 39 (1959), 81-115, at pp. 111-12.

<sup>15</sup> MS P-R, b. 192, f. 260.

<sup>16</sup> MS P-R, c.509, ff. 130v-131.

<sup>17</sup> Munby, *PS*, IV, 42. On Gayangos as a significant contributor to Prescott's research, see Gardiner, 'Prescott's Most Indispensable Aide', who notes Gayangos' visits to Middle Hill but does not offer a particularly detailed survey of this matter.

<sup>18</sup> *History of the Reign of Philip the Second, King of Spain*, 2 vols (London: Richard Bentley, 1855), I, v-vi.

<sup>19</sup> File copy: MS P-R, e.388, ff. 26v-27v; the original is in the W.H. Prescott Papers in the library of the Massachusetts Historical Society. Prescott's other major work on Latin America, his *History of the Conquest of Peru*, 2 vols (London: Richard Bentley, 1847), does not make use of any material from the *Bibliotheca Phillippica*, so there is no reference to Phillipps in the prefatory material.

<sup>20</sup> Original: MS P-R, c.532, ff. 218-19.

Ramírez, discussed below, provided the latter with an account of the Phillipps manuscript. Curiously, it is precisely the incomplete and erroneous edition by Phillipps of his MS of Juan de Tovar that is the item from the Bibliotheca Phillippica which probably caused the greatest impact in the world of Mesoamerican studies over the longest period, and that resulted in the Baronet's name being permanently associated with a Spanish text. Most of this occurred after the death of Sir Thomas, and is dealt with later in this study, but two individuals stand out in the early phase of this particular piece of intellectual history, both of them North Americans. One was the traveller, scholar, and diplomat Ephraim George Squier (1821-1888), the author of various works on Central and South America and the editor of Spanish-American historical texts; the other, the book-dealer Henry Stevens, whose role in this, although chronologically earlier, was subsidiary to that inadvertently played by Squier.

On 30 August 1860 Phillipps, who had evidently recently received from Squier a prospectus inviting subscriptions for the latter's publication of the work of an author whom Sir Thomas identified, characteristically, as 'Don Palacio', wrote to the American (at 205 East Tenth St, New York) from Middle Hill with considerable enthusiasm for the advertised project, and heavy emphasis (through underlining) on the desirability of publishing original texts rather than translations. The letter is also important for the information it contains on the progress of the Middle Hill Press edition of Juan de Tovar.<sup>21</sup>

My dear Sir

I am delighted to see your Prospectus and shall most certainly do my best to support you. You may put down my name for 20 copies of your Don Palacio. I think I told you I had commenced the Printing of an unpublished author Juan de Tovar. Only 2 sheets are printed yet, for want of encouragement. I have just commissioned a Gentleman at Madrid to obtain for me a catalogue of all the MSS in Seville or Simancas relating to the Conquest of Spanish America. As you appear to have already examined them or obtained a knowledge of them, perhaps you will kindly give me a hint as to my probability of obtaining a Catalogue? A number of MSS. were copied for Lord Kingsborough most of which I possess, & I have bought several others since which I think are<sup>22</sup> unpublished[.] I should be extremely glad if you would devote all your energies all your time & all your funds to printing nothing but the Originals at present, because all our desire should be to secure the original information from further destruction. The Paper time & money spent in bringing out a Translation would secure another Original.

If you can persuade any other Gentleman or Bookseller to undertake the editing & publishing a Translation pari passu with your Original, that wd be good & I will

---

<sup>21</sup> MS P-R e.396, ff.75v-76v. 'Don Palacio' is Squier's edition of Diego García de Palacio, *Carta dirigida al Rey de España, por el Licenciado Dr. Diego Garcia de Palacio, Oydor de la Real Audiencia de Guatemala, Año 1576. Being a Description of the Ancient Provinces of Guazacapan, Izalco, Cuscatlan, and Chiquimula, in the Audiencia of Guatemala: with an Account of the Languages, Customs, and Religion of their Aboriginal Inhabitants, and a Description of the Ruins of Copan*, in his *Collection of Rare and Original Documents and Relations Concerning the Discovery and Conquest of America, chiefly from the Spanish Archives. Published in the original, with translations, illustrative notes, maps, and biographical sketches*, by E.G. Squier, no. 1 (New York: Charles B. Norton, 1860). This was the only volume of the intended *Collection* ever published (Terry A. Barnhart, *Ephraim George Squier and the Development of American Anthropology* (Lincoln, Nebraska: University of Nebraska Press, 2005), pp. 231-34). I have found no earlier correspondence between Phillipps and Squier in the Bodleian Library papers despite the two phrases in this letter ('I think I told you', and 'your sentiments on translations') which could imply previous contact between Sir Thomas and the American scholar.

<sup>22</sup> 'are': corrected from 'were'.



subscribe to it but pray devote all your own energies to bringing out the Originals alone. Your sentiments on Translations are the perfect Echo of my own, which I have long entertained, & have already printed them in some of my works. Would it be too much trouble to you to give me a list of the remaining 100 MSS which you propose to print, as alluded to in your Prospectus.

I am my dear Sir very truly yours

Thos Phillipps

Squier replied appreciatively from New York on 23 September, thanking Phillipps warmly for his encouragement and his suggestions, but stating that he considered translations essential in the American context, in order to secure the necessary financial support through subscription.<sup>23</sup> His future plans included printing a list of MSS in his possession, obtained from Central America and Mexico, but also from Spain through the agency of Buckingham Smith, formerly of the US legation in Madrid.<sup>24</sup> Phillipps would, Squier thought, have difficulty in obtaining the desired catalogue of manuscript material in Spanish archives, if his own experience was any indication, though he had succeeded in amassing a vast number of copies. The gift of the sheet of Tovar from Phillipps prompted Squier to enquire about the extent of the work, and to venture to suggest that Sir Thomas might perhaps edit the text in the American's own series. In thanking the Baronet for his subscription for twenty copies of the work of Palacio, Squier took the precaution of obliquely checking that this number was correct, and diplomatically announced that he was sending at once two large-paper copies (out of only ten such printed) to Sir Thomas via a friend who was, opportunely, about to depart.

These must be the two copies mentioned in a letter sent by Squier to Phillipps in November 1860 (which does not survive in the Phillipps-Robinson papers) announcing the despatch of two copies of his edition of Palacio via Trübner; but this letter appears not to have been delivered, for on 8 April 1861 the American wrote again, referring to his unanswered letter, and mentioning his recent monograph on writings in the languages of Central America, of which he was sending a copy, together with a project to print a Quiché grammar, publication of which was expected for September 1861.<sup>25</sup> Phillipps answered from Middle Hill on 26 April, again revealing much concerning his interest in Spanish American history and his well-documented obsession with Lord Kingsborough's library, but also confirming his order for twenty copies of the first publication in Squier's series.<sup>26</sup>

My dear Sir

I have constantly had it in my mind to write to you to say that I would subscribe for 20 Copies of your first number to set it going but I can not promise to continue so many copies afterwards. But I will subscribe to two copies of every inedited work on Spanish America in the original Spanish which you choose to print. I have received your intended publications /v/ but I do not recollect having the Palacio which you speak of, though having had my hands so full of business these last nine months, it is very possible I may have forgotten the receipt of it.

---

<sup>23</sup> MS P-R, b.161, fol. 245-47 (a six-page letter).

<sup>24</sup> On Buckingham Smith and Squier's collection of transcriptions of texts from Spanish archives, see Barnhart, *Ephraim George Squier*, pp. 231-32.

<sup>25</sup> MS P-R b.164, fol. 226. The book in question is Squier's *Monograph of Authors who have Written on the Languages of Central America, and Collected Vocabularies or Composed Works in the Native Dialects of that Country* (New York: C.B. Richardson & Co., 1861). The Quiché grammar was never printed: Barnhart, *Ephraim George Squier*, p. 239.

<sup>26</sup> MS P-R d.179, fol. 39r.-40r.

