



Hornby, E. C. (2016). Musical Values and Practice in Old Hispanic Chant. *Journal of the American Musicological Society*, 69(3), 595-650. <https://doi.org/10.1525/jams.2016.69.3.595>

Peer reviewed version

Link to published version (if available):
[10.1525/jams.2016.69.3.595](https://doi.org/10.1525/jams.2016.69.3.595)

[Link to publication record in Explore Bristol Research](#)
PDF-document

This is the author accepted manuscript (AAM). The final published version (version of record) is available online via University of California Press at <http://jams.ucpress.edu/content/69/3/595>. Please refer to any applicable terms of use of the publisher.

University of Bristol - Explore Bristol Research

General rights

This document is made available in accordance with publisher policies. Please cite only the published version using the reference above. Full terms of use are available: <http://www.bristol.ac.uk/red/research-policy/pure/user-guides/ebr-terms/>

Table 1: Shared vocabulary in Augustine and Isidore’s description of jubilation

Augustine, <i>Enarr. in Psalmum 99</i>	Isidore, <i>De Differentiis</i> 1.329.
“Qui iubilat, non uerba dicit, sed sonus quidam est laetitiae sine uerbis; uox est enim [3] animi diffusi laetitia , quantum [1] potest , exprimentis affectum, non sensum comprehenditis. [2] Gaudens homo in exultatione sua, ex uerbis quibusdam quae non possunt dici et intellegi, [4] erumpit in uocem quamdam exultationis sine uerbis...”	“Ubi uero non [1] potest quisque conceptum [2] gaudium uerbis annuntiare, sed ipsam [3] animi effusi laetitiam [4] in uocem quamdam exultationis erumpit , jubilatio est.”
“One who jubilates does not speak words, but it is rather a sort of sound of joy without words, since it is the voice of a soul poured out in joy and expressing, as best it can, the feeling, though not grasping the sense. A man delighting in his joy, from some words which cannot be spoken or understood, bursts forth in a certain voice of exultation without words...” (McKinnon, <i>Music in Early Christian Literature</i> , 158.)	“When someone cannot proclaim, with words, the joy he has received, but the happiness of his effusive mind bursts forth with a sound of exultation, it is jubilation.” (Throop, <i>Synonyms and Differences</i> , 146).

Table 2: parallel text in Augustine’s *Confessions* and Isidore’s *De Ecclesiasticis Officiis*

Augustine, <i>Confessions</i> 10.33.49-50	“Nunc in sonis, quos animant eloquia tua, [1] cum suauis et artificiosa uoce cantantur , fateor, aliquantulum adquiesco, non quidem ut haeream, sed ut surgam, cum uolo. Attamen cum ipsis sentiis quibus uiuunt ut admittantur ad me, quaerunt in corde meo nonnullius dignitatis locum, et uix eis praebeo congruentem. Aliquando enim plus mihi uideor honoris eis tribuere, quam decet, dum [2] ipsis sanctis dictis religiosus et ardentius sentio moueri animos nostros in flammam pietatis, cum ita cantantur, quam si non ita cantarentur, et omnes affectus spiritus nostri pro sui diuersitate habere proprios modos in uoce atque cantu, quorum nescio qua occulta familiaritate excitentur . Sed delectatio carnis meae, cui mentem eneruandam non oportet dari, saepe me fallit,	“As things now stand, I confess that I have some sense of restful contentment in the sounds which your words animate, when they are sung by an attractive and technically-skilled voice. Not that I am riveted by them, for I can rise up and go when I wish. Nevertheless, on being combined with the thoughts that give them life, they demand in my heart some position of honour, and I have difficulty in finding what is appropriate to offer them. Sometimes I seem to myself to give them more honour than is fitting. I feel that when the sacred words are chanted in this way, our souls are moved more religiously and more ardently toward the flame of piety than if they are not sung in this way. All the diverse emotions of our spirit have their various modes in voice and chant appropriate in each case, and
---	--	--