Since I spoke to you I have bought a very rare MS life of Don Pedro the Cruel of Spain which shews him to have been very far from cruel. On inspecting Mr Henry Stevens MSS of Lord Kingsborough I regret to find so many of them are fragments only, so that they cannot be said to be worth the money I gave for them. Nothing /40r/ but my zeal to preserve every scrap of Spanish American History would make me content with the state in which they are. I have however had them all put into common board binding so that they will stand on the shelves.

I hope you will be glad to hear that I have been elected a Trustee of the British Museum, & shall be happy<sup>27</sup> to welcome you at Middle Hill in that capacity  
In the mean time believe me my dear Sir  
Very faithfully yours  
Thos Phillipps

This letter from Phillipps is also summarised in a letter-book (in MS P-R e.397, f. 127v), which adds a postscript not found in the retained loose MS copy of the letter: '26 Ap 61 wrote to E Squier Esqr of 205 East Tenth Street New York (see copy) & added this. "I will send some of my works to you thro Mr Trubner, & I will ask him about the Palacio. I expect to go in to Wales next week."'

The promised copy of Squier's monograph on Central American languages was acknowledged by Phillipps on 11 January 1862, in a letter from Middle Hill addressed to Squier at Boston in which the multiple enthusiasms of Sir Thomas are barely containable.<sup>28</sup>

My dr Sir

I have just received yr most valuable Present (of yr Monograph of American Languages & the Ethnological Bulletin) which comes very apropos as a New Year's Gift & as such I accept it with great pleasure. Your Monograph of Languages shews me in the Appendix your labours for America, & I have desired Mr Trubner to place them in my Library along with the Abbè Brasseur's Works. Is there any possibility of procuring Cogolludo? – I have been very greatly retarded in my Literary progress by a long fit of Gout & am not able to walk well yet[.] We are all rejoiced at your determination for Peace, that our Literary inter-communications may not cease, & I do trust that the Southern may never be able to over-run the North. During my illness yr reference to yr friend for transmitting my Books to you, & Part 2 of my Catalogue of my MSS (ending with p. 300) has been mislaid, but I trust to find it soon. I had no idea that you had been so extensively engaged in research on the American languages. For I thought the great bent of yr mind lay towards the Spanish-American Historians. I have several Volumes of the various Vocabularios & Dictionaries. One is a fine MS of the *Lingua Jagala*. About the year 1830 there was an old Gentleman at Calais who had a large collection of MSS American Vocabularies what became of them I never heard, & unfortunately I forget his name. But the literary Gentlemen of Calais (in France) wd no doubt know his name. – In Part 2 of my Catalogue of my MSS you will find a long list of Berlandier's MSS relating to Mexico & other parts of Spanish America. Also rare additional MSS. of Lord Kingsborough in the same. I bought all the relics of Lord K's Library wch Stevens had. I see you have forgotten to mention in your Monograph my commencement of Juan de Tovar's History of Mexico, of wch I think I gave you the 1<sup>st</sup> sheet. You will see that Pinelo doubts if it ever existed, but mine is a genuine Original MS with Drawings of Dances Portraits &c &c. I doubt if you ever saw it. When shall you come to England again.

Believe me my dear Sir  
very gratefully yours  
Thos Phillipps

---

<sup>27</sup> 'happy': replacing 'glad', which is struck out.

<sup>28</sup> MS P-R e.400, fol. 12v-14r.

PS I have 60 paintings of American Scenes among the Indians, & all his Original Portraits of American Indians. These Portraits are in 2 vols as you will see by my Catalogue.<sup>29</sup>

On the same day, a letter-book entry records Phillipps sending an order to Trübner clearly inspired by what he had received from Squier.<sup>30</sup>

11 Jan Sent to Trubner 60 Pater Noster Row for 1 Squier's Arte de Lengua Quiche 2 American Ethnological Transact. 3 vols. 3 Abbe Brasseur's 4 vols Vth Cartas 5 Squier's Nicaragua 6 do. Central America 7 De Souza's Bibliotheca Hispano Americana Septentrional 8 Vasquez Cronica de Guatemala 9 Cogollado's Historia de Yucatan.

A further phase in the correspondence is attested in 1870, when Phillipps wrote on Thursday 26 May to Squier at the Langham Hotel, Portland Place, London, to thank him for two publications. The letter is evidence of how Phillipps eagerly attempted to help those who shared his enthusiasms.<sup>31</sup>

My dr Sir

I have to thank you wch I do most cordially for yr 2 most interesting publications Honduras & Primeval Monuments of Peru, I have written to Trubner to<sup>32</sup> send me down Harpers Magazine containing yr Papers[.] I shall send for yr acceptance to Langham's Hotel the Tizon d'España & what is printed of Juan de Tovar & some other Spanish Articles but they are not many, & if I can get them ready before you go I will send Parts 2 & 3 of My Catalogue of my MSS for Harvard College. – On what day do you leave England? Shall you have time to run down to Sussex to see the Mexican MS of Lord Zouch? His Town House is in Arlington St Piccadilly & you can call there first as the MS may be there. You can call on my recommendation first writing a note to him to ask his permission to see it. Wishing you a prosperous Voyage I remain my dear Sir very truly yours  
Thos. Phillipps

The next surviving letter from Squier was written from the Hotel Britannique, Spa, Belgium, on 8 September, lamenting the current state of war in Europe and announcing his intention to spend a week in London before returning to America early in October, and his wish to visit Phillipps, whose opinion he sought on his project to print an edition of a collection of manuscripts on Peruvian history that he had acquired three years earlier, in Spain; he had also accumulated considerable material during an official mission to Peru. He also wished to show Sir Thomas drawings and photographs of material that he had at the Langham Hotel, including five Mexican pictorial manuscripts, which he intended to publish later that year or early the next.<sup>33</sup> Of two further letters from Squier from the same year, dated 17 and Sunday 18 September, the first announced his arrival at the Langham Hotel and his desire to visit Phillipps at Cheltenham the following week, and the second (which refers to a letter from Phillipps dated 12 September that I have been unable to trace)

---

<sup>29</sup> The unexplained 'his' presumably refers to the painter George Catlin, on Phillipps' contact with whom see Joan Carpenter Troccoli, 'George Catlin and Sir Thomas Phillipps: A Nineteenth-century Friendship', *Rare Books and Manuscripts Librarianship*, X (1995), 9-20.

<sup>30</sup> MS P-R e.400, f.12r.

<sup>31</sup> MS P-R d.229, f. 34r. (retained loose copy). Squier's 'The Primeval Monuments of Peru Compared with Those in Other Parts of the World', 19 pp., was published in *The American Naturalist*, IV (1870).

<sup>32</sup> 'to': corrected from 'for'.

<sup>33</sup> MS P-R, b.180, ff.187r-196.

attempted to rearrange the visit because of his intention to go to Liverpool for the meeting of the British Association.<sup>34</sup> By 24 September he had evidently seen Phillipps, for his letter of that date not only added information that he had forgotten to tell Sir Thomas concerning his publication plans, and promised to send copies of various publications, but also sent his respects to Lady Phillipps.<sup>35</sup> In the final letter from the Langham Hotel, dated 28 September, Squier, who intended to depart from Southampton on 7 October, informed Phillipps of his intention to follow his advice regarding Lord Zouche, and asked whether Sir Thomas would provide a copy of Balboa (whose text had been translated and published by Ternaux Compans) were the Peruvian Government to be persuaded to print it in the original Spanish.<sup>36</sup>

On 1 October, Phillipps wrote again to Squier at the Langham Hotel, enclosing a copy of the Middle Hill Press edition of the Armada papers, and promising a copy of his edition of the *Tizon de España* as soon as he could find one. His candid admission that the manuscript of Juan de Tovar had been temporarily mislaid is eloquent confirmation of a problem with the Bibliotheca Phillippica which more than one frustrated would-be user experienced:<sup>37</sup>

My dr Sir

I send you complete set of the Intrigues of the Popes & Philip at the time of the Spanish Armada, except the Title Page wch has not yet been printed. I regret I have not found a correct copy of the Tizon d'Espagne but hope to do so soon, as I expect my Librarian back who knows where they all are. And I think these are all the sheets of Tovar that are yet printed. I wish I cd have shewed you the Original MS of Tovar but I have mislaid it. I used to keep it with the Kingsborough which you saw[.] I shall desire Trubner to send me your work on Peru as soon as it comes out. You are the 2nd Person to whom I have given the Spanish Armada Tract. I will have the title printed and send it if possible before you leave London. Wishing you a prosperous voyage & that we may correspond sometimes I remain my dr Sir very faithfully yours

Thos Phillipps

Back in America, Squier wrote to Sir Thomas on 6 April 1871 to thank him for the copy of the *Tizon de España*, which he had received, and to lament that Phillipps had been published only part of the text of Tovar.<sup>38</sup> The complete text, which Squier expressed an interest in translating, would, he thought, be of prime importance. He also requested that Phillipps provide a tracing of drawings from each of his two Mexican manuscripts, to accompany the series of facsimiles that Squier had shown him, and which he intended to publish later that year. All of the Middle Hill Press publications sent to Squier, namely Tovar, the *Tizon de España* (apparently both in its uncorrected state and in its final form), and the *De conquestu Angliae*, appear in the catalogue of the sale of Squier's books in 1876; and it was that catalogue that led to Adolfo Bandelier's work on Tovar and thence to an appreciation by Mesoamericanist scholars of the identity, and subsequently the importance, of the Jesuit's account of Mexican beliefs.<sup>39</sup>

---

<sup>34</sup> MS P-R, b.180, ff.189, 191.

<sup>35</sup> MS P-R, b.180, f. 193.

<sup>36</sup> MS P-R, b.180, f. 195r-196r.

<sup>37</sup> MS P-R d.229, fol. 36 (retained loose copy).

<sup>38</sup> MS P-R b.183, ff. 196-97.

<sup>39</sup> *Catalogue of the Library of E.G. Squier. Edited by Joseph Sabin. To be sold by auction, on Monday, April 24<sup>th</sup>, 1876, and following days, by Bangs, Merwin & Co.* (New York: [Bangs, Merwin & Co], 1876). (The cover is rather more explicit as to the content of the library: *Catalogue of the Books, Manuscripts, Maps, Drawings and engravings, Principally relating to Central America, and Peru,*

The correspondence between Phillipps and Squier reveals the extent to which Sir Thomas maintained a serious interest in the history of Spanish America that went beyond his regard for Lord Kingsborough's work and his enduring horror at the fate of his friend and his library. In his concern that Squier should see Lord Zouche's Mexican manuscript, for instance, Phillipps not only displays a consistent feature of his character to which even his detractors might pay tribute, namely his desire to assist scholarly endeavours, but also reveals that he was fully aware of relevant Spanish-American material in the libraries of other contemporary collectors. The manuscript in question had already been the subject of good-humoured correspondence between Phillipps and his friend of many years' standing, Robert Curzon, in 1869, and became so again in 1870 when Sir Thomas wrote on 14 June to congratulate Curzon on succeeding to the title of Lord Zouche, an event which the Baronet hoped might lead to the publication of the manuscript; in another letter dated 24 June 1870, Phillipps teasingly asked whether Zouche, who was trying to persuade him to sell some manuscripts, would part with his own Mexican manuscript.<sup>40</sup> In this context, Phillipps' repeated purchases of Spanish-American historical material acquire perhaps more coherence than might otherwise appear to be the case within the vast bulk of the *Bibliotheca Phillippica*.<sup>41</sup> Noteworthy, too, is the extraordinary length of his printed catalogue entry for MS 14262, in which the description of the manuscript does not conform to Phillipps' usual pattern, but rapidly launches into a detailed account of the contents and a personal interpretation by Sir Thomas of the system of Mexican pictorial nomenclature:

A Packet of Tracings from Mexican MSS (now bound into a large folio Vol. beginning with folio 482, ending folio 583. dated 1578.

This curious MS. appears to contain a list of Mexicans, whose heads are drawn in the Mexican manner, with their symbolical names proceeding from their mouths, and the Spanish interpretation of the names attached to them. The work seems to be a Register of Mexicans living in the parishes of St. Juan de Vexozinco; St. Diego Chaltepeltapan; Sta. Maria Assumptio Almoyavacan; Fecacallanco; Nepopovalco; S. Fran. Tlanquetenco; St. Estevan Tepetzicun, St. Antonio Tlatenco, & St. Luis Coyotzinco. At the commencement of each Parish is a Drawing of the Church, except the first, St. Juan Vexozinco, in the Title Page, which has only a Tree on a Hill: on the left side of the Tree, is an Eagle, on the right an Ocelot. Above the Tree, & across part of it, is a statement, in Spanish writing of the time, describing the subject of the Chapter. The Original was imperfect in some parts, & probably all prior to folio 182 were lost. The following are specimens of the names.

A Head, with a deer's head issuing from the mouth, is Juan Mazatl, therefore Mazatl signifies a Deer.

---

*American Antiquities, &c., belonging to Mr. E.G. Squier.* Item 229 was the *De conquestu Angliae* texts; item 1410 was the *Tizón* (of the erroneous earlier state of which, misprinted as *Fizon*, Squier also seems to have had a copy, here item 364); and item 1417 was Squier's copy of Tovar. The catalogue description of the latter was to be influential in perpetuating inaccurate transcriptions of the details of Phillipps' publication over a number of years.

<sup>40</sup> For the entire exchange of letters, see Munby, *PS*, IV, 149-155. The MS (the Zouche Codex) is now British Library, Additional MS. 39671. On Curzon, see Ian Fraser, *The Heir of Parham. Robert Curzon, 14th Baron Zouche* (Alburgh, Harleston, Norfolk: The Paradigm Press, 1986), a useful biography which is, however, less informative than Munby on Curzon's relationship with Phillipps.

<sup>41</sup> Munby, *PS*, IV, 67 (papers of Jean Louis Berlandier, member of the Mexican Frontier Commission from 1826), 73 (papers of Sir Robert Ker Porter, 1777-1842, British Consul in Venezuela 1826-1841), 138 (significant purchases from Puttick in 1869 and 1870, including papers of Abbé Augustin Fischer, 'secretary to the Emperor Maximilian', and the library of 'Dr Berendt of Vera Cruz').

A Head, with a Column on 3 Steps without a capital, is Juan Tamillo, therefore Tamillo signifies a Column on 3 Steps.

A Head, with a Diamond shaped object on the tip of the middle finger of an Open Hand held upright, is Francis Matlacmani.

A Head, with an Eagle's foot cut off, is Thomas Quauhtetepo, therefore Quauhtetepo is an Eagle's foot cut off.

A Head, with a Lizard on the top of it (not coming from the mouth) is Pedro Quatopi.

A Head, with a bird's skeleton head, & beak is Loys Vitztiutl.

A Head, with a Rattle snake from the mouth, is Toribio Couatl; therefore Couatl is a Rattlesnake. (From this I infer that the real name of this Snake, is not Rattle, but Couatl Snake, and that those who first heard the natives pronounce the name, heard it indistinctly, and thought it had been Rattle.)

A Head, with a Bee, is Diego Xicon.

Some of the names are formed from compound Images, as, a Bird's head above an open Jaw, shewing the teeth, is Quauhtlatova, & a Head with the same Bird's head (apparently a Parrot's) with a tongue, or word coming out of its mouth, is Quauhtlistas, therefore Quauhtl is probably a Parrot. A Head, with the head of an Ocelot, is Pedro Ocelotl, therefore Ocelotl is the Ocelot. A Head, with a Rattle Snake twisted in only one knot is Mixcouatl; therefore Mix probably signifies a Knot, or twist. At fol. 429 is a List of Women, whose names are chiefly symbolised by plants, & flowers. In some places there are sentences in the Mexican language written in Spanish letters.

The methodology may be simplistic, but the intellectual interest in the material is evident.