	<p>dum rationi sensus non ita comitatur, ut patienter sit posterior, sed tantum, quia propter illam meruit admitti, etiam praecurrere ac ducere conatur. Ita in his pecco non sentiens et postea sentio.</p> <p>Aliquando autem hanc ipsam fallaciam immoderatus cauens errorum nimiam severitate, sed ualde interdum, ut melos omne cantilenarum [5] suauium, quibus Dauidicum psalterium frequentatur, ab auribus meis remoueri uelim atque ipsius ecclesiae, tutiusque mihi uidetur, quod de Alexandrino episcopo Athanasio saepe mihi dictum commemini, qui tam [3] modico flexu uocis faciebat sonare lectorem psalmi, ut pronuntianti uicinior esset quam canenti. Verum tamen cum reminiscor lacrimas meas, quas fudi ad cantus ecclesiae in primordiis recuperatae fidei meae, et nunc ipsum cum [6] moueor non cantu, sed rebus quae cantantur, cum liquida uoce et conuenientissima modulatione cantantur, magnam instituti huius utilitatem rursus agnosco.</p> <p>Ita fluctuo inter periculum uoluptatis et experimentum salubritatis magisque adducor non quidem inretractabilem sententiam proferens [4] cantandi consuetudinem approbare in ecclesia, ut per oblectamenta aurium infirmior animus in affectum pietatis adsurgat. Tamen, cum mihi accidit ut me amplius cantus, quam res quae canitur, moueat; poenaliter me peccare confiteor, et tunc mallem non audire cantantem.”</p>	<p>are stirred by a mysterious inner kinship. But my physical delight, which has to be checked from enervating the mind, often deceives me when sense does not accompany reason in such a way as to accept a subordinate place. It tries to be first and to be in the leading role, though it deserves to be allowed only as secondary to reason. So in these matters I sin unawares, and only afterwards become aware of it.</p> <p>Sometimes, however, by taking excessive safeguards against being led astray, I err on the side of too much severity. I have sometimes gone so far as to wish to banish all the melody of sweet tunes commonly used for David’s psalter from my ears and from the Church as well. But I think a safer course one which I remember being often told of bishop Athanasius of Alexandria. He used to make the reader of the psalm intone with so moderate an inflection of the voice that he was nearer to reciting than to singing. Nevertheless, when I remember the tears which I poured out at the time when I was first recovering my faith, and that now I am moved not by the chant but by the words being sung, when they are sung with a flowing voice and entirely appropriate modulation, then again I recognize the great utility of music in worship.</p> <p>Thus I fluctuate between the danger of pleasure and the experience of the beneficent effect, and I am more led to put forward the opinion (not as an irrevocable view) that the custom of singing in Church is to be approved, so that through the delights of the ear the weaker mind may rise up and be moved to the emotion of piety. Yet when it happens to me that the music moves me more than the subject of the song, I confess myself to commit a sin deserving punishment, and then I would prefer not to have heard the singer.” (Chadwick, <i>Confessions</i>, 207-8, with revisions suggested by Gillian</p>
--	---	--

		Clark)
Isidore, <i>De Ecclesiasticis Officiis</i> 1.5.2.	<p>“Primitiua autem ecclesia ita psallebat, ut [3] modico flexu uocis faceret resonare psallentem, ita ut pronuntianti uicinior esset quam canenti. Propter carnales autem in ecclesia, non propter spirituales, [4.1] consuetudo cantandi est instituta ut, quia uerbis non compunguntur, [5] suauitate modulaminis [6] moueantur. Sic namque et beatissimus Augustinus in libris Confessionum suarum [4.2] consuetudinem canendi adprobat in ecclesia, “ut per oblectamenta, inquit, aurium infirmior animus ad affectum pietatis exsurgat”. Nam in [2] ipsis sanctis dictis religiosius et ardentius mouentur animi nostri ad flammam pietatis cum cantatur quam si non cantetur. Omnes enim affectus nostri pro sonorum diuersitate uel nouitate nescio qua occulta familiaritate excitantur magis [1] cum suauis et artificiosa uoce cantatur.”</p>	<p>“The primitive church, however, sang the psalms so that the reader of the psalm intoned so moderate an inflection of the voice, that he was nearer to reciting than to singing. However, for the carnal ones, not for the spiritual ones, the custom of singing was instituted in the church, in order that those who the words do not inspire with devotion would be moved by the attractive modulations. Thus, in fact, the blessed Augustine in his book of <i>Confessions</i>, ‘approved the custom of singing in church, so that through the delights of the ear the weaker mind may rise up and be moved to the emotion of piety’. For our souls are more religiously and ardently moved toward the flame of piety through these sacred words when there is singing than if there is not. All our emotions are more excited through some mysterious kinship to the diversity or novelty of sounds, when [something] is sung by an attractive and technically skilled voice.”</p>