It is also informative to note the vigour with which Sir Thomas expressed his textual priorities when Squier sought his opinion on the relative merits of translation versus publication of transcriptions of original sources (and even when he did not). One significant outcome of this relationship was that the copy of the Middle Hill edition of Juan de Tovar that Phillipps sent to Squier eventually arrived in the New York Public Library; it was this copy, whilst still in private hands in the Lenox library, that was used by Adolfo Bandelier in 1879 in making a first attempt to establish the relationship between the work of Tovar and that of Acosta.<sup>42</sup>

The other significant relationship in this saga was that between Phillipps and Henry Stevens.<sup>43</sup> Most of the surviving correspondence between the two men in the Phillipps-Robinson papers relates to Stevens' role in providing Phillipps with books (among them much of Hispanic interest), but from 1851 there are some letters regarding the Tovar edition. Phillipps wrote to Stevens on 26 November that year announcing the project and enclosing a sample leaf:<sup>44</sup>

To Henry Stevens Esqr of the Smithsonian Institute Boston U.S.  
at Morlay's Hotel, Trafalgar Square.

MH 26N51

Dr Sir

I enclose you a leaf of a Work wch I have in the Press, & wch I purpose to print by subscription of 1£ per copy. I intend to print 50 or 100 copies according to the desire of

---

<sup>42</sup> R.H. Barlow, 'La Crónica X: versiones coloniales de la historia de los mexica tenochca', *Revista Mexicana de Estudios Antropológicos*, VII (1945), 65-87, at pp. 66-67.

<sup>43</sup> On Stevens, see Wyman W. Parker, *Henry Stevens of Vermont. American Rare Book Dealer in London, 1845-1886* (Amsterdam: N. Israel, 1963); Stevens, who had studied under Jared Sparks before moving to London, was in contact, whether social or commercial, with many of the figures who appear in these pages.

<sup>44</sup> MS P-R, b.152, ff. 239v-240r.

my Subscribers, but if you think there are 100 Gentlemen in America who wd like to take it, I wd not object to print another 100.

I am vexed I can not fix a date for your own & Mr Somerby's Visit to me yet /r/ but the truth is I am involved in a Chancery Law Suit & I expect every day to be called up to Town. When I am freed from this I hope to have the pleasure of seeing you both.

I am Dr Sir Very truly yours

TP

Stevens replied from Morley's Hotel on 28 November, thanking Phillipps for the leaf from Tovar, and ordering twenty-five copies of the text for despatch to the United States, where he greatly doubted that there would be as many as one hundred potential subscribers.<sup>45</sup> The subscription, the largest single order for one of Phillipps' editions of a Spanish text, is duly recorded in those copies of the printed edition which contain the relevant leaf.<sup>46</sup> It may be regarded as an important factor, like the copy sent to Squier, in bringing Tovar's work to the attention of the American and Spanish-American scholarly communities while the manuscript itself remained, relatively inaccessible, in England until after the Second World War, since it was probably one of the copies taken by Stevens that eventually found its way into the hands of Joaquín García Icazbalceta, as noted below, enabling him to correct his account of the text. The few other subscribers, apart from Phillipps himself (who was listed for one copy in the handwritten draft, but two in the final printed list), were listed were an interesting mix of distinguished British Hispanophiles: the Quaker editor of dissident Golden Age Spanish religious reformers, Benjamin Wiffen (two copies 'for Spain'), the former British Chargé d'affaires in Buenos Aires and writer on the River Plate area, Sir Woodbine Parish (one copy), and Arthur (later Sir Arthur) Helps, the author of a series of historical works on Spanish-American themes and biographies of historical figures such as Columbus, Cortés, and Pizarro (one copy).<sup>47</sup>

---

<sup>45</sup> MS P-Rc. 515, fol. 193r.

<sup>46</sup> Reproduced in facsimile in Jacques Lafaye, *Manuscrit Tovar. Origines et croyances des indiens du Mexique. Relacion del origen de los Yndios / que havitan en esta / Nueva España / segun sus / Historias. Tratado de los ritos y ceremonias / y Dioses que en su Gentilidad / usavan los Indios de esta Nueva España. Edition établie d'après le manuscrit de la John Carter Brown Library*, Collection Unesco d'Oeuvres Representatives, Serie Ibero-Americaine (Graz: Akademische Druck- u. Verlagsanstalt, 1972), p. 54.

<sup>47</sup> Wiffen (1794-1867), Parish (1796-1882), and Helps (1813-1875) are all examples of the range of private literary men, scholars, travellers, and diplomats who constituted the principal British contributors to Hispanic literary and historical studies during most of the nineteenth century. None of them receives any mention from Munby. Among works on Hispanic subjects by Helps are *The Conquerors of the New World and their Bondsmen. Being a narrative of the principal events which led to Negro Slavery in the West Indies and America*, 2 vols (London: William Pickering, 1848-1852); *The Spanish Conquest in America, and its relation to the history of slavery and to the government of Colonies*, 4 vols (London: vols 1-3, John W. Parker and Son; vol. 4, Parker, Son and Bown, 1855-1861); *The Life of Las Casas, "The Apostle of the Indies"* (London: Bell & Daldy, '1868' [1867]); *The Life of Columbus, the Discoverer of America* [with H.P. Thomas] (London: Bell & Daldy, 1869); *The Life of Pizarro, with some account of his associates in the Conquest of Peru* (London: Bell & Daldy, 1869); and *The Life of Hernando Cortes*, 2 vols (London: Bell & Daldy, 1871). There is no reference to Phillipps in the letters of Helps published by his son (an avowedly small selection from a formerly extensive archive of correspondence, subsequently both diminished by accidents associated with house moving, and selectively destroyed); Helps was in contact with Gayangos in 1847, Ticknor in 1861, and Henry Stevens in 1871: see E. A. Helps, *Correspondence of Sir Arthur Helps, K.C.B., D.C.L.* (London: John Lane, 1917), pp. vi-vii (preservation of and disruption to correspondence), 47 (Gayangos), 242-243 (Ticknor), 313-314 (Stevens). An item in the sale catalogue of the library of Ephraim G. Squier in 1876 also attests to an earlier correspondence between Helps and the American Mesoamericanist: item 471 is an 'author's presentation' copy of Helps' *The Spanish Conquest in America* with 'autograph

Stevens' own attempts to make use of items in the Bibliotheca Phillipica do not appear to have met with much success. He wrote to Phillipps on 28 May 1852 asking whether he had any manuscripts of any of the letters of Hernán Cortés, in connection with a bibliographical and biographical account he was producing.<sup>48</sup> In a subsequent letter dated 2 September, Stevens made a similar request concerning Las Casas.<sup>49</sup>

Similarly fruitless, apparently, was the enquiry by Sir Clements Robert Markham, editor and translator of Pedro Cieza de León's *Crónica del Perú* for the Hakluyt Society, who wrote to Phillipps on 2 August 1864 in search of a copy transcribed from a Madrid manuscript of that text, which Henry Stevens had told him Obadiah Rich had mentioned as having sold to Sir Thomas; the original was apparently sold to Mr Lenox of New York.<sup>50</sup> In reply, from Middle Hill on 6 August, Phillipps doubted that he owned the transcript in question, and referred Markham to his printed catalogue, available in the British Museum; should Markham locate the manuscript in the catalogue, he would be welcome to come to Cheltenham (whither all correspondence for Phillipps should be addressed) to see it. Markham's reference to Rich, and to the latter's sale of transcripts as well as original manuscripts, can hardly have endeared his letter to Sir Thomas in view of the latter's own experiences on this score, which lay at the heart of the lawsuit brought against him by Rich; and this may explain the relative brusqueness of the reply Sir Clements received. No further correspondence between the two men exists in the Phillipps-Robinson papers, and there is no evidence that Markham ever used any manuscript from the Bibliotheca Phillipica.<sup>51</sup> Most telling, perhaps, is his apparent ignorance of the existence of the Middle Hill edition of Juan de Tovar.<sup>52</sup>

---

letter of Mr. Helps to E.G. Squier inserted'. Sir Woodbine Parish was the author of *Buenos Ayres, and the Provinces of the Rio de la Plata: their present state, trade and debt, with some account from original documents of the progress of geographical discovery in those parts of South America during the last sixty years* (London: John Murray, 1852); see also Nina L. Kay Shuttleworth, *A Life of Sir Woodbine Parish, K.C.H., F.R.S. (1796-1882), sometime secretary to Lord Castlereagh, Chargé d'affaires and Minister Plenipotentiary to the Provinces of the River Plate, being the first agent sent by Great Britain to recognize the independence of the Argentine Republic and to establish diplomatic relations between the two countries; Minister Plenipotentiary in Naples, etc.* (London: Smith, Elder & Co., 1910). For Benjamin Barron Wiffen, see Edward Boehmer, *Bibliotheca Wiffeniana. Spanish Reformers of Two Centuries from 1520. Their Lives and Writings, according to the late Benjamin B. Wiffen's Plan and with the Use of his Materials*, 2 vols (Strassburg: Karl Trübner; London: Trübner & Co., 1874-1883), which includes a 'Memoir of Benjamin Barron Wiffen' by Mary Isaline W. Wiffen (I, 1-20).

<sup>48</sup> MS P-R, c.520, fol. 199rv.

<sup>49</sup> MS P-R, c.520, fols. 201r-202r.

<sup>50</sup> MS P-R, d.188, fols 88r-89v (Markham's letter and a note of the reply).

<sup>51</sup> The evidence for this is the apparent absence of any reference to a Phillipps manuscript in any of Markham's various translations for the Hakluyt Society, for example his *The Second Part of the Chronicle of Peru by Pedro Cieza de Leon*, translated and edited, with notes and introduction by Clements R. Markham, Hakluyt Society, Series I, vol. 68 (London: Hakluyt Society, 1883), p. xix. Whilst it is unsatisfactory in principle to rely upon such negative evidence, the silence is eloquent, particularly in cases in which relevant material was indeed to be found in the Bibliotheca Phillipica, as in the case of Tovar.

<sup>52</sup> *The Natural & Moral History of the Indies, by Father Joseph de Acosta, reprinted from the English Translated Edition of Edward Grimston, 1604*, and edited with notes and an introduction by Clements R. Markham, 2 vols, Hakluyt Society, Series I, vols. 60-61 (London: Hakluyt Society, 1880), would be an obvious place for Markham to have cited the Phillipps MS and edition were he aware of them, since Acosta himself (as Markham notes: I, ix) cites 'Juan de Tobar' as 'his chief informant'. The Middle Hill Press edition of Tovar has not been efficiently described hitherto despite its importance in the



Another Americanist publication by Phillipps was his edition of *Americi Vesputii Navigationis tertiae duae ennarationes diversae, 1501* (1862), 5 + [1] pp.: Holzenberg, no. 339 [British Library copy, Tab.436.b.1.(7)]. Both these relatively slim items are probably better known to modern private press bibliographers than to readers contemporary with Sir Thomas; the printed prospectus for the edition of Tovar envisaged a print-run of only fifty copies for subscribers (Holzenberg, no. 349). It seems to have failed, however, to achieve even that number of subscriptions, despite the twenty-five copies taken by Henry Stevens.<sup>53</sup>

Ironically, this incomplete and textually defective edition of Juan de Tovar's *Historia de los Yndios Mexicanos*, the production of which appears to have been halted by a lack of subscribers, played a crucial role in the development of knowledge, among transatlantic Mesoamericanists, of the work of Juan de Tovar and its relation to other early sources for indigenous beliefs. Discounting Jared Sparks' allusion to the manuscript owned by Phillipps, which did not quote the text, the earliest specific reference to and quotation from the text of Tovar was made in 1848 by Lord Kingsborough, who must have seen the Middle Hill manuscript.<sup>54</sup> The text remained a mystery to scholars of Mexico, however, because he neither cited its location nor described the manuscript. In the same year, Phillipps was clearly already considering the idea of printing the text, as is evident from a letter written to Benjamin Wiffen from Middle Hill on 11 March 1848 which also attests to the use by Sir Thomas of works of Hispanic bibliography in discovering more about his manuscripts.<sup>55</sup>

I forgot to mention one most interesting work inedited, in my Library, wch I wd print if encouraged by a remunerating subscription. It is the Work of Juan de Tovar on the Ceremonies & Customs of the Mexicans. There are 50 Drawings, but I propose to print the Text first. Pinelo in his Bibliotheca de las Indias &c says it is reported that such a Work existed, but there are great doubts about it.

Subscriptions were not invited, however, until 1851, when Phillipps wrote four letters on 26 November, to Benjamin Wiffen, Sir Woodbine Parish, Sir Charles Young (with reference to Arthur Helps), and Henry Stevens, announcing the project and soliciting subscriptions at £1 per copy.<sup>56</sup> These were not copies of a standard circular, but were modified appropriately for each individual. The letter to Stevens has been quoted above; it is direct and to the point, and does not make any attempt to emphasize the particular interest of the manuscript. To the others, however, Phillipps offered a little more detail on this question. To the Quaker scholar Benjamin Barron

---

history of Mesoamerican studies; a bibliographical description may be found in the Appendix to the present paper.

<sup>53</sup> See Lafaye, *Manuscrit Tovar*, pp. 11, 54.

<sup>54</sup> Kingsborough, *Antiquities of Mexico: Comprising Fac-similes of Ancient Mexican Paintings and Hieroglyphics, Preserved in the Royal Libraries of Paris, Berlin, and Dresden; in the Imperial Library of Vienna; in the Vatican Library; in the Borgian Museum at Rome; in the Library of the Institute at Bologna; and in the Bodleian Library at Oxford. Together with the Monuments of New Spain, by M. Dupaix: with their Respective Scales of Measurement and Accompanying Descriptions. The Whole Illustrated by Many Valuable Inedited Manuscripts, by Lord Kingsborough. The Drawings, on Stone, by A. Aglio*, 9 vols (London: Henry G. Bohn, 1838-1848), VIII, Supplementary Notes, p. 259, note LIV (to p. 409).

<sup>55</sup> MS P-R, e.376, fols 49v-50r.

<sup>56</sup> MS P-R, b.152, fols. 239r (Young), 239v (Stevens), 240rv (Wiffen), 240v-241r (Parish).

Wiffen, who had been corresponding for some time with Phillipps on the subject of Golden Age Spanish religious Reformers, Phillipps wrote:

I am printing a MS History of Mexico by Juan de Tovar which was supposed to be lost. It will be printed by subscription at 1£ per copy & only about 50 or 100 Copies or at most 200 will be printed according to the subscription. The MS is believed to be the only one in existence. If you or yr Spanish Friends wd like to have Copies will you oblige me by sending their names to me & their addresses.

Parish received similar information, but with an added emphasis in the appeal to the desirability of ensuring the preservation of a text vulnerable as long as it remained in a single manuscript copy:

I am about to print my unique MS of Juan de Tovar's History of Mexico in Spanish, about 50 or 100 copies or if Subscribers desire, 200 Copies at 1£ each. It wd be a great loss such a MS shd be in danger of being lost by a single accident. If any of yr Spanish or Spanish American friends wd like to support it perhaps you wd favour me with their names & addresses.

In addressing Sir Charles Young, however, Phillipps also evidently took advantage of a recent correspondence concerning Arthur Helps:

Yr friend's search is a propos for a work wch I have in Press & of wch I purpose to print 50 or 100 Copies by subscription at 1£ per copy. If yr friend Mr Helps wd like to subscribe to it I will put his name down. The MS is supposed to be unique, as no tidings have ever been heard of the 2<sup>nd</sup> copy.<sup>57</sup>

I enclose the 2 first Pages for Mr Helps that he may see what the nature of the Work is.

I am glad to hear you are improving & I trust you will continue "ire pede prospero".