Table 3: parallel text in Augustine’s *Confessions* and Isidore’s *Sententiae*

Augustine, <i>Confessions</i> 10.33.50	Isidore, <i>Sententiae</i> 3.7.32
“...et nunc ipsum cum moueor non cantu, sed rebus quae cantantur, cum liquida uoce et conuenientissima modulatione cantantur, magnam instituti huius utilitatem rursus agnosco.”	“Dum Christianum non vocis modulatio, sed tantum verba divina, quae ibi dicuntur, debeant commovere, nescio quo tamen pacto modulatione canentis maior nascitur compunctio cordis. Multi enim reperiuntur qui, cantus suavitate commoti sua crimina plangunt, atque ex parte magis flectuntur ad lacrymas, ex qua psallentis insonuerit dulcedo suavissima.”
“...and that now I am moved not by the chant but by the words being sung, when they are sung with a flowing voice and entirely fitting melody, then again I recognize the great utility of music in worship.”	“Although the Christian should be moved not by vocal melody but only by the divine words as it is said here [<i>Confessions</i> 10.33.50], nevertheless I do not know by what means a singer’s melody somehow produces a greater compunction of the heart. For there are many who, once moved by the sweetness of song, bewail their sins and are all the more reduced to tears as soon as the most pleasant sweetness of the psalm singer sounds forth.

Table 4: Old Hispanic chants beginning ‘Ecce’ in the first week of Advent in L8 (34v-37r) and A30 (27r-33v)¹

Chant	Genre	Liturgical occasion	Biblical source
<i>Filii Syon</i> (II:) Ecce orietur	Sono	Advent Sunday 1, first vespers (L8) or second vespers (A30)	Unknown (L8: marginal attribution to Isaiah)

¹ Chants marked * are in OV, the superscript shows their manuscript ordering. *¹ is assigned to Advent Sunday 1 (4v); *²-*⁴ are assigned to VIII Kalendas Decemb. (10v); and *⁵-*⁸ are assigned to VII Kalendas Decemb. (10v-11r). In this, Table 5, and Appendix 2, spelling and orthography follow Brou and Vives (eds), *Antifonario visigotico*; note the typical (and inconsistent) Iberian transposition of “b” and “v”.

Ecce ego mittam	Antiphon* ¹	Advent Sunday 1, <i>ad matutinum</i>	Malachi 3:1
Ecce ego mittam	Antiphon	Advent Sunday 1, <i>ad matutinum</i>	Isaiah 66:19; loose paraphrase
Ecce super montes	Alleluiaticum	Advent Sunday 1, <i>ad matutinum</i>	Nahum 1:15; four added alleluias
Ecce Deus excelsus	Antiphon* ²	Monday, <i>ad matutinum</i>	Job 36:22-23; 37: 3
Ecce procedet verbum	Antiphon* ³	Monday, <i>ad matutinum</i>	Unknown (L8: marginal attribution to Joel)
Ecce Dominus retributionis	Alleluiaticum* ⁴	Monday, <i>ad matutinum</i>	Isaiah 35:4-5
Ecce Dominus in fortitudine	Responsory	Monday, <i>ad matutinum</i>	Isaiah 40:10; 42:11, 15-16; loose paraphrase
Ecce veniet vir	Antiphon	Tuesday, vespers	Zachariah 6:12
Ecce veniet Dominus	Antiphon* ⁵	Tuesday, <i>ad matutinum</i>	Habakkuk 2:3
Ecce venit tempus	Antiphon* ⁶	Tuesday, <i>ad matutinum</i>	Daniel 6:26-7; loosely related
Ecce Dominus auditum	Alleluiaticum* ⁷	Tuesday, <i>ad matutinum</i>	Isaiah 62:11
Ecce quemadmodum	responsory	Tuesday, <i>ad matutinum</i>	Isaiah 31:4-5
Ecce revelabitur	Antiphon	Wednesday, vespers	Isaiah 40:5
Ecce Dominus tuba	Antiphon	Wednesday, <i>ad matutinum</i>	Zachariah 9:14-15
Ecce Dominus ascendet	Antiphon	Wednesday, <i>ad matutinum</i>	Isaiah 19:1, 4 (In L8, a marginal gloss by this chant quotes Jerome on Isaiah, <i>PL</i> 24, col. 251)
Ecce festinus	Alleluiaticum* ⁸	Wednesday, <i>ad matutinum</i>	Isaiah 5:26-27

Ecce Dominus egredietur	Responsory	Wednesday, <i>ad matutinum</i>	Zachariah 14:3-4, 7-8
-------------------------	------------	--------------------------------	-----------------------

Table 5: S. Cucuphas office chant texts in L8 (223v), BL45 (52v) and T6 (175v-177v).