From the letters to Stevens and Young it is clear that printing of the edition had already begun by 26 November 1851. Stevens' reply of 28 November, summarised above, stressed the improbability of one hundred subscribers being found in the United States. Wiffen answered on 29 November, thanking Phillipps for the information and promising to notify his Spanish correspondent and to report the response.<sup>58</sup> This he did on 6 January 1852, placing a subscription for two copies for his Spanish friends, to be delivered post-free to the London bookseller Thomas Bosworth.<sup>59</sup> Parish, writing from 5 Gloucester Place on 29 November, promised a subscription for one copy and agreed to inform his South American friends, requesting that Phillipps supply him with copies of any printed advertisement that might be available for him to circulate.<sup>60</sup>

To this request Sir Thomas did not respond until 18 February 1852, when he despatched two copies of the Prospectus to Sir Woodbine at the Athenaeum, offering to send more copies should they be required, and expressing the hope that he would shortly be able to speak to Parish about the project.<sup>61</sup> In the meantime, he had taken

---

<sup>57</sup> From this comment it is evident that Phillipps was fully aware of the circumstances of the text's composition and of the loss of the first version.

<sup>58</sup> MS P-R, c.516, f.150r.

<sup>59</sup> MS P-R, c.521, fols 130r-131v, at 130rv.

<sup>60</sup> MS P-R, b. 152, f. 56r.

<sup>61</sup> MS P-R, b.153, f. 205r.

the liberty of enlisting the involuntary assistance of Sir Woodbine for the correction of the proofs of the text, in a letter sent from Middle Hill to Parish at the Athenaeum on 21 January:<sup>62</sup>

Dear Sir Woodbine

Not being perfectly versed in the Spanish language, I have enclosed a Proof of my Tovar with the hope that you will read over & mark such words as you think must be wrong & at the same<sup>63</sup> add your opinion of what they ought to be. The Original MS is written very small & many words are not so clear as I cd wish. I have marked some of them in italics.

I shall be glad to receive it back as soon as possible, because the Press is standing still.

Believe me, my dear Sir,

Very truly yours

Thos Phillipps

An evidently surprised Parish replied on 26 January regretting that he had received the material only that afternoon because he had not been at the Athenaeum recently, but promising to read the proof the next day. He warned Phillipps, however, not to rely upon his corrections and advised that the text should be worked on by a careful Spaniard.<sup>64</sup> One wonders whether Phillipps' desire to speak to Parish about the project in late February was to pursue matters raised during the proof correction, but no further correspondence arising from this episode appears to survive in the Phillipps-Robinson papers.

References to the work of Tovar in the supplementary notes by José F. Ramírez to Beristain's *Biblioteca* were made between 1867, when Gayangos wrote to him with information on the Phillipps manuscript based on his own notes from his visit to Middle Hill in 1842, and 1881, when the Mexican scholar Joaquín García Icazbalceta quoted Ramírez's comments.<sup>65</sup> The 1867 letter from Gayangos seems to be an answer to a query by Ramírez; Gayangos' response is dated 4 July, after his return to Madrid:<sup>66</sup>

---

<sup>62</sup> MS P-R, b.153, f. 184r.

<sup>63</sup> sc. 'time'?

<sup>64</sup> MS P-R, b.153, f. 113r.

<sup>65</sup> Ramírez, *Biblioteca hispano americana septentrional. Adiciones y corecciones que a su fallecimiento dejó manuscritas el Sr. Lic. D. José Fernando Ramírez, y son las que cita con el nombre de "Suplemento" o "Adicion" en las apostillas que pasó a su ejemplar de la Biblioteca Hispano-Americana del Dr. D. J. Mariano de Beristain y Souza*, ed. by Victoriano Agüeros and N. León (Mexico City: Imprenta de El Tiempo, 1898), pp. 583-586, s.n. 'Tovar (P. Juan de)'. Ramírez gives a brief description of the manuscript, based on the letter from Gayangos dated 4 July 1867, which he quotes. This supplementary material is also found in an earlier edition: *Biblioteca hispano americana septentrional*, 3rd ed. (Mexico City: Ediciones Fuente Cultural, 1883), V, 53. See also García Icazbalceta, *Don Fray Juan de Zumárraga primer Obispo y Arzobispo de México. Estudio biográfico y bibliográfico por Joaquín García Icazbalceta, con un apéndice de documentos inéditos o raros* (Mexico City: Antigua Librería de Andrade y Morales, 1881), pp. 263-267, núm. 63.

<sup>66</sup> *Biblioteca hispano americana septentrional. Adiciones y correcciones que a su fallecimiento dejó manuscritas el Sr. Lic. D. José Fernando Ramírez, y son las que cita con el nombre de "Suplemento" o "Adicion" en las apostillas que pasó a su ejemplar de la Biblioteca Hispano-Americana del Dr. D. J. Mariano de Beristain y Souza*, ed. by Victoriano Agüeros and N. León (Mexico City: Imprenta de El Tiempo, 1898), pp. 583-586, s.n. 'Tovar (P. Juan de)'. This is also partially quoted, from Ramírez, in Lafaye, *Manuscrit Tovar*, p. 17, n. 29. Second-hand information of this nature about Phillipps is an obvious potential source of progressively greater confusion and distortion; Prescott, for example wrote to Francis Lieber a somewhat simplified account of Phillipps on 31 December 1840, on the basis of information about him derived from a letter that he had received from Jared Sparks: see C. Harvey

Las noticias que preceden me las comunicó el Sr. D. Pascual Gayangos en carta de Madrid, fecha 4 de Julio de 1867, estando yo en Sevilla; y respecto al paradero del Ms. me dice en ella lo siguiente: “Está en Inglaterra y no en Londres en el Museo Británico, sino en Middle-Hill, Essex, posesión del Caronte<sup>67</sup> Sir Thomas Philipps, aquel gran colector, de quien dije á V., en una de nuestras sabrosas pláticas, que había reunido una biblioteca manuscrita de más de 20,000 volúmenes. Visité yo en 1840 su magnífica casa y biblioteca, y tomé muchos apuntes que conservo como oro en paño.”

Gayangos was obviously still sharing his notes and recollections of the Bibliotheca Phillipica twenty-five years after his visit there in 1842, even if by then he could not accurately remember either the county in which Middle Hill was located, or the year in which he visited it.

The importance of the Phillipps edition of part of the Middle Hill manuscript is that it eventually enabled Mexicanist scholars to reach, for the first time, textually-based conclusions to questions that had arisen concerning the work of Tovar and its relationship to other texts such as those of Acosta and Durán. The progress of interest in and knowledge of the matter is documented in the correspondence between Adolfo Bandelier and Joaquin García Icazbalceta. In 1879, the former became aware of the Phillipps edition of Tovar from its appearance in the catalogue of the sale of Squier’s library three years earlier, and on 13 May he sent García Icazbalceta a description based on that catalogue entry, asking him also to inform Chavero and Orozco of the existence of the edition, which he had not yet, of course, seen.<sup>68</sup> Later the same year, Bandelier succeeded in locating the copy formerly owned by Squier, which was by then in the private library of James Lenox, and obtained access to it, making full use of the opportunity by taking extensive notes and transcribing textual material which served as the basis for a lecture he delivered to the New York Historical Society on 4 November 1879, and for an article in *The Nation*.<sup>69</sup> Bandelier also sent to García Icazbalceta in December a transcript of the letters between Acosta and Tovar which

---

Gardiner, ed., *The Papers of William Hickling Prescott* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1964), pp. 170-71, letter 131.

<sup>67</sup> *Sic*; read ‘Baronete’.

<sup>68</sup> Leslie A. White and Ignacio Bernal, eds., *Correspondencia de Adolfo F. Bandelier*, Serie Historia, IV (Mexico City: Instituto Nacional de Antropología e Historia, 1960). The ‘Correspondencia Bandelier García Icazbalceta’, pp. 85-322, is edited by Bernal; the letter of 13.5.79 is ‘Veintidosava carta’, p. 201. The two other individuals to whom Bandelier wished García Icazbalceta to communicate the information were Alfredo Chavero, historian, senator, and author of numerous works including *Calendario azteca. Ensayo arqueológico*, 2<sup>nd</sup> edition (Mexico City: Imprenta de Jens y Zapiain, 1876), and whose contribution ‘Tovar’, *Anales del Museo Nacional de México*, Segunda época, I (1903), 242-246, prints a note sent to him by Aquiles Gerste; and Manuel Orozco y Berra, author of *Apuntes para la historia de la geografía en México* (Mexico City: Imprenta de Francisco Díaz de León, 1881); on the latter, see Rubén García, *Biografía, bibliografía e iconografía de Don Manuel Orozco y Berra* (Mexico City: Sociedad Mexicana de Geografía y Estadística, 1934), reprinted from vol. 44 of the Society’s *Boletín*. For the Squier sale catalogue, see note 39 above.

<sup>69</sup> A.F. Bandelier, *Report of an Archaeological Tour in Mexico, in 1881*, 2<sup>nd</sup> edition, Papers of the Archaeological Institute of America, American Series, II (Boston: published for the Institute by Cupples, Upham, and Company; London; N. Trübner & Co., 1885), pp. 63-64. His letter to George H. Moore, librarian to Mr Lenox, was published as ‘An Important Discovery for Mexican Antiquities’, in *The Nation*, no. 751 (20 November 1879), 347-348; in it the importance of the work of Tovar is established, opening with a rather misleading reference to ‘the documents found in your library under the title of “History of the Mexican Indians” (“Historia de los Indios Mexicanos”)’ when what was used was in fact the copy of the printed Middle Hill edition acquired by the Lenox library from the Squier sale. The similarity between the Phillipps manuscript and the Códice Ramírez is also recognised in this letter.

begin the text in the Middle Hill edition, together with his own interpretation of the significance of the text, and its relation to the *Código Ramírez*, and information on Phillipps and the *Bibliotheca Phillipica*, about which he had clearly made enquiries in the meanwhile, possibly from Squier himself, with whom he was in contact.<sup>70</sup> He also noted (p. 218) the existence of a significant textual discontinuity between pp. 4 and 5 of the edition printed by Phillipps. In his 1881 publication, García Icazbalceta reproduced the transcript of the letters made by Bandelier, and quoted extensively from the materials sent to him by the latter:<sup>71</sup>

De antiguo se sabia que el P. Tovar había escrito una Historia antigua de México, pues lo dijo el P. Acosta (Lib. VI, caps. I, 7.1); pero se ignoraba su paradero. Clavijero no la vio, ni tampoco Beristain, aunque da la seña de ser “un grueso volumen.” El Sr. Ramírez, en sus Suplementos, inéditos, a Beristain, habla ya de la historia, y dice que segun noticia comunicada por D. Pascual de Gayangos, existia en la extraordinaria colección de Sir Thomas Phillipps (Middle Hill, Essex, Inglaterra), quien había formado una biblioteca de más de veinte mil manuscritos, trasladada a Cheltenham, despues de la muerte del poseedor (6 de Febrero de 1872). Pero todos ignorabamos que el manuscrito del Sr. Phillipps no era más que un fragmento de la obra, y que estaba impreso.<sup>72</sup> Diome esta noticia el diligente anticuario D. Ad. F. Bandelier, de Highland (Illinois, Estados-Unidos), quien halló el título del impreso en el catálogo de los libros de Mr. E.G. Squier, vendidos en Abril de 1876. El Sr. Bandelier ignoró por algun tiempo el paradero del Tovar; mas después supo que se hallaba en la famosa librería de Mr J. Lenox, regalada a la ciudad de Nueva York, y allí le vio. El mismo Sr. Bandelier me ha comunicado las cartas arriba impresas y las noticias relativas al libro. [...] De la comparación hecha por el Sr. Bandelier entre el fragmento impreso de la obra de Tovar y el *Código Ramírez*, publicado recientemente, resulta tal semejanza, que no puede caber duda de que ambas obras son una misma.

Thus it was that the first publication in Mexico of the letters of Acosta and Tovar was based on a transcript of the text from the already error-riddled edition by Phillipps that was sent to García Icazbalceta by Bandelier, whose command of Spanish was itself imperfect. García Icazbalceta's first description of the edition is also erroneous because it mixes information from the titlepage with the entry from the Squier library sale catalogue, all of which had been provided to him by the generosity of Bandelier; it was later corrected. The account of the Phillipps collection itself is similarly inaccurate; it is based on a combination of sources including Ramírez's quotation from the letter sent to him by Gayangos, and additional material supplied by Bandelier but only partially understood, it would appear, by García Icazbalceta. The Mexican scholar was himself subsequently presented with a copy of the partial Middle Hill edition, in July 1884, by one Gustavo Brühl of Cincinnati, Ohio; this may

---

<sup>70</sup> *Correspondencia de Adolfo F. Bandelier*, ‘Correspondencia Bandelier García Icazbalceta’, cartas veintiseis B y A, pp. 213-221 (letters of 8 and 12 December 1879, the latter being a covering letter for the one containing the transcript and details). An editorial note (p. 210, n. 1) states that Letter 26A was in French, like most of Bandelier's correspondence, but that 26B was written in what Bandelier optimistically imagined was Spanish and has therefore required editorial ‘translation’ in order for it to make sense (‘ha sido necesario “traducirla”, tratando de cambiar lo menos posible.’). This is unfortunate given the fundamental importance of the letter as a statement of the development of Bandelier's, and hence Icazbalceta's, understanding of the importance of Tovar's work; but the gist of the content is clear enough.

<sup>71</sup> Joaquín García Icazbalceta, *Don Fray Juan de Zumárraga primero Obispo y Arzobispo de México. Estudio biográfico y bibliográfico* (Mexico City: Antigua Librería de Andrade y Morales, 1881). pp. 266-267.

<sup>72</sup> In this, García Icazbalceta is mistaken: it is only the printed edition that is incomplete.

perhaps have been one of the twenty-five copies ordered by Henry Stevens when Phillipps solicited subscriptions for the edition.<sup>73</sup> On the basis of his examination of this copy, García Icazbalceta subsequently published a corrected description of the Middle Hill edition in the supplementary material to his study of Zumárraga.<sup>74</sup>

Since the Phillipps Tovar manuscript never left England between its acquisition by Sir Thomas and its eventual sale by the Robinsons, all references to the manuscript by scholars from either of the Americas between the work of Lord Kingsborough and the acquisition of the manuscript by the John Carter Brown Library in 1947 must be based on the Middle Hill Press edition, or on the brief section quoted from the Phillipps manuscript by Kingsborough.<sup>75</sup> We have here, then, in the development of knowledge of the work of Juan de Tovar a perfect illustration of the importance of the role of private collectors and bibliophiles in preserving, and disseminating knowledge of, manuscript material; of the role of serendipity alongside systematic research in the progress of scholarship; of the overriding importance of precise bibliographical description and scrupulously careful editorial practice; and of the variety of evidence, from auction catalogues to subscription lists and third-party correspondence, that may be found to contain information essential both for a study of the history of scholarship and for precise knowledge of the editorial history of a given text.

---

<sup>73</sup> See Lafaye, *Manuscrit Tovar*, p. 11, n.1, for details of this circumstance. In asserting that the MS had remained unknown to specialists in Mexican history between 1587 and 1848, and in attributing to Lord Kingsborough in the latter year the first modern reference to it, Lafaye (p. 17) appears unaware of the note on the manuscript by Jared Sparks in his letter of 3 December 1840 to W.H. Prescott, although this is mentioned by George Kubler and Charles Gibson, 'The Tovar Calendar. An illustrated Mexican Manuscript ca. 1585 reproduced with a commentary and handlist of sources on the Mexican 365-day year', *Memoirs of the Connecticut Academy of Arts & Sciences*, XI (January 1951), 3-82, at p. 12 (to say nothing of Sparks' enthusiastic diary entry concerning it). Lafaye's account of the history of the recent history of the Phillipps Tovar manuscript is inferior to that of his source, the study by Kubler and Gibson, which itself contains some confusion over the nature of the dispersal of the Bibliotheca Phillippica (p. 12: 'the volume was sold at the Phillipps sale of November 11, 1946, to Messrs W.H. Robinson, Ltd., from whom it was acquired by the John Carter Brown Library in September, 1947'). In fact the Robinson brothers had already owned the Bibliotheca Phillippica from 19 February 1946 (Munby, *PS*, V, 104), the date of the final legal approval of its sale to them, and it was therefore they who had consigned the MS for sale on 11 November (as Lot 66 of [in my classification] Bibliotheca Phillippica, Original Series, XXIV). Since they themselves appear as the purchasers in the auction result, the MS was presumably bought in when bids failed to reach a reserve price.