Chant genre	Text	manuscripts	Text origin	Other liturgical uses.
<i>Vespers</i>				
Vesp.	Speravit anima mea	BL45, T6	Ps 129:5-6	<i>De uno iusto</i> (S3); various saints
Sono	<u>Iustus</u> ut p(alma)	L8	Ps 91:13, 2-3, 5	S. John, S. Genesisius
Sono	Benedic anima mea	BL45, T6	Ps 102:2-4.	<i>De uno iusto</i> (BL51, S3, S6); various saints
Ant.	<u>Iustus</u> velut palma <i>VR</i> Os <u>iusti</u>	L8, BL45, T6	Ps 91:14. <i>VR</i> : Ps 36:30 (Ps 91:16 in BL45)	<i>De uno iusto</i> (BL51, S3); various saints
All.	<u>Iustus</u> ut palma	L8; <i>ad matutinum</i> chant in BL45, T6	Ps 91:13.	<i>De uno iusto</i> (BL51, S3); various saints
Hymn	Barcinon laete Cucufate <i>VR</i> <u>Iustus</u> velut (BL45, T6) or <u>Iustum</u> deduxit (hymnals)	BL45, T6; BN01, BL51 (hymnals)	Paraphrases saint's vita. <i>VR</i> Ps 91:13 or Wisdom 10:10	n/a
<i>Ad matutinum – missa 1</i>				
Ant.	In capite <u>iusti</u>	L8, BL45, T6	Origin unknown <i>VR</i> : Ps 14:2 (L8); Ps 40:3 (L8)	<i>De uno iusto</i> (BL51, S3); various saints

			addition, BL45); Ps 91:13 (T6)	
Ant.	<u>Iustus</u> si morte VR Os <u>iusti</u> (L8, BL45, T6)	L8, BL45, T6	Wisdom 4:7 VR: Ps 36:30 (L8); Ps 14:2 (L8 addition); Ps 91:14 (BL45); Ps 40:3 (T6)	<i>De uno iusto</i> (BL51, S3); S. Pelagius (BL45)
All.	In memoria eterna erit <u>iustus</u>	L8; Vespers chant in BL45, T6	Ps 111:7 VR: Ps 111:7 (T6); Ps 111:2 (L8); Beatus vir (BL45)	<i>De uno iusto</i> (BL51, S3)
Resp.	De ore <u>iusti</u> VR Os <u>iusti</u>	L8, BL45, T6	Cant. 4:11 VR: Ps 36:30	<i>De uno iusto</i> (BL51, S3, S7, T3); various saints
Sono	Exaudisti me	BL45, T6; incipit only	Origin unknown II: Ps 138:5	<i>De uno iusto</i> (BL51, S3 and S6); various saints
Ad matutinum – missa 2				
Ant.	Hic vir <u>iustus</u> et fidelis in vita sua multa fecit bona et post mortem laudabilia opera eius. VR Qui ingreditur.	L8	Origin unknown VR: Ps 14:2	S. Mammes (BL45)
Ant.	Iste homo multa bona fecit in vita sua et fidelis inventus est in gloria eterna. VR Beatus quem elegit.	L8	Loose paraphrase of Eccli 44:20-21 VR Ps 64:5	n/a
All.	Hic est vir qui stetit contra reges orrendos et insignis et portentis alleluia alleluia. VR Beatus vir qui.	L8	Wisdom 10:16 VR Beatus vir	n/a
Resp.	Hic vir etate gloria mirabilis abitum agni decoris amator fratrum multum orat pro populo. VR Dispersit dedit pauperibus iustitia eius manet in seculum seculi. REP Ama(tor).	L8	II Mach 15:13-14 VR: Ps 119:9	n/a