<sup>74</sup> Icazbalceta, 'Correcciones a las cartas de los PP. Acosta y Tovar', *Adiciones y enmiendas a la obra intitulada Don Fray Juan de Zumárraga, primer Obispo y Arzobispo de México*, in *Obras de D. J. García Icazbalceta*, X: *Opúsculos varios*, VI; originally published as *Biblioteca de Autores Mexicanos*, XXIII (Mexico City, 1899), rpt. as Burt Franklin Research & Source Works Series, 336 (American Classics in History & Social Science Series, 70) (New York: Burt Franklin, 1968), pp. 299-321, at pp. 319-321. He describes Phillipps' text as 'muy incorrecto', and notes (p. 320) the textual lacuna previously reported by Bandelier, citing the pages of the edition of the text of the Códice Ramírez from which it may be made good.

<sup>75</sup> The remark of R. Barlow concerning the work of Bandelier ('La Crónica X', p. 67) must be interpreted in the light of this fact; the only text of this MS available to Bandelier in New York in 1879 was the printed Middle Hill Press edition, as Bandelier himself makes plain, and it is equally clear that Barlow himself had not seen the MS at the time of writing his article in 1945 but was working from a microfilm of the printed edition (see 'La Crónica X', pp. 65, 66, 77, 81). Nor does E. Beauvois, in 1885, appear to have known of the Middle Hill edition; he refers only to Lord Kingsborough's quotation from the text: 'L'Histoire de l'ancien Mexique. Les Antiquités mexicaines du P. D. Durán comparées aux abrégés des PP. J. Tobar et J. D'Acosta', *Revue des Questions Historiques*, XXXVIII (1885), 109-165, at pp. 153-54.

## APPENDIX

### The Middle Hill Press edition of Juan de Tovar

[a]I<sup>r</sup>:

HISTORIA | DE LOS YNDIOS | MEXICANOS | POR | JUAN DE TOVAR. | [*single short rule*] | CURA, ET IMPENSIS | DNI. THOMÆ PHILLIPPS, BART. | [*single long rule*] | TYPIS MEDIO-MONTANIS | JACOBUS ROGERS | IMPRESSIT. | 1860. |

(Middle Hill, Broadway, Worcestershire: James Rogers, Middle Hill Press, “1860” [i.e. 1851-70?]). [2] + 12 pp.: [abcd]<sub>2</sub> ; [a]2 blank and in some copies trimmed to a stub for binding.

Holzenberg, no. 348 (copies in the Grolier Club, New York), dated ‘1860 [i.e., 1867?’] on the basis of dated corrected proof sheets in the Grolier Club, bearing dates between 1852 and 1867.

British Library copy: Tab.436.b.1.(6).

The present description is based on the copy in my collection (MHP.1).

The subscription prospectus for this work is catalogued by Holzenberg as no. 349.

The bibliographical complexity of some Middle Hill publications is well illustrated by this unfinished edition. Its fitful progress through the press may be traced, as shown in this study, through the correspondence of Sir Thomas Phillipps; this process has left its mark in the physical details of the publication, and no doubt accounts for a significant lacuna in the text (between pp. 4-5), first noted by Bandelier and reiterated by García Icazbalceta. It is clear that several phases in the production of this item must be distinguished; the units represented by pp. 1-4 and pp. 5-12, which I designate here [i] and [ii] respectively, exhibit quite distinct characteristics in a number of typographical and other respects. Firstly, the paper of [i] is unwatermarked and has no chain or wire lines, whilst that of the two sheets in [ii] is slightly heavier and has clear wire and chain lines, though no watermark in my copy on which this description is based. Secondly, the running head of [i] reads ‘JUAN DE TOVAR, HISTORIA DE LOS YNDIOS DE MEXICO.’, while that of [ii] is ‘TOVARI HISTORIA DE MEXICO.’ (though pp. 9 and 11 misprint this as ‘MXEICO.’). Thirdly, the width of the print block in [i] is ±168mm, while in [ii] it is only ±152mm. Fourthly, the height of the print block excluding running heads and catchwords in [i] is ±268mm (based on p. 4, the only full page of text in this unit) while in [ii] it is ±276mm. Fifthly, the m-height of ten lines of uninterrupted prose text in [i] is ±38mm; in [ii] it is ±32mm. Sixthly, there are no catchwords in [i], but they appear in [ii], sometimes fulfilling their correct role of anticipating the opening word(s) of the following page (as on pp. 5-8, 11) and sometimes not (as on p. 10, where the catchword is not repeated on p. 11); there is no catchword on p. 9, the first page of the second sheet of [ii]. Finally, in [i] the paragraphs (with one exception) are separated by a blank line and the first line of a succeeding paragraph is sometimes indented by the space of only two letters, but in [ii] paragraphs follow on the next line with no blank space, and are consistently indented by between four and six letters. All these differences of mise-en-page and typographical execution are conclusive evidence of a significant division of production between [i] and [ii], the junction between which is precisely the location of the textual lacuna noted by Bandelier (which, moreover, coincides with the end of a paragraph in [i]).

There is also a discrepancy of editorial practice between [i] and [ii], in that the folio divisions of the manuscript exemplar being followed are not indicated in [i], but are included in [ii] within parentheses, although with some inconsistencies and inaccuracies. The sequence begins with ‘fol. 10’, ‘fol. 11’, ‘fol. 11’, ‘fol. 12’, ‘fol. 12b’, thereafter following the pattern established for fol. 12/12b, which was presumably what was intended for fol. 11 (though somehow the ‘b’ was omitted from the second occurrence of that number, which was intended to designate the *verso*); ‘fol. 15’ is also missing at the appropriate point.

The simplest explanation for this array of differences would be that after the first sheet was completed a significant period elapsed before the other two were printed, rather than that two separate printers were being used simultaneously.

The titlepage represents a separate operation; it is (in my copy at least) on the same unwatermarked paper as the first sheet of text, [i], and may, therefore, have been an early element in the production of the work, possibly printed after [i] and before [ii].

The chronology of the production of this edition may be worked out from the correspondence of Sir Thomas Phillipps. There is evidence in a letter to Benjamin Wiffen, discussed above, that the project was planned as early as 1848. As has been noted already, a printed leaf was sent to Henry Stevens on 26 November 1851 (thus technically constituting the first publication of the item, unless an earlier circulation is subsequently discovered in the correspondence of Sir Thomas); but on 30 August 1860 Phillipps wrote to Ephraim G. Squier that ‘Only 2 sheets are printed yet, for want of encouragement’. On 1 October 1870 he wrote to Squier ‘I think these are all the sheets of Tovar that are yet printed’, so that at that date the edition was obviously still intended to reach completion, as far as Phillipps was concerned, although in the event it never progressed beyond p. 12, or part of folio 26*r* of the manuscript.<sup>76</sup> That Squier had in fact received the entire text as printed (i.e., as far as p. 12) is obvious from Adolfo Bandelier’s description of the copy in question.

Text: © David Hook 2007

Letters of Sir Thomas Phillipps: © The Bodleian Library, University of Oxford, 2007

All rights reserved. The right of David Hook to be identified as the author of this study has been asserted in accordance with the provisions of the relevant current legislation.

Posted: 22.11.2007

---

<sup>76</sup> Not folio ‘27’, as stated by Bandelier in his letter to Icazbalceta (see note 68 above).